HUMAN AND INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT (HICD) ASSESSMENT: KOSOVO

FINAL REPORT

August 2012

This report was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development by the Aguirre Division of JBS International, Inc. It was prepared under Task Order AID-167-M-12-00001 under GEM II BPA AID-EDH-E-00-08-00003.
Human and Institutional Capacity Development Assessment: Kosovo

Final Report

Malcolm J. Odell, MS, PhD, Team Leader, Agriculture Specialist
M. Mari Novak, MA, CPT, HICD and Rule of Law Specialist
Candy Mirrer, MS, MBA, HICD and ICT Specialist
Mariana Milosheva-Krushe, MA, Good Governance/Public Administration Specialist
Afrim Hoti, MA, Legal and Public Administration Specialist
Kushtrim Tolaj, LL.M, Rule of Law Specialist
Kushtrim Bajrami, MPA, MBA, Education and ICT Specialist
Lumta Dida, MS, Agriculture Specialist
Albana Hoxha, Political Science, Logistics Specialist
Arton Krasniqi, Political Science, ICT Specialist

This report was made possible with support from the American people, through the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID). The authors’ views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.
Table of Contents

Acronyms............................................................................................................................................................................. ii
Executive Summary.......................................................................................................................................................... iii
Introduction and Overview............................................................................................................................................. 1
HICD Framework.............................................................................................................................................................. 2
Gender and Leadership: Key Findings........................................................................................................................... 4
Partnerships and Sustainability........................................................................................................................................ 7
Education Sector Overview............................................................................................................................................... 9
Information and Communications Technology ........................................................................................................ 12
Public Administration: Rebuilding Public Trust in the System ...................................................................................... 18
Rule of Law........................................................................................................................................................................ 24
Agriculture......................................................................................................................................................................... 30
Conclusion—Building Partnerships that Last.................................................................................................................. 36

List of Tables

Table 1. Gap Analysis of ICT ........................................................................................................................................ 17
Table 2. Gap Analysis of Public Administration........................................................................................................ 23
Table 3. Gap Analysis of Rule of Law ......................................................................................................................... 29
Table 4. Gap Analysis of Agriculture........................................................................................................................... 35

List of Figures

Figure 1. The Classic Six Boxes...................................................................................................................................... 2
Figure 2. Roadmap of Alignment, Quality, and Innovation .......................................................................................... 3
Figure 3. Flow of the Legal System in Kosovo............................................................................................................. 26
## Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AUK</td>
<td>American University in Kosovo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.A.</td>
<td>Bachelor of Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIRN</td>
<td>Balkan Investigative Reporting Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.Sc.</td>
<td>Bachelor of Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLE</td>
<td>Continuing legal education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COHU</td>
<td>Organization for Democracy, Anticorruption and Dignity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAUP</td>
<td>Faculty of Agriculture, University of Prishtina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FECE</td>
<td>Faculty of Engineering and Computer Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMNS</td>
<td>Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZ</td>
<td>German Agency for International Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoK</td>
<td>Government of Kosovo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HICD</td>
<td>Human and Institutional Capacity Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAB</td>
<td>Industrial Advisory Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAC</td>
<td>Industry Advisory Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Information and communications technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IVE</td>
<td>Institute for Viticulture and Enology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KCLB</td>
<td>Kosovo Centre for Livestock Breeding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KFI</td>
<td>Kosovo Forestry Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KFVA</td>
<td>Kosovo Food and Veterinary Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KIA</td>
<td>Kosovo Institute of Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KIPA</td>
<td>Kosovo Institute for Public Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KJI</td>
<td>Kosovo Judicial Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.A.</td>
<td>Master of Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAFRD</td>
<td>Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry, and Rural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.B.A.</td>
<td>Master of Business Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEST</td>
<td>Ministry of Education, Science, and Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MF</td>
<td>Ministry of Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFA</td>
<td>Ministry of Foreign Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIS</td>
<td>Management Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPA</td>
<td>Ministry of Public Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.Sc.</td>
<td>Master of Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA</td>
<td>Public administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAR</td>
<td>Public administration reform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ph.D.</td>
<td>Doctor of Philosophy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOAR</td>
<td>Successes, Opportunities, Aspirations, and Anticipated Results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STIKK</td>
<td>Kosovo ICT Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNMIK</td>
<td>United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UP</td>
<td>University of Prishtina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VET</td>
<td>Vocational education and training</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive Summary

USAID/Kosovo contracted Aguirre/JBS International, Inc. to conduct multiple sector-wide HICD assessments to address and inform the design of an Education Legacy Program. This legacy program will provide higher education opportunities for Kosovar students as well as establish a mechanism that will sustain those opportunities. For this program, required elements and considerations include the development of a cadre of leaders and added workforce skills that are relevant to Kosovo’s development goals.

The HICD assessment included key sectors in Kosovo that are crucial for the future of the new nation: Agriculture, Rule of Law, Public Administration, and Information and Communications Technology (ICT) which serves as a cross-cutting function operating largely in the private sector. The assessment determined core issues in these sectors and developed educational and other interventions that will bring effective and sustainable results.

To address the systems problems identified during this assessment, this report argues for a systems solution. At its core are the key faculties of the University of Prishtina (UP) which must become the center, the node of a national and international network. Its mission should be to transform the university into a high quality, internationally recognized institution that will become the prime source of leadership and talent for bringing about the major changes required if Kosovo is to achieve its full potential in the targeted areas of Rule of Law, Public Administration, Agriculture and ICT.

The strategy outlined here is built on three key and interrelated elements: (1) increased alignment of the private, government and education sectors; (2) relevant quality skills provided with training, advanced degrees and certificates, including U.S. scholarships to increase the capacity of the targeted faculties; and (3) HICD support for the key institutions—UP and the key ministries and departments to ensure an overall systems solution that strengthens organizational performance among all participating institutions.

With these interventions in place, the country sector will be prepared to meet current and future demands for the advancement of information technology, the rule of law, public administration, agriculture and promotion of major increases in institutional performance to meet both domestic and European Union (EU) requirements.

The major innovation proposed to drive these positive changes is a UP Consortium bringing the expertise of U.S. and EU’s finest universities through partnerships aimed at creating transformational leadership and a practically trained hands-on workforce that will have the potential to drive Kosovo’s economic and social development.

Current Challenges

Kosovo is the youngest country with the youngest population in Europe and holds considerable potential for positive change. Major, even impressive, progress has been made in many arenas in a few short years. Many challenges remain, including an unemployment rate of 45 percent. Currently, approximately 60,000 university students compete for jobs in a limited job pool. An estimated 10,000 students are graduating annually at a low quality standard, and with virtually no practical skills. Universities must overcome enormous organizational, human and management gaps if they are to address the economic development needs of Kosovo.

Donors have invested as much as USD 1.5 -2 billion in a broad range of training and reform initiatives over the last 13 years, with limited alignment of efforts and outcomes. While relatively well-designed legal, administrative, and organizational structures are often on the books, there are frequent and severe system blockages. These blockages include deeply flawed management systems, rampant corruption, and incomplete reform implementation. Frustration is mounting among students, the general public, and the
donor community. A vicious cycle of exploding student enrollments, unemployment, low incomes and low public perceptions of the legitimacy of public institutions threatens the nation’s promising future.

USAID and EU donors are providing advanced training to create a cadre of leaders for up to 100 Master’s-level candidates annually. Even if dramatically increased, this talent bank will be limited mainly to English-speaking elites and has only marginal impact potential. The majority of foreign-trained, Master’s degree-holding, young professionals end up working for international organizations and the private sector, rather than the public sector, for better pay within attractive professional environments. A small fraction of professionals stay for the longer term in public service, leaving government institutions under-resourced to advance reforms and national well-being. USAID should act strategically to obtain broad system changes.

**Human and Institutional Capacity Development (HICD) Approach**

The Human and Institutional Capacity Development (HICD) framework is USAID’s most recent and comprehensive approach to achieving effectiveness and sustainability in development programs by combining the capacity of people with the improved operation of the organizations and systems within which they work. With a systems-oriented HICD approach, a *performing organization* is the critical ingredient linking inputs to outputs. The input of an educated and trained workforce, if inserted into a performing organization, can yield desired outputs, outcomes and impacts on the total system, giving new hope to Kosovo to achieve its bold objectives and full potential.

Leadership needs an environment that embraces change across the system and provides functional linkages and interactive space to communicate across sectors and with civil society. No new program can bring about the needed mind-set and culture change in five years, but a properly conceived initiative built on strategic governance partnerships can put in place systems and structures that will lead to desired change over time. This will move the system toward the “tipping point” of a critical mass of new thinking and acting, which in turn will bring about change within societal and institutional culture and practice in the long-term.

**Transformational leaders** are crucial for positive change. These leaders are viewed as people with integrity, led by a genuine will to serve the public rather than partisan interest, with a vision, integrity and creativity, and the ability to motivate others to expand this vision. They have excellent education qualifications and management skills, with high professional standards and aspiration to further learn and develop. They take measured risks and foster innovation. Finally, transformational leaders focus on both individual and group performance, relying on sustainable systems that draw upon asking and understanding “What works?”

**Gender equity** in Kosovo, while showing signs of progress, requires further investment in the different sectors. ICT remains male-dominated, but women’s enrolment in ICT subjects is increasing, and their presence in the sector is beginning to be recognized. Rule of Law employs a sizeable number of women in key executive, high-ranking legal professional positions and in legal education, but women are much less frequently found in the middle and lower levels. Resolving and balancing traditional customs and rule of law focus on the rights of women continues to present some difficulties, especially regarding inheritance, abuse, and access.

In Public Administration, roughly one-third of civil servants are women. Women occupy even smaller percentages of executive and managerial positions at the ministry and local levels. In order to achieve the Government of Kosovo (GoK) and donor objectives, gender equality requires further investment and on-going monitoring. In Agriculture, women are typically involved in horticulture, food technology, and food processing rather than in land cultivation. An increasing number of women are enrolling in and studying agriculture today, though seemingly not as a first preference.
Proposed HICD Intervention

The excellence of an educational system underpins a nation’s development. Parallel to this is the supporting/accompanying set of mechanisms to build enabling institutional systems, processes and performance in key sectors to accommodate new leaders. A high-level U.S.-GoK consortium of university partnerships is thus recommended to create a modern and effective higher education system for public and private institutions, with UP at the apex of a National University System.

Partnerships would include faculty and student exchanges with embedded Master’s scholarships. These partnerships would focus on classroom management and methodologies, research, practical internships, and advisory and mentoring. International linkages would focus on quality education and provision of internationally trained, competent staff.

Anticipated Outcomes

Across all sectors, anticipated outcomes would include a modern and effective national higher education system, imparting practical knowledge and skills and graduating graduates increasingly qualified for employment in key sectors. These interventions provide for the active participation of the private sector and civil society for the promotion of social equity and dialogue, improving the quality and relevance of applied research within higher education institutions. These changes, coupled with other reform efforts, will create an environment in which new transformational leaders can help Kosovo achieve its national development goals.

Summary of Recommendations

Sector-specific HICD interventions will facilitate system change and the capacity to absorb new skills and people within the targeted sectors. In addition to the sectors that were part of the assessment, consideration should be given to adding the Education and Engineering/Mining sectors for holistic solutions. Presented below is a brief summary of the recommended interventions, by sector. Please see the sector summaries in this report, and the full sector reports in the annex, for a complete listing and explanation of the interventions.

Information Communications and Technology

While universities have a key role to play in the ICT sector, globally the private sector is the main driver for quality and innovation. There is no reason to assume Kosovo would follow a different pattern, and therefore, a greater focus on the private sector is appropriate in this case. The ICT team recommends establishing an ICT Agency as a separate unit that reports directly to the Office of the Prime Minister, to function as an internal consulting unit that can provide ICT services to the other ministries. Recommendations for educational interventions include

- Build on vocational education and training (VET) programs and include internships and certificate-based business skills programs.
- Promote Master’s degrees abroad.
- Develop Certificate programs for project management and other technical skills through local providers such as the Kosovo ICT Association (STIKK) and the American Chamber of Commerce.
- Develop the capacity of the Faculty of Engineering and Computer Science (FECE) and the Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences (FMNS) at UP to provide career services and business development through university partnerships.
• Explore the use of video conference facilities and computer labs for online classes and leveraging professional relationships among interested faculty to develop formal partnerships with other U.S. and European universities.

Finally, investments in the ICT sector should be increased to accommodate demand and increase competitiveness. This investment can be applied to incubators, infrastructure, financing, authentication, market research, and planning for future technologies. Private sector partnerships and a cross-sector approach should also be utilized. Focus should also include leveraging success and knowledge transfer.

Public Administration

The growing gap between the Public Administration and the public it serves puts at risk the overall legitimacy of the public institutions and—thus—the sustainability of democratic processes. The team suggests an integrated two-pronged intervention that combines core educational interventions with supporting sector specific interventions.

• **Develop new and quality higher education for Public Administration in Kosovo to prepare new generations of public servants.** Create a new Public Policy and Administration Department for undergraduate studies within the Faculty of Philosophy of the University in Pristina that is guided by clear strategic objectives. Explore the alignment of this investment with the current strategy of the Ministry of Public Administration to transform the Kosovo Institute for Public Administration (KIPA) into a Higher Educational Institute for M.A. and Ph.D. studies in the area of Public Administration.

• **Invest within the Public Administration system: Place people with change potential at key places at central and local levels to facilitate processes important for the reform.** Support leadership and capacity development of new and mid-level professionals by embedding this support in well-developed interactive cross-sector partnerships and by supporting M.A. and/or M.B.A. studies in U.S. and EU universities. Provide support to further expand the strategic leadership at the executive level of the Ministry of Public Administration (MPA), especially the Department for Public Administration Reform (PAR) management and EU Integration by supporting the development of an in-country core group with HICD knowledge and skills and promoting synergy with other USAID programs. Require a 40 percent quota, at a minimum, for women professionals in all types of instruments supporting leadership growth at the different levels of administration.

Finally, provide assistance to the emerging Diplomacy academy/Foreign Service School at the Ministry for Foreign Affairs (MFA) by developing partnerships with locally-based universities such as the International Study Department of UP, American University in Kosovo (AUK) and leading U.S. foreign service schools.

Rule of Law

In Rule of Law, as with other sectors, the systemic approach provides the most powerful solution where institutional processes can be designed and implemented to make it easier to “do it right” than to do it any other way. To make this happen, **start with education.** The universities must align their polity and culture to focus on providing a quality education for student readiness which will require a reconfiguration at the governance level and in faculty requirements. Recommendations include:

• **Establish a University Partnership for Strategy and Governance to support reforms within higher education that focus on strategy, governance and alignment with the essential outcomes of education.**
• Establish a University Faculty Partnership—with one U.S. faculty or consortium of university faculties to address priorities of Faculties of Law/Kosovo (public and private).

• Develop a functioning transparent management system at the court administration level, then extending into the legal system. Using an advanced HICD approach, USAID can assist with revamping the ineffective confusion over responsibility, ownership, and implementation at the grass roots level.

• Develop a certificate program for Court Administration.

• Focus on providing accurate, user-friendly, and widely-shared public information on the court system and the wider legal system.

• Develop a continuing legal education (CLE) system to build a critical mass of merit-based performers. It will also be a legal requirement in January 2013.

• Harmonize the legal code in Kosovo, in particular its four “bodies” of law (Yugoslav, UNMIK, Kosovo, donor/EU accession), and review and coordinate legislation and secondary legislation and regulations, and finally between regulatory code and enforcement.

• Establish a “Salon” to accelerate systemic thinking, vision, implementation of reforms, and separation of powers (independence) through supportive actions and focus on outcomes.

**Agriculture**

To meet the needs of the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Rural Development (MAFRD) and the country’s agricultural sector as a whole, University of Prishtina’s **Faculty of Agriculture must become the center of a national and international network** with the mission to design a long-term strategy and explicit action plan to make FAUP into a high quality, internationally recognized university faculty. The program for agriculture should be built through an international university consortium partnership program involving leading U.S. land-grant institutions and should provide an active program of faculty, staff, and student exchange. Interventions under the Consortium Initiative should include:

• Support HICD interventions to improved management skills and the development of strong extension/advisory services.

• Focus on pure and applied research and training to feed institutes with qualified staff.

• Support FAUP to focus on quality education and provide internationally trained, competent staff, especially in the neglected fields of plant health and molecular identification/diagnosis and training.

• Restructure the Kosovo Institute of Agriculture (KIA) and Kosovo Food and Veterinary Agency (KFVA) to function as national reference laboratories.

• Actively engage with producers, growers, farmers, private agricultural enterprises, and the processing industry to provide first line education and support for field advisors and veterinarians.
Introduction and Overview

Kosovo is a new, small and growing country in the heart of the Balkans that is engaged in an important and dynamic state-building process. The country has a dominant population of young, energetic people who are the country's future, and who possess growing ICT and English language skills. The biggest problem these youth face is lack of jobs in an environment of considerable institutional obstacles, blockages and corruption. Such an environment threatens to undermine progress and potential. To bring transformational change, Kosovo needs to ensure it can institute high quality tertiary education, develop an expanded cadre of world-class professionals, and pass economic and legal reforms that will create a more conducive environment for economic growth and foreign investment.

Purpose of the Project

USAID contracted Aguirre/JBS International, Inc. to conduct a sector-wide HICD assessment to address and inform the design of an Education Legacy Program. This legacy program will provide higher educational opportunities for Kosovar students as well as establish a mechanism that will sustain those opportunities. For this program, required elements and considerations include the development of a cadre of leaders and added workforce skills that are relevant to Kosovo's development goals.

This assessment includes:

- **HICD Organizational Needs Assessment.** The assessment team used a modified HICD approach to assess performance gaps related to the status and capacity of the relevant Kosovo institutions.

- **Performance Solutions.** The assessment team has identified performance solutions for recommended partnerships. These include specific interventions such as steps for mitigating and eliminating gender and minority disparities.

- **Institutional Collaboration.** The assessment team reviewed collaborations involving institutions of higher education and other donors to determine prior experience and factors facilitating or constraining collaboration.

- **Transformational Leaders.** The assessment team interviewed successful leaders to help determine what makes a good leader, as well as trends related to prior education and current employment and critical success factors.

- **Potential Partnerships.** The team developed a list of potential partnerships between and among Kosovo and U.S. institutions of higher education, and identified the most effective types of assistance for fostering institutional capacity development.

USAID and the team identified over 100 institutions in Prishtina, Prizren, Peja, Rahovec, Lipjan and Mamusha to be included in the assessment. At these institutions, the team conducted interviews with over 120 key informants by email, phone, or in-person, including “Successes, Opportunities, Aspirations, and Anticipated Results” (SOAR) focus groups and informal group discussions with a range of civil society leaders, judges and lawyers, faculty members, and business and professional leaders and farmers. The team also conducted requested reviews of three USAID-identified higher education partnerships, plus an additional six formal and informal partnerships discovered during the research process.


2 Full details about the methodology utilized, plus sample interview and analytical formats for face-to-face, telephone, and internet surveys—are attached in the annex.
Human and Institutional Capacity Development (HICD) Assessment: Kosovo

HICD Framework

“When you pit a good employee against a bad system, the system will win most every time.” Geary Rummler, PhD

The Human and Institutional Capacity Development (HICD) framework is USAID’s most recent and comprehensive approach to achieving effectiveness and sustainability in development programs by combining the capacity of people with the improved operation of the organizations and systems within which they work. The basic tools for individual and organizational capacity development (e.g., scholarships, internships, exchanges and partnerships) are expected to be enhanced through specifications and linkages, and emphasis should be equally placed on the mechanisms to sustain these opportunities. Additionally, best practices or new approaches are embedded and linked to governance, strategic planning and operations of the institution. This is done both with enhanced capabilities of staff as well as enhanced structures and processes of the institution: both the institutional system and the critical mass of capable staff need to work well, within a context defined by successful alignment, quality and innovation.

In applying an HICD lens to the Kosovo context, the first analysis uses the organizational and individual requirements for performance, as shown in the classic Six Boxes. This concept set is a starting point to understand institutional requirements for performance (with institutional factors shown in the top row, and the corresponding individual factors shown in the lower row). For example, in the box below, Capacity refers to the knowledge and skills that the person brings through educational or professional preparation: in other words, is the person capable of doing this job? However, training and educating people is just part of the answer to improving organizational efficiency and effectiveness.

Figure 1. The Classic Six Boxes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INFORMATION</th>
<th>RESOURCES &amp; TOOLS</th>
<th>INCENTIVES/DISINCENTIVES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TRAINING &amp; PRACTICE</td>
<td>CAPACITY</td>
<td>MOTIVATION</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This assessment is based on the general principles of HICD. The agreed premise is that education is needed and is a requirement to build the critical mass necessary for the social and economic development of Kosovo. However, education is both the problem and the solution: focus on the educational context – improve the undergraduate level education, in all aspects – and the benefits of all the donor projects and all the Kosovar reforms will exponentially improve in effectiveness.

In addition to this education context, improved processes and policies underpinning institutional operations, and transparency of decisions and allocation of resources must be included. These are used to clarify and get buy-in to accomplish reforms. All of these combined create functioning systems and get buy-in to systemic, sustainable progress. Therefore, HICD interventions, while critical, are not sufficient. They should be supported by other economic and legal reforms that will create a more transparent and stable environment.

Inputs alone—however comprehensive—can rarely close performance gaps if the organizations try to improve within the current system. Long-term sustainable change will only take place through interventions that begin to address the opportunities for re-design and development of processes and systems. Large-scale change must also be managed. The objectives and requirements of change must be communicated, and the process of change itself supported. Tracking and monitoring the institutional changes is an ongoing process alongside the technical improvements.

---

3 These six elements account for only about 20 percent of the blockages or challenges to performance, or getting to the desired outcomes. Of that 20 percent, Information accounts for 80 percent of the issues.
The following sections of this report provide the analysis and findings around the issues and the suggested approaches and interventions that can be made in the short and medium term for improved performance—and sustainability—on all levels.

**The Roadmap for Successful Institutional Change**

Readers should use the following picture to understand the multi-faceted and multi-leveled mechanisms that are recommended for the interventions in each sector. This “Roadmap” outlines the process by which key interventions are proposed for framing the Educational Legacy. Together the four main sector interventions—working together synergistically under an umbrella framework of a major Kosovo/U.S. consortium for higher education and development—will develop a critical mass and an improved system to tip it forward, with the mechanisms to sustain the changes and progress.

At the base of this Roadmap are the requirements: Alignment, Quality and Innovation. These premises require the approach of the overarching University Strategy and Governance Partnership Consortium through which the University of Prishtina becomes the apex of a national university system. Linked to this foundation, each targeted faculty—Agriculture, Law, Public Administration (new) and Electrical and Computer Engineering—works with a partner university and/or consortium in the United States (and other donor countries as appropriate) to bring about the alignment, quality and innovation required for transformation of each faculty into a world-class educational institution conducting collaborative international research for application to both teaching and community and private sector engagement for positive change. All partnership interventions are carried out within an articulated HICD framework ensuring institutional capacity development. These interventions further develop and expand critical linkages with concerned ministries, departments, civil society, the private sector and other donors through area/sector intervention sets appropriate to each particular sector and the critical gaps identified during this assessment. Similar Roadmap diagrams are found in each of the sector assessments (in the annex) to illustrate the particular interventions recommended.

**Figure 2. Roadmap of Alignment, Quality, and Innovation**
Gender and Leadership: Key Findings

Gender Equity\(^4\)

In Kosovo, women have become a majority among most student bodies and are increasingly appearing in leadership roles. Strong, capable women are taking leadership in greater numbers and their organizations are becoming recognized as among the most effective in a sea of groups otherwise marked by mediocrity.

**Gender Equity in ICT.** Until recently, ICT in Kosovo has been mostly about system installations, cable networks, and more physically-oriented tasks where men have taken primary roles. While the field remains male-dominated, women’s enrollment in ICT subjects is increasing, their presence in the sector is beginning to be recognized, and a few “Stars” are emerging. Among these are two notable women interviewed during team research: Dr. Myzafere Limani, Dean of the Faculty of Electrical and Computer Engineering at the University of Prishtina; and Ms. Vjollca Cavolli, the Executive Director of ICT Association in Kosovo (STIKK).

Specific interventions for furthering women and minority engagement in the ICT sector include increasing Vocational and Educational Training (VET) opportunities, and recruiting female students in computer engineering, computer science, business, and mathematics fields for 50 percent of scholarships for Master’s degrees abroad.

**Gender Equality in Public Administration.** A growing number of women are working as public servants. According to the Ministry of Public Administration (MPA), 34 percent of the 18,537 civil servants are women. Overall, only 16 percent of the existing high executive positions (director level) at the ministry level are occupied by women professionals\(^5\); at the local level this share is much lower at only 8 percent. In terms of managerial positions, women represent 25 percent of managers at the ministry level and 20 percent at the municipal-level.

Ilire Faija Buza, the Acting Deputy General Auditor and Bardha Rrustemi, the Director for the Department for Management of Public Administration Reform (PAR) in the MPA, are to be recognized for their contributions to the public administration sector. In addition to women senior public servants, some extraordinary women leaders in civil society include Igballe Rogova, the leader of the Kosovo women’s network of 80 women NGOs across the country and very active in Balkan regional civic networks, and Venera Hajrullahu, the Director of the Kosovo Civil Society Development Foundation.

Gender equality requires further investment and on-going monitoring in order to achieve the Government of Kosovo and donor objectives. Gaps and needs for improvement include: Improving performance of institutional frameworks and mechanisms by increased coordination and capacity of staff involved, especially in the area of active monitoring of the implementation of gender policies; Mainstreaming gender at the executive and management levels by investing in post-graduate education and specialization in various areas of public policy and management; and investing in the education of women, especially at the local level and in rural areas.

**Gender Equity in Rule of Law.** A sizeable number of women are present in key executive, high-ranking legal professional positions and are operating effectively in legal education. Women are much less frequently found in the middle and lower levels, though more women are needed at all levels. Women comprise 28 percent of the judiciary; while encouraging, the Law on Gender Equality requires 40

---

\(^4\) For this report considerable information on women in particular has been gathered and reported. Further research around minorities was limited by time and resource constraints and should be targeted as a key area for further investigation and the development of any appropriate mitigating policies, programs and interventions.

\(^5\) Data was provided by the USAID Democratic Municipalities Initiative Project, Kosovo
percent of public institutions to be composed of females; thus, further engagement of women in the judiciary is necessary. It is imperative that all programs identify qualified women to participate in pilot studies and programs.

Resolving and balancing traditional customs and rule of law focus on the rights of women presents some difficulties, especially regarding inheritance, abuse, and access. One of the “Stars” interviewed by the ROL team, the Executive Director of the governmental Legal Aid Agency, Drita Rexhepi, is navigating these challenges, and is recognized nationally as an influential and effective leader.

Women play extremely important roles not only through formal structures, but through informal channels in the home, community, and social networks. This global phenomenon—mirrored in Kosovo—led the ROL team to suggest exploration of a “Salon Concept” for creativity, problem solving, leadership and mutual support as a potential component of the larger HICD interventions.

**Gender Equity in Agriculture.** In Kosovo, men have always held key roles in working with the land and conducting agricultural business. The involvement of women in land cultivation has been minimal and has shown little change over generations. However, women have long had important roles in horticulture, food technology and food processing, although they are rarely involved in arboriculture or forestry.

Still, women are becoming increasingly active in agriculture and are appearing more frequently in leadership roles, including Emine Daci, Kosovo Chamber of Commerce President’s Advisor for Agribusiness; Fillojet Rustemaj a Food Chemist and Laboratory Director for the Food and Veterinary Agency; and Lumta Dida, a Plant Protection Specialist for Helvitas (and JBS’s Agriculture Advisor).

An increasing number of women are enrolling in and studying agriculture today. However, this trend may be the result of challenges registering in other subjects and thus choosing agriculture as the last alternative. A lack of information and knowledge in the agriculture sector tends to perpetuate gender differentiations.

The Agriculture Advisory Board for the Faculty of Agriculture should include women and minority representatives from agribusiness, horticulture, and food processing. These new initiatives for farmer advisory services should specifically target women farmers while demonstrating new methods and market opportunities where women can participate profitably.

**Transformational Leadership**

Transformational Leaders focus on making tomorrow better. They are motivated by a genuine will to serve the public interest, not personal or partisan interests. These leaders have vision and are capable of motivating others to join and expand this vision. They possess integrity as an individual and professional. Transformational leaders have creativity and new ideas to encourage team members to embrace originality, and allow measured risks. They foster a culture of innovation. They also have high professional standards and motivation to further learn and develop their knowledge, skills and abilities. Finally, transformational leaders possess a mindset oriented to personal and team development, recognizing both individual and group performance.

Teams with Transformational Leaders are constantly being transformed for the better. Critical success factors for Transformational Leadership include:

- Political will and endorsement of change and new types of leadership
- Individual leadership translating into organizational leadership

---

6 Vision, strategic focus, and innovation were noted as the most important characteristics of a leader in an ICT survey of a very limited sample of 20 people from ICT providers, the government and education sectors.
• Growing **communities online and offline** that are functionally linked and have interactive space to communicate

• Ability to hear **critical independent voices** and **openness** to interact and cooperate with external stakeholders

• **Develop local stakeholders’ ownership** by involving them from the start in program design

• **Coach, mentor and assist** others to become successful

• **Provide a long-term approach** and timeframe for sustainable solutions – a two-year time span will not be enough

• **Provide for interactive partnerships** cross-function and cross-sector to accommodate the complexity of the issues related to institutional reform

• **Combine practice and theory** – not just academic knowledge – to teach practical skills

• **Build upon existing efforts** and bring in innovation, rather than develop in parallel to others

The data from interviews (and accompanying surveys) with recognized transformational leaders, or **stars**, suggest that while overseas Master’s degree training in the United States and the EU does play a part in facilitating the development of leadership qualities, it is not the only or most significant factor. Degrees earned abroad are success factors for leadership particularly where: the participant pays all or part of the costs involved; their sponsoring institution provides a cost-share; there is an assured position or required project where they can make a difference on their return; and the experience was within or complemented by a formal or informal partnership between the U.S. or other international university and the sponsoring institution in Kosovo.

Stars also attribute their success to the inspiration of family members, encouraging teachers during their childhood and school years, and mentors and colleagues with whom they worked and struggled for the liberation of their country, including study and teaching under the duress of the conflict when the University of Prishtina—the cradle of the revolution—had to operate underground from private homes.

Currently the Stars are bearing considerable responsibility for change management, the articulation of “minority opinions,” while often juggling multiple jobs and duties. The load must be shared through better-designed systems, especially with a focus on outcomes; requirements, criteria and monitoring to maintain that focus; and provision of supportive mechanisms that encourage and allow the Stars and others who will have the opportunity to become Stars.

Transformational leaders in Kosovo recognized for their talent and leadership include:

- Blerand Stavileci, Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Rural Development
- Dr. Vilson Mirdita, Kosovo’s first Ambassador to Germany
- Hamdi Ibrahimi, President of the Prishtina District Court
- Kujtim Kerveshi, Member of Kosovo Prosecutorial Council
- Bashkim Rrahmani, Foundation for Democratic Initiatives
- Avni Zoghi, Leader of Organization for Democracy, Anticorruption and Dignity (COHU), arguably the best civic organization fighting corruption
- Luan Shlaku, Director of Kosovo Foundation for Open Society

---

7 Transformational leaders were generally identified in initial interviews or through network referrals.
Partnerships and Sustainability

As part of the HICD Assessment process, JBS conducted a review of existing and prior partnerships—both formal and informal—among U.S. and Kosovo universities and institutions since independence. Among the partnerships reviewed among U.S. and Kosovo institutions were the following:

**Arizona State University—University of Prishtina Faculty of Economics (faculty exchanges)**

While this partnership (2004-2006) ended six years ago, it demonstrates the potential sustainability of academic partnerships because even without funding, the involved professors have maintained relationships until today. The program provided faculty exchanges: 20 came from Arizona and stayed 5 months, and 20 UP faculty did the same. Through these links a non-profit institute outside the university has also become linked with the University of Minnesota and Columbia University professors and with a State Supreme Court Judge who all maintain active contact with their UP colleagues. As for concrete sustainable outputs, however, these appear to have been rather limited. It is disappointing to note that in retrospect the only key “take away” regarding modern classroom management techniques recalled by one of the participants was a shift to using PowerPoint instead of classroom lectures. Clearly, planned future partnerships will need to raise the bar with more specific, effective and sustainable targets grounded in solid and measurable criteria.

**University of Pittsburgh—University of Prishtina Faculty of Engineering and Computer Science (FECE) (to increase global competitiveness)**

This partnership, funded by USAID through Higher Education for Development, sought to increase Kosovo’s global competitiveness by developing its telecommunications workforce capacity. Three students received Master’s degrees in telecommunications and returned to UP FECE to teach the new curriculum. The partnership also included equipment for curriculum materials, computer labs and video conferences, and for institution building, with the result that the Industry Advisory Council (IAC) and internships were established to allow its graduates to work more closely with the private sector and its changing needs and requirements. In terms of sustainability, (1) the new curricula continue to be taught; (2) the equipment is being used for video conferences and remote lecturing, e.g., with the University of Sweden; (3) the IAC and internship program is embedded within UP FECE.

With no provisions for long-term sustainability nor for leveraging follow-on funds built into the project design, there are reasonable concerns, now that the project has ended (2011), about being able to continue the clearly successful aspects of the partnership. The FECE Dean, a committed and dynamic partner with excellent management skills, is interested in building on the foundation laid by this initiative, which suggests that potential replication with appropriate criteria for promoting sustainability is clearly worth exploration. The ICT team recommends building on this initiative by exploring the use of video conference facilities and computer labs for online classes and leveraging professional relationships among interested faculty to develop formal partnerships with other U.S. and European universities.

**American University in Kosovo (AUK)—Rochester Institute of Technology (RIT) (to create a School of Public Service)**

American University in Kosovo (AUK) is a locally-based non-profit American university affiliated with Rochester Institute of Technology (RIT) to deliver AUK’s undergraduate and Master’s degree programs. Students graduating from AUK earn an RIT degree, which is recognized worldwide. While tuition costs are high by local and regional standards, they are considerably lower than those normally charged by U.S. universities. Under USAID funding, AUK provided 81 Fellowships for M.A. degrees in Public Service/Public Policy. This program appears to have yielded a full return of investment, due to its demand-driven design, selecting mid- to high-level professionals from within different sectors of Public Administration. Unique to the program, participants could work while studying, thus not interrupting
their professional career paths. M.A. thesis (Capstone Project) studies were practically focused on real issues within the institution and/or sector of the M.A. fellow, contributing action-oriented research that could be both applied and useful for broader aspects of the reform processes and improved institutional performance. AUK's Public Policy School, which is rooted in USAID's Excellence in Public Service Program, is considered to be a good design and approach and worthy of exploration as a potential partner under future initiatives.

**Additional Partnerships**

Interviews uncovered a number of additional partnerships—formal and informal, older and emerging—among U.S. and Kosovo academic institutions.

**University of Wisconsin—University of Prishtina (leadership in agriculture)**

University of Wisconsin has been working with Dean Skender Muji and others in GoK and the University of Prishtina since hosting a group of Kosovar government leaders for a leadership agricultural development workshop in 2009. Additionally, Dr. Pamela Ruegg's team has been working with Professor Hysen Bytyci, his colleagues and his students, as well as with leaders and staff at Kosovo's national testing laboratory and local milk processing plants to take milk samples, test them, gather data and implement interventions based on the data collected.

**Iowa State University—University of Prishtina (veterinarian workshops)**

Iowa State University's Dr. Youngs has been to Kosovo twice to conduct workshops for veterinarians (who perform all artificial insemination services in Kosovo at present) and farmers (on animal nutrition). Recently Iowa State University completed a second shipment of 20 dairy cattle embryos to Kosovo to enhance the number and the genetic background of Holstein cows. Iowa State University is also working with the Kosovo Minister of Agriculture to establish an extension/advisory service modeled after the United States' earlier extension service.

**University of Minnesota/University of Georgia—University of Prishtina, Faculty of Agriculture (informal faculty exchanges and research projects)**

The Dean of the Faculty of Agriculture reported that there have been a number of informal relationships and small grants—some funded by USAID—involving his faculty and those of the Universities of Minnesota and Georgia.

**University of Pittsburgh/Chicago-Kent College of Law—University of Prishtina Faculty of Law (contemporary legal practices)**

These two U.S. law schools began an informal collaboration with UP/Faculty of Law in 2002 and have made particularly strong commitments to bringing contemporary practices of legal education to Prishtina. Both schools have hosted law faculty in the United States, sent instructors to Kosovo, and through their respective LL.M. programs, trained talented young students who are committed to return to Kosovo to share their knowledge. The University of Pittsburgh School of Law provides tuition waivers and hosts LL.M. students from Kosovo every year.

**Lessons Learned from Previous Partnerships**

In order to maximize partnership impact and sustainability, the experience of partnerships in Kosovo and of global USAID experience over the past five decades suggests that a number of critical criteria be built into project design and funding agreements. In addition to linking the partnerships to national development goals, including HICD capacity-building provisions, and ensuring that they are government by MOUs, partnerships should
Human and Institutional Capacity Development (HICD) Assessment: Kosovo

- Be initiated by Kosovo institutions and faculty with oversight by a joint steering committee;
- Embed Master’s (and Ph.D.) degrees, include tuition waivers and require that degree candidates contribute according to personal resources; and
- Expect that cost-share/local contributions from all partners should equal at least 100 percent of donor funding and encourage partners to leverage additional funding from other sources.

Additionally, where possible, partnerships should build on the land-grant model linking research, teaching and outreach; launch joint research projects and publications; and include significant numbers of faculty and student exchanges. Partnerships should also support private-sector engagement, encourage community outreach, and include practical skills development. Ideally, they should also facilitate links with other regional and international institutions and additional partners. Finally, partners should maintain strong MIS/performance monitoring systems to generate baselines and track inputs and outputs, and to gauge outcomes and impacts.

Education Sector Overview

Kosovo’s vision for education, as expressed in the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan (KESP) 2011-2016, is to create an inclusive education system and to provide all citizens in the Republic with equal access to quality education at all levels. This type of system would provide the people of Kosovo with life-long skills and advanced knowledge enabling integration into European society and would contribute to the long term sustainable development of the country through job creation and enhanced social cohesion.

Education has been and continues to be one of the most dynamic sectors and among the main objectives and priorities of the GoK. The Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST) consistently reiterates its aspiration to develop an effective system of higher education and research in order to increase the development and welfare of Kosovar society. With the youngest population in Europe, Kosovo considers human capital to be the most important asset that will support future development of the nation.

Kosovo’s economy has changed substantially in the past two decades, but the supply of skills has not responded to changes in demand: the education and training system is failing to provide adequate learning opportunities, relevant curricula, and effective teaching to produce the skills that are needed in the labor market. As the economy develops, and skills and knowledge become more important, the quality and relevance of skills among graduates of local educational institutions also becomes crucial. Higher education is seeing a rapid increase in the number of students enrolled but the budget allocation, investments, and the number of academic staff is not keeping pace with this growth in the student population.

Kosovo higher education includes public and private higher education institutions. Although Kosovo is not a formal member of the Bologna Process, all higher education institutes in Kosovo (with the exception of the American University of Kosovo) seek to follow Bologna guidelines. The Kosovo Accreditation Agency has been running the process of accreditation for all higher education institutes. The higher education system operates based on the Law on Higher Education revised and approved in 2011. Public and private institutions and other higher education institutions (colleges, institutes, higher professional schools) cover a full range of higher education services from professional training to typical academic programs. Higher education institutions include:

- The University of Prishtina, which consists of 17 academic units located in the seven major towns of Kosovo.
• The University of Prizren, which started to operate in October 2010.

• The American University of Kosovo located in Prishtina, where the language of instruction is English.

• 13 private higher education institutions (colleges, institutes and higher professional schools) with enrollments totaling more than 15,000 students.

**University of Prishtina**

The University of Prishtina, which is the largest provider of higher education, has gone through an extraordinary and courageous development since June 1999, including being forced to operate underground during the periods of conflict. Although there are *pro et contra* arguments whether substantial or superficial reforms took place during this difficult period of time, survival alone was a significant achievement. Since independence, a reform process has been introduced and is underway; however, it is not yet delivering concrete outcomes, i.e., skillful and competitive students for the labor market. Several times the push for reform came from international stakeholders. While their support was useful, the approach in some cases was reported as imposed without sufficient research and assessment. As a result, this did not bring about systematic and sustainable change because, in many cases, local players did not have ownership of the process to sustain and drive it further.

The situation at the University of Prishtina is unsatisfactory in a number of areas. An analytical survey conducted by the Balkan Investigative Reporting Network (BIRN, 2009), “Situation and Problems at the University of Prishtina,” reports that the five greatest problems UP students are concerned about, according to their responses, are as follows:

- The failure of professors to use contemporary teaching and assessment methods
- The lack of practical work
- The lack of appropriate and adequate academic literature
- Arbitrary academic assessment by professors
- Poor relationships between students and their professors

In addition, the study reported a number of other aspects of academic life and facilities at UP that are seen to be unsatisfactory. These include: difficulty in consulting with professors; delays or failures in the publication and distribution of course syllabi and timetables, as well as exam timetables; inadequate departmental libraries; inefficient and unhelpful administrative services; dysfunctional student representation; and the inability of many students to proceed on to Master’s level degrees at the end of their undergraduate studies.

Most of these problems are connected to, and many are inseparable from, larger problems that UP faces, such as its limited budget, external interference in its financial and managerial autonomy, the limited number of academic staff and restrictions on their increase, the huge number of students, limited space and infrastructure, and a lack of scientific research conducted by the university.

**Recommendations and Interventions**

Substantial challenges face higher education as a whole. From these challenges, a number of recommendations and suggested interventions can be drawn, including:

- Providing the right skills and competencies for the labor market. In order to overcome persistent mismatches between graduate qualifications and the needs of the labor market,
university programs should be structured to directly enhance the employability of graduates and to offer broad support to the workforce more generally. UP should offer innovative curricula, teaching methods and training/retraining programs that include broader employment-related skills along with the more discipline specific skills. Over the long-term, credit-internships in industry should be integrated into curricula.

- Increasing the scholarship opportunities for students to study abroad in various eminent international universities (U.S.). This effort should also create a contractual obligation with scholarship beneficiaries to serve as University of Prishtina staff (assistant or lectures) once they complete their studies. The University of Prishtina will be able to use this opportunity to build capacity in areas with current deficits, which should be the basis for the selection of academic fields for scholarships. However, UP has to commit to employing the scholarship winners when they return.

- Capacity building at the University of Prishtina should address the university governance structure, top-management, senate, faculties, students associations on university management, administration, and specific capacity building for project preparation and fund-raising.

To ensure sustainable implementation of the above—and other essential higher education reforms beyond the scope of this brief review—it is essential that any HICD interventions be undertaken within a framework that includes review and strengthening of higher education as a whole—not just for the sectors addressed in this assessment. Most institutions would likely benefit from a thorough, institutional-level HICD assessment or other organization effectiveness assessment such as the Baldrige Education Criteria for Performance Excellence, with specific interventions designed to address their performance gaps. These would typically include human resources capacity building, targeted technical assistance, mentoring, metrics monitoring capacity building, and potentially many other activities. These could be undertaken through a high-level partnership approach engaging a consortium of U.S. universities—and other international institutions as appropriate—that include technical assistance on key administrative performance gaps, embedded graduate degrees, internships, faculty and student exchange, study visits, co-lecturing and joint study programs for international and local academic staff.

SECTOR SUMMARIES
The following section contains summaries of the full sector reports that are found in the annex. These summaries provide a brief introduction to the issues that each sector faces related to alignment, quality, and innovation. Interventions are recommended to address these issues, and projected results of these interventions are provided, as are performance indicators, where possible. Each summary also contains a gap analysis table at the end of the section. This table highlights institutional gaps, and provides interventions to address these gaps.
Information and Communications Technology

While Kosovo’s ICT sector is in the initial stages of development, the role of ICT as a catalyst that supports enterprise competitiveness across all sectors and as an engine of economic growth must be recognized. Interventions to create an ICT-savvy workforce would benefit the entire economy. ICT is a vertical sector with high potential for growth and employment in its own right and a horizontal enabler that can contribute to the growth of all sectors in the economy.

ALIGNMENT

Issues

The ICT sector is characterized by fragmentation within the governmental level where it is housed mainly in four Ministries. Policies and strategies are diffused and fragmented throughout the government. Laws and regulations, or the lack of them, complicate the growth and operations of the ICT sector. ICT has been partially integrated for e-Government and e-Business services.

Research and interviews indicate little dialogue and a misalignment among the government, private sector and educational institutions with regards to ICT. The government makes policy and the universities provide higher education. The private sector, which provides employment, is supposed to make use of the output from the two groups.

Intervention

Establish an ICT Agency as a separate unit that reports directly to the Office of the Prime Minister, to function as an internal consulting unit that can, for example, provide ICT services to the other ministries. The reasons for this recommendation are as follows:

- Consistent policies, strategies and implementation plans must be realized for cross-sector approaches, for increased efficiency and productivity. This includes e-procurement as well as other business processes to improve competitiveness.

- “One-Offs,” ICT applications in bits and pieces throughout GoK, should be shared.

- Other countries in the region have an ICT unit or Ministry which allow them to be much more competitive in terms of labor costs and ICT services.

Results

Increasing transparency and coordination will: (a) enable the private sector to increase their overall efficiency, thus raising productivity across the economy, and competitiveness both regionally and globally; and (b) improve access to information for all sectors and citizens.

Performance Indicators

When designing a change management plan, indicators of performance should be established to measure results. These indicators, could include, but not be limited to surveys and interviews including: (a) number and types of transactions and users for e-government and e-business services; (b) number and types of applications, and (c) number of sectors served.
QUALITY

Issues

Generally, the university workforce supply is large and the quality is poor, while the market absorption capacity remains low. Employers value technical and soft skills. The curriculum for ICT education at higher education institutions is more theoretical than practical; ICT is not well integrated and promoted into other faculties and studying programs as a cross-cutting technique. Only 20 percent of VET graduates find employment. Most businesses are family-owned and do not have the market capacity to absorb these graduates. ICT providers and private institutes are offering certificate programs, but the challenge is what can be absorbed in the market.

UP/FECE is the main institution offering ICT programs. FECE went through some crucial reforms towards alignment with market. There is an Industrial Advisory Board (IAB) that advises on the programs curriculum content. IAB enables a bridge from the University to the marketplace. As part of their study program they also started to provide students with courses such as Project Management, Business Development, Financial Accounting, and Entrepreneurship. Internships are mandatory as a last semester of studies, and the internship is well-organized and has input from IAC. FECE indicated that 90 percent of its Bachelor graduates are employed.

The University of Pittsburgh and the UP/FECE had a USAID-funded partnership within which the IAC was formed. Since the Partnership Project has ended, there have been no leveraged funds or follow-on funding.

Interventions

Intervention 1: VET

- Build on the VET programs that have an infrastructure in place from which to build new, and leverage existing, partnerships for ICT, both as a separate and cross-cutting program. This should include partnerships with the ICT industry (locally and regionally) to ensure that graduates will have relevant skills upon program completion.
- This includes, but is not limited to: (a) scholarships for internships abroad, (b) local career development and internships, (c) certificate-based business skills programs, and (d) attention to women and minorities in furthering their professional development.

Intervention 2: Certificate Programs

- Provide specific Certificate Professional Training Programs both in-country and abroad using a market-based approach, covering technical skills, such as project management, as well as soft skills. Concentrate on specific training such as career development, ISO and networking (relationships) so that people have the skills to be proactive to seek employment.
- Consider local providers such as STIKK and the American Chamber of Commerce in Kosovo.

Intervention 3: HICD, University of Prishtina – FECE and FMNS

- Develop the Career Services Unit. This will have direct impact on securing employment. This should include, but not be limited to: (a) workshops, (b) establishing more internships, and (c) roll-out activities to other UP faculties and/or universities in Kosovo.
• Support university partnerships with mechanisms in place to ensure sustainability and knowledge transfer. Build on other existing accomplishments from the University of Pittsburgh Partnership, relating to online classes, IAC, internships and more institutional partnerships.

• Establish a business development unit to enable FECE and FMNS to work on revenue-producing projects outside of UP. Establish financial regulations and mechanisms to ensure that revenue remains in the FECE and FMNS to allow them to enhance their materials, labs, facilities, etc.

**Intervention 4: Master’s Degrees Abroad**

• Offer scholarship to study for Master’s degrees, M.B.A.-level with business or IT emphasis that can include fields of specializations on the ICT sector such as: software engineering, networking specialists, security specialists, mobile telecommunications specialists, mobile software developers, software developers, and web developers, plus paid internships at U.S. private sector companies.

• Pay particular attention to bringing women and minorities into computer and business fields by recruiting at least 50 percent of this population for scholarships abroad.

• Ensure that scholarship recipients have incentives to return to Kosovo.

• While returnees should be allowed to choose their own employment, an implementer would work with returned students in all fields if market demand is not met. These implementers would continue to offer events to ensure success such as networking.

**Results**

Improving the quality of ICT offerings within Kosovo universities and the access to globally competitive ICT programs in the U.S. will impact Employment, Competitiveness and Professional Development by:

(a) Increasing the numbers of the students who will be prepared to work in ICT, or in other sectors using ICT effectively;

(b) ICT will be integrated across other faculties;

(c) Graduates who studied abroad and graduates in Kosovo will be better skilled at networking and being proactive in their careers; and

(d) Additional new businesses may be started.

**Performance Indicators**

When designing a change management plan for this area, indicators of performance should be established to measure results. These indicators could include surveys and interviews which could assess:

(a) Employment rate (by age, sector, gender, etc.);

(b) Number or percentage employed upon six months after return;

(c) Number and types of beneficiaries impacted; and

(d) Number of new businesses started.
INNOVATION

This section brings together the interventions with expected results in Alignment and Quality. With (1) increased alignment of the education, government and private sectors, (2) relevant quality skills provided with training, advanced degrees, certificates, etc., and (3) HICD provided to key organizations, the market will be better prepared to meet current and future ICT requirements.

Issues

Both outsourcing and in-sourcing is in demand. ICT providers need to expand to other markets, as the domestic market is not large enough to accommodate growth. Expertise in market research is needed for this expansion. Demand for qualified software engineers and ICT technicians will remain high as 70 percent of the non-ICT companies have had little or no computer skills.

Kosovo does not have an Internet shopping infrastructure and online purchasing habits. ICT applications, such as e-commerce and e-banking, require authentication services, but these services are now being developed. When this is completed, it is anticipated that numerous applications will be adopted and utilized with a much greater level of security.

Interventions

Intervention 1: Investment

- Increase investment in the ICT sector to accommodate demand and increase competitiveness. This investment can be applied to incubators, infrastructure, financing, authentication, market research, and planning for future technologies.

Intervention 2: Private Sector Partnerships

- Provide a mechanism (for example, an online community) to foster more private sector partnerships.
- Provide an environment to allow businesses to more easily engage in regional and global business transactions. This would include less bureaucratic policies and regulations.
- Leverage the experience at FECE; establish Industry Advisory Councils and empower them to make recommendations that are binding for government and education sectors.

Intervention 3: Cross Sector Approach

- Identify sectors which can benefit, for example improved business processes and procurement.
- Prioritize ICT applications, tools and methodologies that will promote increased competitiveness; consider stakeholder commitment and buy-in for prioritizing factors.
- Train ICT staff to work with various industry sectors such as: agriculture construction, Mining and Energy to address procurement, value chain and enterprise planning.
- Linkages – Be aware of each sector’s role:
  (a) Private Sector – develops applications that are tested, scalable and sustainable;
(b) Education – builds an ICT-savvy workforce through math, science, business and critical thinking; and

(c) Government – frees up policies and regulations to ensure affordable access to IT.

**Intervention 4: Leverage Success and Knowledge Transfer**

- Build on their successes, to learn about how they were established and managed growth.
- Establish web-based communities to reduce isolation of ICT companies and to bring together ICT across sectors throughout the country.
- Identify successful people who are or have the potential to be transformational leaders, including: (a) global vision, (b) authenticity, (c) growth mindset and (d) creativity.

**Results**

Innovation, Competitiveness, Employment and Efficiency will:

(a) Build on the results achieved in Alignment and Quality

(b) Allow the market a more equitable balance of ICT supply and demand, and

(c) Allow the growth of outsourcing to expand existing services.

**Performance Indicators**

When designing a change management plan, indicators of performance should be established to measure results. These indicators could include (a) employment statistics by position, (b) amount of revenue relating to ICT from GoK, private sector, NGOs, etc. (c) number of new businesses in the ICT sector, and (d) percent of revenue from the ICT sector from outsourcing, in-sourcing, etc.
### Table 1. Gap Analysis of ICT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSTITUTIONS</th>
<th>GAP</th>
<th>CORE INTERVENTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government of Kosovo</td>
<td>Fragmentation within the government as to where ICT is located</td>
<td>ICT should be a separate unit that reports directly to the Office of the Prime Minister to ensure consistent policies, strategies and implementation plans that must be realized for cross-sector approaches, for the education and private sectors to thrive and have technology allow them to be more informed and productive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of consistent communication and coordination between the government, education and private sector.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University or Prishtina, FECE and FMNS faculties</td>
<td>1. Quality of public university education (UP) is declining.</td>
<td>1. Offer Masters with business or IT emphasis that can include fields of specializations on the ICT sector such as: software engineering, networking specialists, security specialists, mobile telecommunications specialists, mobile software developers, software developers, web developers among others, plus paid internships at U.S. private sector companies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Imbalance of university education curricula in terms of the level of theoretical vs. practical approaches</td>
<td>2. Include soft skills such as communication and creativity in the required curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Non-integration of ICT as a methodical tool and application into other faculties outside FECE and FMNS.</td>
<td>3. Develop Career Services Unit for FECE and FMNS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Lack of partnerships with private sector.</td>
<td>4. Establish new university partnerships, private sector partnerships and also build on other existing accomplishments from the University of Pittsburgh Partnership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Lack of Leveraging and follow-on funds on the partnerships supported by donors.</td>
<td>5. Leveraging individual-based partnerships (formed by individual professors with universities in Europe and the United States) to transform them to more institutional based partnerships.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STIKK</td>
<td>Lack of Capacities to support its members on their needs.</td>
<td>6. Establish University and Private Sector Partnerships for maximum impact on ICT sector that consists of investment by the private sector companies to establish or upgrade a current training facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7. Apply ICT processes to UP’s FECE and FMNS, and roll out to other faculties and universities, on a prioritized basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8. Establish a business development unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Provide support to enable STIKK to conduct additional workshops, as appropriate, for its members. These workshop topics may include Networking, Career Development, Presentation Skills, and Creativity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Provide specific training in-country, such as Career Development, ISO standards, and networking (relationships) to ensure market needs and international standards are met so that people have the skills to be proactive to seek employment now and in the future. Consider local providers, including STIKK</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Public Administration: Rebuilding Public Trust in the System

Developing effective and accountable Public Administration of Kosovo is a major strategic development challenge for the country on the road to EU accession. The Public Administration Reform (PAR) is one of the core strategic objectives of the Kosovo Government Program for 2011-2014.

Issues

The past five years have been marked by fast-track growth of forming and reforming of Kosovo Public Administration with the support of almost USD 134 million in international assistance. At present, the structure and size of the Kosovo Public Administration is complex and large. Despite the progress in developing legal and institutional infrastructure, the outcomes of the reform process remain blocked in fragmentation, limited quality and ineffective innovation.

The main signal for this is the low confidence of citizens in the integrity and the functionality of the Public Administration system. Only 24 percent of them trust public institutions, and over 40 percent believe that these institutions are corrupted. Public procurement, which covers 62 percent of the national budget of Kosovo is unanimously viewed as the “gray area of widespread corruption.” The growing gap between the Public Administration and the public it serves puts at risk the overall legitimacy of the public institutions and—thus—the sustainability of democratic processes.

Critical for the success of the Public Administration reform is the development of needed individual and institutional capacity and resources, to move these reforms forward. The main capacity gaps can be grouped as follows:

(1) Quality of workforce is inadequate, and career development is very limited.

- Half of the 18,537 public servants have only secondary and/or primary education and are missing functional skills needed for their performance, varying from lack of basic computer skills to limited capacities related to key functional areas. This constitutes a significant gap in human resources for GoK.

- Politicized nepotism dominates recruitment, and career development depends on loyalty rather than professional incentive systems. This, together with low salaries, affects the sustainability of emerging groups of new professionals with knowledge and capacities to advance the reform. Many leave for better jobs outside the Public Administration.

- Progress is being made in terms of gender equality in legal and institutional infrastructure, with achievements such as the 30 percent quota of women MPs in the Assembly of Kosovo. However, despite the 34.2 percent share of women working in the public administration system, still they occupy only 16.3 percent of central level and 8 percent of local level high executive positions. Mainstreaming of gender at the executive level will require targeted investment in post-graduate education and specialization of women public servants. Locally, especially in rural areas, low access of women to quality education at all levels remains a serious gap.

(2) Alignment of efforts and support to expand capacities is insufficient.

- At present, no public university in Kosovo is offering B.A. and M.A. studies in Public Administration. The University of Prishtina (UP) provided some public administration studies from 2002 to 2006. However, these were closed and transformed into two courses within the Law Faculty focusing only on legal and procedures aspects of the Public Administration system. In practice, quality multidisciplinary teaching that can meet the urgent need for well-prepared public servants is missing. This relates to the general low
quality of university teaching, often dominated by “old style” lecturing and limited understanding of the meaning of “good governance” or “rule of law.”

- In the past five years, over 12 programs have supported M.A. studies of more than 400 young professionals in different sectors. Yet, the lack of systemic reform within their home agencies and poor coordination of efforts has prevented them from making significant changes when they return. Further, monitoring of return on investment is fragmented, especially in the long term.

- The success of the Public Administration reform process is heavily dependent on donors’ assistance. However, the efforts of different donors and emerging good practices in supporting capacity growth of the Kosovo Public Administration system remain fragmented among providers and projects. The link between donors’ investments in individuals and other programs for good governance or at the sector level is missing. Lack of alignment applies not only to cooperation among different donors, but also for the internal coordination among programs of one donor. Programming remains fragmented on a short-term, 2-3 year project basis with interruptions from one project to the next, which in turn does not provide a solid basis for sustainability.

(3) Innovation is blocked by insufficient in-country institutional capacity to systematically develop well-educated and prepared public servants.

- The Kosovo Institute for Public Administration (KIPA), established as an executive state agency within the Ministry of Public Administration (MPA), is the main provider for training to upgrade the skills of current public servants. The MPA has developed a new strategy to transform KIPA from a training facility into a new public Higher Education Institute. This is to be done in partnership with a European university. The strategy envisages that in five years, KIPA will be the providing M.A. and Ph.D. studies in the area of public policy and administration. The strategy’s start-up is supported by UNDP, which has secured funding for the first year. In early June 2012, the MPA called a meeting of all key donors present in Kosovo (including USAID) to launch the strategy and explore the possibility for expanded donors’ partnership for the reform of KIPA and for more coordinated investments in education and capacity development of public servants.

Performance Solutions–An Integrated Approach

At present there is very good momentum to address some of the above gaps. The Public Administration Reform is a priority in the Stabilization Agreement Process Dialogue. Strategic leadership is emerging within the MPA to coordinate efforts for the reform. The forthcoming mandatory training for public servants will reshape the human resources around the quality and level of education and skills in the next three years.

To assist the transformation process, a new generation of public servants with new thinking and skills will need to be developed. Such development can hardly be resolved by an intervention approach of one sector–one donor–one level. Moreover, the support for Master’s studies alone will not contribute to a critical mass of transformational leadership. These studies will need to be combined with human resources interventions making the system more open to accommodate new types of thinking and performance.

To address the capacity gaps of insufficient quality of workforce, alignment of efforts and innovation, a systemic and integrated approach needs to be applied. More concretely, such an approach needs to be based on the combined application of the following interlinked principles:
• **Alignment.** Donors and cross-sector efforts need to be coordinated, linking interventions within the public administration system and outside it, and in partnership with PAR coordination units to provide for trigger effect and optimized return of investment.

• **Quality.** Developing new types of teaching and capacity development requires a new type of cross-sector and multifunctional partnerships. This requires synergy across USAID sector programs for systematic application of HICD and support for growing leadership.

• **Innovation.** Introduce a new type of applied research, new public debate on the reform processes, and public system’s integrity. Expand interaction with civil society.

• **Ownership.** Involve key stakeholders in interventions design and process orientation to enable the development of internal capacities to continue started processes. Build upon assets and existing efforts and expand them by innovation.

**Recommended Interventions**

The team suggests an integrated two-pronged intervention applying the above four principles of systemic approach—alignment, quality, innovation and ownership. This suggested approach combines core educational interventions with supporting sector specific interventions.

I. Develop new and quality higher education for Public Administration in Kosovo to prepare new generations of public servants.

• Create a new Public Policy and Administration Department for undergraduate studies within the Faculty of Philosophy of the University in Pristina.

• **Clear, strategic objectives need to guide the new department** to become a sustainable in-country educational basis for developing a new generation of public servants, while also providing undergraduate studies to existing public servants with no higher education.

• **Develop a small and functional department,** enrolling a maximum of 40 to 50 students and with up to five professors as regular staff. At its inception, the department can model a new type of teaching and performance, especially within the overall reform of UP.

• **Effective university partnerships will be of key importance** for the curriculum development and for developing teaching capacities in the new Department. AUK is a potential partner and has several advantages. These advantages include a good record in design and modern teaching of public policy studies, the university is locally-based, but U.S. accredited, and it has good linkages with different universities in the United States. In addition, the new Department will benefit from broader linkages and partnerships with other universities from the region and Europe, which will allow for practices and visiting professors closer to the local context and the EU perspective of the country.

• **Established partnerships need to provide for developing quality teaching capacity,** both in teaching methods and staffing for the new Department. This can involve support to young professors in UP and/or graduates of other international M.A. programs for higher academic degree fellowships and faculty exchange and mentoring with partner universities.

• **Modern curriculum, teaching materials and research in local languages need to be developed and supported.** To ensure that high quality research and teaching materials are introduced in adequate translation in local languages, the creation of an interactive Working Group at the Department, including academia, PA professionals, and Kosovo Think Tanks
and NGOs will need to be developed. This group will act as a “sounding board” and provide multidisciplinary perspectives, critical reflection and input.

- Strategic alignment with the strategy of GoK in the area of Public Administration reform will provide for more sustainability of the USAID investment in the new Department at the University of Pristina. Further in-depth discussions with the MPA Department for Management of PAR and European Integration, as well as UNDP will provide more clarity on the organizational and funding details of the GoK action plan for the transformation of KIPA into a Higher Education Institute in the next five years. This will help to avoid duplication of efforts and to develop a potential strategic partnership between the University of Pristina, MPA, and KIPA.

**Results**

Enhanced in-country capacity for education of new generations of public servants.

- A new, well-functioning Department of Public Administration at UP that provides B.A. studies with modern curriculum, interactive partnership structure, and advisory working group for high quality teaching and research.

- Established strategic cooperation among the new undergraduate Department of Public Administration, MPA and the transformed Higher Education Institute KIPA which provides M.A. and Ph.D. degrees.

**Performance Indicators**

- Functional long-term partnerships with U.S. universities and universities in the region
- Advised and adopted new modern teaching and research methodologies
- Designed and adopted new advisory and mentoring practices
- Growing number of new publications and research involving innovation and different cross-sector perspectives
- Electronic library and on-line community of students in place

II. Invest within the Public Administration system: Place people with change potential at key places at central and local levels to facilitate processes important for the reform.

- Support leadership and capacity development of new and mid-level professionals by embedding this support in well-developed interactive cross-sector partnerships of local and U.S. universities, NGOs, Think Tanks and government agencies. An example for such an approach is the U.S. Hope Fellowship Program for women leadership development.

- Support M.A. and/or M.B.A. studies in American universities for new and mid-level professionals in key institutions important for the reform and overall performance. This may include key ministries (e.g., MPA, MEST, MFA, MF) as well as local administration, and specialized public agencies and bodies in areas like procurement, anticorruption, privatization, gender equality and human rights. Priority for M.A. studies will be in functional areas of importance to improved performance such as Public Management, Financial Management and Control, Public Policy, Monitoring and Evaluation, and Gender Studies, among others.
• Increase the capacity of new and mid-level professionals by combining executive courses/summer schools in Kosovo; U.S. exchange/internships of two to six weeks, as well as in the region; and reverse internships of U.S. young professionals in Public Administration institutions.

• Provide support to further expand the strategic leadership at the executive level of the MPA, especially the Department for PAR Management and EU Integration by

  • Supporting the development of an in-country core group with HICD knowledge and skills. This would be done by combining M.A. studies or other specializations in the United States and in Kosovo with coaching in change management/organizational development; and
  
  • Promoting synergy with other USAID programs for continuous long-term HICD coaching assistance for transformational leadership growth at central and local levels (for example, the USAID Democratic Municipalities Initiative).

• Require a 40 percent quota, at a minimum, for female professionals in all types of instruments supporting leadership growth at the different levels of administration.

Results

• Core “change” groups of people are developed with the professional capacity and vision at key places, institutions, and levels within the Public Administration system who are able to move the reform from within.

• Advanced process of the Public Administration Reform

Performance Indicators

• Political will and endorsement of new types of leadership – growth in the number of new types of leaders at key institutions with sound technical and soft skills

• Increased interaction and cooperation with civil society

• Increased percentage of women professionals at executive and management levels

Additional Recommendation

An additional recommended sector specific intervention is based on the stated need to develop professional Foreign Service of the Republic of Kosovo.

• Provide assistance to the emerging Diplomacy academy/ Foreign Service School at the Ministry for Foreign Affairs by developing partnerships with locally based universities—the International Study Department of UP, AUK, and leading U.S. foreign service schools.

Results

• Adopted professional curriculum and quality teaching

• Professional foreign service in place
### Table 2. Gap Analysis of Public Administration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSTITUTIONS</th>
<th>GAP</th>
<th>CORE INTERVENTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Public Administration sector/crosscutting** | 1. Over 50% of Public servants with secondary or primary education  
2. Missing in-country capacity for systematic growth of quality high education capacities needed for the public sector | 1. Establish a new Public Policy and Administration Department for B.A. studies within the UP  
- Develop functional partnerships – with U.S. and regional universities and with KIPA/MPA  
- Develop professors and curriculum by internships/fellowships for higher academic degree and/or faculty exchange and mentoring with partner universities.  
- Create a Working Advisory Group, incl. academia, PA practitioners, Think Tanks and NGOs, as well as student NGOs. To act as “sounding board” providing for multidisciplinary and cross sector functional perspectives, critical reflection and input. |
| **Public Universities/University of Prishtina** | 1. B.A. teaching in public universities in the area of public administration/public policy  
2. Not enough professors with Ph.D. and modern teaching in Public Administration  
3. Missing high quality teaching materials, research and good translation in local languages | 1. Explore further the strategy of MPA to transform KIPA by more in-depth discussions with the MPA Department for Management of PAR and European Integration, as well as UNDP. This will provide more clarity on the details of the action plan for KIPA transformation in the next five years from both organizational and funding points of view. In turn, it will also assist developing the parameters of strategic partnership among the new Department for B.A. studies at UP with MPA and KIPA. |
| **Kosovo Institute for Public Administration** | 1. KIPA is the key government agency for capacity upgrade of public servants, financed by state budget and donors’ contributions. There is a new GoK strategy to transform KIPA into a Government high education institute. In five years KIPA is to provide M.A. and Ph.D. in Public Administration. Critical need to develop teaching capacity.  
2. Upcoming UNDP/GoK project to support this transformation by partnership with EU University. Due to annual financial planning UNDP will provide financing for the first year, which does not exclude more financing in the next years. | 1. Support developing HICD core group around the Department for Coordination of the PAR at the MPA  
2. M.A. and specialization in U.S. in organizational development/change management and in-country coaching |
| **MPA; Department for Management of PAR reform and EU Integration** | 1. Need of speeding up of PAR in regard to human resources capacities, structure and planning a lot of processes started.  
2. Need of developing capacities within the system for assisting and coaching started processes vertically and horizontally | 1. Support with M.A. and/or M.B.A. studies in the U.S. and/or in American universities in the region for young and midlevel professionals in key institutions  
2. Capacity upgrade for young and midlevel professionals by combined in-country executive courses, U.S. and/or regional exchange/internships, reverse internships of U.S./EU professionals in Kosovo public institutions |
| **Key Ministries and specialized bodies of importance to the reform and good performance, as well as local administration** | 1. People with change potential at central and local levels; need of upgrade of skills and functional capacities at key places and functional areas  
- Public Administration, Foreign Affairs, Finance, MEST;  
- Specialized public agencies and bodies –procurement, anticorruption, privatization, gender equality officers, human rights officers | 1. Support developing HICD core group around the Department for Coordination of the PAR at the MPA  
2. M.A. and specialization in U.S. in organizational development/change management and in-country coaching  
3. Support with M.A. and/or M.B.A. studies in the U.S. and/or in American universities in the region for young and midlevel professionals in key institutions  
4. Capacity upgrade for young and midlevel professionals by combined in-country executive courses, U.S. and/or regional exchange/internships, reverse internships of U.S./EU professionals in Kosovo public institutions |
Rule of Law

Notwithstanding the amounts of money, training, and consultancy invested in reform and restructuring the rule of law in Kosovo, the situation is perceived as precarious, threatening further reform and development. While many pieces are improved, the legal system has not achieved confidence, independence, efficiency, or an institutional polity to resolve issues effectively. Moreover, the upcoming structural changes have created anxiety, and in particular, there is confusion about these changes and any setbacks.

Still, considerable will and vision are evident within this context, and building a critical mass to bring about the rule of law can be achieved through attention to several inputs. The systemic approach provides the most powerful solution where institutional processes can be designed and implemented to make it easier to “do it right” than to do it any other way.

ALIGNMENT

Issues

The overwhelming critique garnered through this assessment is certain agencies, functions, individuals—the system—place their own functional interests as priority over the legal system. However, to build confidence and effectiveness of the rule of law, all of the pieces within the system have to interact and contribute to that outcome. Accentuating this systematically, two issues become apparent: legal education is feeding the legal system with poor inputs, and the key players/functions in the legal system do not have the expertise in designing management structures, processes and feedback that are necessary to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of its functions.

Reform of the legal system is not a matter of starting over; it is a matter of redefining the outcomes of higher legal education and aligning all of the inputs and processes to serve that objective. The current state of legal education explains the major blockages in the system, and reform of it provides for an effective solution. However, reforming legal education is a difficult and complex challenge that includes reconstituting the “job” of the professor, requirements for faculty and student performance, and resource allocation and utilization. Additionally, newly educated and merit-based personnel will have to be brought into positions of power and influence throughout the legal system.

An opportunity to sustain the continuing reforms exists, if supported by the governance agencies and continuing legal education. Fortunately, a larger pool of jurists is available, more so than at independence when only a few prepared jurists were thought capable of responding to the new requirements and developments of starting a new country.

Interventions

Start with education. With the participation of senior judicial, executive, and legislative branches in the faculties of law, all key junctures of governance and administration are intertwined. While such participation accords status, it also weakens the system because the commitment to the full-time job of academic teaching, research, and student preparation is lacking. The universities must align their polity and culture to focus on providing a quality education for student readiness which will require a reconfiguration at the governance level and in faculty requirements. Without this, the circular loops of decision-making over those who control employment only serve to weaken the system.

Intervention 1. University Partnership for Strategy and Governance

Intervention 2. University Faculty Partnership—with one U.S. faculty or consortium of university faculties to address priorities of Faculties of Law/Kosovo (public and private).
Results

Higher education is de-linked from political oversight and focuses on required outcomes. Political oversight is the main blockage to reform, and is the universal complaint of every interviewee, at every level in the legal system. Alignment with the mission of higher education, the Strategy and Governance Partnership is especially critical as related to the rule of law.

The public university network of law faculties are coordinated in departments, specializations, measures of performance, and monitoring to ensure a quality outcome (of student readiness).

Progress in rule of law must revolve around transparent management systems, in linking communications and problem solving, with education.

Performance Indicators

- Reconstituted governance of university and faculty, so that roles and responsibilities do not constitute conflict of interest
- Independence of and societal representation on the Governing bodies; oversight functions are not the same people who are implementing
- Strategy developed for reform and sustainability over 10 year period
  - Programs designed and planned overt 5-year funding period
  - Conflicting GoK strategic objectives resolved
    - Student : faculty ratios agreed at realistic levels
  - Cooperative research and agreement on requirements for economic growth (over 5-10 years) informs which specializations to pursue (with academic scholarships) and directs students into required faculties/
  - Coursework rebalanced between theory and practicum (away from historical recounting)
- Job of professor redefined (toward desired outcomes) and indicators developed; tied to contract renewal
- Appoint Faculty on the basis of full-time or visiting professors
  - Realistic scheduling and availability established
  - Required research, practicum, advisory established
  - Embed research/projects and moot court into curricula
- Commercial and contract law program established, funded, and staffed with merit-based personnel
- Library/reference center stocked, organized, able to be utilized; web-based research available and accessible
- BIRN report issues used to frame intervention, no significant progress made to date.

QUALITY

Issues

Kosovo institutional players and donor project staff are despondent on the progress of the reforms and restructuring in rule of law. Profound progress is taking place in thinking and redesign, in understanding competencies and refocusing on doing the right things, and doing the right things in the right way. The institutions that constitute the rule of law are adapting and redirecting. Yet, it is the leaders themselves who identify the key weaknesses: silo-ing of functions, poor communications among “players” in the legal system, and a need to address implementation together (i.e., with cross-functional teams) especially on concrete tools and skills related to project planning and implementation, operational requirements, and monitoring their own work and progress.
Interventions

Intervention 3. Functioning Transparent Management System at the Court Administration Level, then Extending into the Legal System

Using an advanced HICD approach, USAID can assist with revamping the ineffective confusion over responsibility, ownership, and implementation at the grass roots level. The players who do rule of law would reconstitute their sense of jobs, information sharing, problems solving, implementation processes and details, and identify those gaps still needed to be addressed. The proposed approach, which is described in detail in the Rule of Law Annex, has been singled out as the most effective approach by organizational research and recent evaluation of management approaches. Solving today’s problems over the next 6-18 months can be turned into sustainable solutions over 3-5 years.

For “plans to become actions,” the focus needs to shift to cross-functional project teams and transparent management processes. Communications, systemic problem solving, and planning and implementation are the issues of uppermost concern to the Chair of the Judicial Council. Such issues represent how problems are made—and solved.

The intervention relies on a 3-step process. A typical organization chart is best used to understand that each level of staff comprises the work of the person to whom they report. In such a chart, the 3-job outputs equal the job of the supervisor. This relationship defines how information, decision making, monitoring and resource allocation is conducted. The view is vertical, but work processes are horizontal, so the spaces between functions represent the silo-ing effect that increases inefficiency. This diminishes alignment of functions to the overall objectives while focusing on its own objectives. Alignment is reduced, rendering the institution less effective. The “web” better depicts actual workflow. The web can be helpful or block reform and change. Lastly, the “flow” of the system obligates each step or function to understand the requirements, timeliness, and scope of the output they produce, to pass on to the next step.

Figure 3. Flow of the Legal System in Kosovo
**Intervention 4. Court Administration: Certificate Program**

Court administration is a new job, with new requirements, expectations and automation. The flow of work depends on the commitment, specifications, and responsibility of implementation from each and all participants. It is not just a person; it is the network of staff and all aspects of the judicial system. A certificate program is an efficient way to develop a cadre of trained individuals will be prepared to ensure more efficient administration of the country’s courts.

**Intervention 5. Public Information**

To a larger extent than perceived, the information about the legal system is skewed. With the changes in court structures and the cascading impact of the changes that will flow from that, it is critical to intervene with accurate, user-friendly and widely shared information, pre-empting problems with “client services” as well as telling the story of what and why it is changing.

**Intervention 6. Continuing Legal Education (CLE)**

CLE is required to build a critical mass of merit-based performers. It will also be a legal requirement in January 2013. Implementation approaches in the areas of deciding and devising certificate and training topics are excellent; however, there is little foresight into sustainability with the high level of involvement by many donor projects. The technical experts do not necessarily have the corresponding skills in instructional design, competency-based training and testing, materials development, or training (platform) skills. Lastly, there is an opportunity to build into the CLE requirements recognition of earned CLE credits in the United States or other donor countries.

**Results**

The court administrators and judicial system participants must develop indicators for their own performance, coordinating with all parties/functions that make up the flow of the system. These indicators are especially critical at the hand-off points, to heighten transparency and effectiveness, thereby building confidence in the judicial system and a sense of rule of law underpinning public service as a whole.

Measures developed in cross-functional project teams will serve three purposes: transfer ownership to Kosovar agencies and individual players; move from design to implementation on practical terms; and build in and require communications between and among each function/element of the system in order to improve on all levels of communications.

**Performance Indicators**

- Each step in judicial process is specified: timing, responsibility, and scope; self-monitoring indicators set up and implemented
- Roles and responsibilities clarified and indicators agreed and monitored
- Public information capability cooperatively developed between courts and civil society providing timely and understandable communications for court users and the public at large
- Requirements for CLE trainers aligned with outcomes: instructional design, competency-based curricula and testing, practicum/practice, course and program evaluated (for effectiveness), and coordinated with higher education developments and gaps

**INNOVATION**

**Issues**
Confusion and contradiction continue to exist within the legal code, making it difficult to render decisions and confusing to implementing judgments. A harmonized Kosovo body of law is needed. Although the body of “players” is small and known to one another, there is remarkably little coordination and linkage to build the critical mass of opinion and implement the reforms and changes.

**Intervention 7. Harmonization of the legal code**

Kosovo will need to review and harmonize its four “bodies” of law (Yugoslav, UNMIK, Kosovo, donor/EU accession) and review and coordinate legislation and secondary legislation and regulations, and finally between regulatory code and enforcement.

**Results**

Coordination is vital, as this issue touches all Kosovar reforms and donor projects. A comprehensive project plan with painstakingly clear steps to identify, propose, and remedy clarifications will mitigate any drift into silo-ing or confusion. Monitoring must utilize administrative and operational competencies, and legal clarifications and terminology.

**Performance Indicators**

- 3-level project teams report on legislative, primary vis-à-vis secondary and regulatory, and enforcement issues
- EU compatibility and with donor cooperation and coordination

**Intervention 8. Establishing a “Salon”**

Kosovar leaders, managers, professors, practitioners and politicians want to improve the legal system. Many of the potential solutions are embedded in the regulatory and implementation bodies; many others are being taken outside of the “system” because of financial, political, control, and lack of vision issues. Although there is a very high degree of interaction and networking, the circle of individuals offering solutions should be broadened. The salon concept will accelerate systemic thinking, vision, implementation of reforms, and separation of powers (independence) through supportive actions and focus on outcomes.

**Results**

Established over centuries and noted for its successful interplay of points of view, involving a friendly competition to achieve “even better,” salons have played a singular role especially in times of change and big questions. Salons fill a space between informal networking and formal/positional meeting management. The sponsor is typically powerful enough to have a broad perspective and a broad network and knowledge of visionaries, and the creative, do-ers, and problem solvers, but does not have an upfront, deterministic role or position. It is by invitation, and is a meritocracy that links people and works through the “Gordian knots” that all know and understand, but it takes a critical mass and focus to make happen.

**Performance Indicators**

- Alignment – solutions are integrated and coherent in their objectives
- Quality – solutions are drawn from several perspectives, thereby minimizing “unintended consequences”
- Innovation – reach a tipping point, where it is easier to do the right thing than it is to keep subverting the rule of law
Table 3. Gap Analysis of Rule of Law

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSTITUTION</th>
<th>GAPS</th>
<th>CORE INTERVENTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Higher Education network; Public universities (4); Overall independent commission</td>
<td>Weak governance, compromising quality of graduates, research and community outreach</td>
<td>#1 University partnership &lt;strategy and governance&gt;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| University of Prishtina; University of Prizren; Faculty of Law; Private college faculties of law | Lack of critical thinking, professional preparation; Undefined concept and role of ‘professor’, to include requirements for teaching, advisory, project/mentoring, research  
See details, BIRN Report on Education; no significant improvement to date                                                                 | #2 University Law faculty partnership/consortium – primarily with UP, extended to all faculties of law                                                                                                 |
| HICD interventions                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                  |
| Cross-functional teams at implementation level: Judges, prosecutors, advocates, court administration, police, enforcement agencies | Weak management, project implementation, problem solving; little ownership of new structures  
Weak coordination between key; poor communications among key functionaries implementation planning minimal, not coordinated | #3 HICD Implementation & Transparency: Project Management                                                                                                                                                 |
| 9 Courts/administrators + staff; Coordination with presidents of court and KJC | Increased demands, low automation, transitioning to new court structure                                                                                                                                   | #4 Court Administration Certificate program                                                                                                                                                              |
| Court administrators, with civil society, court presidents                 | Poor attention to court users, as well as general public  
Information in media is often skewed and inaccurate                                                                                                                                                  | #5 Public Information                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| Kosovo Judicial Institute Other CLE offerors                               | KJI sustainability–surfeit of programs, and donors; no strategy for upcoming CLE requirement and filled judicial positions  
Little expertise in instructional design, competency-based training; effectiveness evaluation  
Competing for mandate–Hit and miss TOT; no focus on instructional design, competency                                                                 | #6 Continuing legal education (CLE) emphasis on quality, effectiveness and sustainability                                                                                                                 |
| Assembly, Judiciary All participants practicing                             | 4 bodies of law: Yugoslav, UNMIK, Kosovo, donor/EU  
Between legislation and secondary and regulatory                                                                                                                                                      | #7 Harmonization of laws                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| Visionaries and implementers, Innovative and supporting, interested in improving the legal system; not just part | Bold need for managers to engage with the powers that be in calm and open space; keep aware of developments                                                                                                                                                      | #8 Salon for strategic leaders, managers, experts                                                                                                                                                        |
Agriculture

Agriculture has always been a key sector in the economy of Kosovo. However, since the war, economic growth in Kosovo has been poor and the performance of the agricultural sector has been below average. Both the area under cultivation and the yield per hectare has dropped, as has agriculture’s share of the overall economy.

Yet, at the same time, agriculture provides a major source of livelihood and employment and contributes an estimated 20 percent to GDP and 16 percent of total exports, with 40 percent of the people officially employed in the sector. Agriculture faces constraints that include access/blockages that impede serving strong domestic and EU markets. The sector also suffers from minimal or poor links among the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Rural Development (MAFRD), Faculty of Agriculture at UP, laboratories, VET schools, private sector, and farmers. Agricultural research, policies, and practical education are extremely weak, and its extension/advisory services are divided among multiple agencies and departments, and frequently are not harmonized with EU regulations and standards.

ALIGNMENT

Issues

Like the ICT, Public Administration and Rule of Law sectors, agriculture is characterized by fragmentation within GoK and the University of Prishtina. Policies, strategies and institutions are diffused and scattered among four ministries and eight agencies or departments; research facilities are found in at least six laboratories under four ministries.

- Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Rural Development
  - Kosovo Institute of Agriculture (KIA) at Peja
  - Institute for Viticulture and Enology (IVE) at Rahovec
  - Kosovo Forestry Institute (KFI) included in the Kosovo Forestry Agency, Peja
  - Kosovo Centre for Livestock Breeding (KCLB) at Peja – now an association

- Prime Minister’s Office
  - Kosovo Food and Veterinary Agency (KFVA) laboratories in Prishtina

- Ministry of Public Health
  - Institute of Public Health, Food Safety Laboratories

- Ministry of Education
  - Faculty of Agriculture, University of Prishtina (FAUP)
  - Vocational education and training (VET) higher secondary schools

Compounding this fragmentation, all of these agricultural institutions are severely understaffed and under-budgeted for their new roles.

The infrastructure of all laboratories, except those of KFVA, is insufficient, especially with respect to laboratory quality, safety and quarantine. This situation leads to poor services to clients, isolated relationships and linkages among institutes and laboratories, lack of responsiveness to MAFRD policy,
low quality inspection services, poor data from failing field diagnostic activities, and sub-standard monitoring and surveying.

In many institutes or laboratories, new equipment is often either not in operation or hardly used, due to the lack of skilled staff and/or consumable constraints. The appointment and retention of trained and experienced staff is a severe problem throughout the system. Core issues requiring immediate attention include the following:

- Strong, dynamic Minister with vision leads an understaffed, under-budgeted MAFRD; minimal and under-trained extension/advisory service; severe shortage of senior talent required for strategic planning and management to address demands of this vital sector
- Weak education system at FAUP in terms of faculty strength and training; curriculum, pedagogy, laboratory and practical facilities for carrying out both training of students and faculty research
- Inadequate and uncoordinated network of laboratories under different ministries are minimally equipped with poor linkages to serve EU integration
- Low salaries under the national Civil Service salary structure; an M.Sc., irrespective of years of service and experience, earns only about EUR 350 per month
- Lack of incentives for the professional advancement (so-called trap-positions)
- Absence of partnerships, support, professional interaction and cross-fertilization from international institutions and universities dedicated to agricultural research and promotion of excellence required for EU integration

QUALITY

Issues

The two core institutions requiring the greatest inputs to meet Kosovo’s 21st century agricultural demands are FAUP and MAFRD. MAFRD depends on FAUP for the majority of its staffing requirements, and the workforce supply coming from FAUP, like that in other sectors, is large, growing and of generally poor quality. Moreover, FAUP is not providing the practical technical skills to its students that are in demand by family farm and public and private sector employers such as MAFRD and small and large agri-businesses. While higher secondary VET schools provide more practical training, it is inadequate for demand. Furthermore, almost 60 percent of VET graduates are not finding employment or further education opportunities, although many are returning to their family farms.8

The Faculty of Agriculture and Veterinary Studies in Prishtina is the only institution involved in higher education in agriculture. It is responsible for teaching, research and transfer of knowledge to future agricultural experts. However, FAUP poorly serves the other key institutes in the agriculture sector. Its departments often have only very basic facilities and equipment and its faculty positions are understaffed. Where suitable equipment is present, it is often not in operation.

Due to the inadequacies of the academic staff and educational curriculum, Ph.D. students are sent abroad and educational programs are provided only for B.Sc. and M.Sc. levels. While these offerings are

8 See recent tracer study for agriculture VET graduates, Monitoring the Progress in the Secondary Vocational Schools of Agriculture, MEST/DANIDA, 2011; courtesy Kurt Nielsen, Senior Vocational Education Advisor, MEST/Danida Cooperation Office; data suggest that unemployment among agriculture graduates is somewhat less than for youth in the same age cohort.
appropriate, these lower level programs should provide students with the necessary knowledge and skills to participate in state-of-the-art fundamental and applied scientific research methods.

**MAFRD and GoK Laboratory Systems** is the other key institution involved in agriculture that cannot achieve its potential at present for several key reasons. First, MAFRD, while headed by a dynamic young and highly professional Minister, has a staff that lacks adequate training and practical experience. Cooperation between the MAFRD institutes and institutes of other Ministries, and with FAUP, is weak, absent or entangled in competence quarrels. The Institutes under MAFRD, the Prime Minister’s Office, and the Ministries of Public Health and Faculty of Agriculture are neither coordinated nor accredited for ISO 17025, ISO 9000 or ISTA. These Institutes have non-existent, minimal or insufficient investments, skills and equipment, particularly in state-of-the-art molecular detection and identification methods required for good laboratory analyses, which has become common practice in EU statutory laboratories—both in veterinary and plant health.

In spite of these obstacles facing the agricultural sector, and with considerable assistance from the EU and the United States, much has been achieved since the end of the war. Legislation is mostly in place and frequently harmonized with the EU, and the Ministry of Agriculture has been re-established with strengthened leadership. The Faculty of Agriculture is functional with improved facilities and many new, young staff. Laboratories and institutes have been partially restored and equipped, mainly with donor aid from USAID, Helvetas, Swiss Intercooperation, GIZ, and others. Finally, advisory/extension services have been re-established and decentralized to the municipal level.

**INNOVATION**

This section brings together the recommended interventions with expected results in Alignment and Quality. With (1) increased Alignment of the Agriculture, Government and the Education Sectors, (2) relevant Quality skills provided with training, advanced degrees, certificates, through FAUP and VET schools; and (3) HICD support for the key institutions—MAFRD and FAUP, the agriculture sector will be better prepared to meet current and future demands for the advancement of the rural sector and promotion of major increases in productivity and sales of agriculture products in both domestic and EU markets. The major innovation that will drive these positive changes is a University of Prishtina Agricultural Consortium.

**Intervention: The University of Prishtina Agricultural Consortium**

To meet the needs of both MAFRD and the country’s agricultural sector as a whole, this assessment—endorsed by the Minister of Agriculture, Dean of the FAUP, and leading agriculture authorities—concludes that University of Prishtina’s Faculty of Agriculture must become the center, the node of a national and international network with the mission to design a long-term strategy and explicit action plan to make FAUP into a high quality, internationally recognized university faculty.

Under an HICD institutional development framework built around the overall capacity development of the University of Prishtina as a whole, the program for agriculture should be built through an international university consortium partnership program involving leading U.S. land-grant institutions.

This agricultural university consortium should provide an active program of faculty, staff and student exchanges for at least 20 faculty members from Kosovo and the United States under programs of at least 3 to 5 months’ duration. For a period of five years, training should be included for at least five Master’s degrees annually, including practical internships, apprenticeships and mentoring.

Additional provisions should be explored for bringing the most talented faculty to the Ph.D. level in order to upgrade the Faculty to University status during the period of the partnership consortia.
**U.S./Kosovo University Partnerships**

Within this umbrella framework, a consortium of world-class agricultural universities should be engaged to collaborate to transform the Faculty of Agriculture into a first-class, land-grant type institution that combines teaching, research and extension (advisory services).

This initiative should seek to establish and/or encourage development of a network of high-quality research institutes and Think Tanks within Kosovo through an HICD framework. This framework should create institution-building partnerships with U.S. and international universities and build strong links with MAFRD. The partnerships should specifically foster strong connections with farmers—something U.S. universities are very good at doing—by helping develop strong (extension) advisory services that build on the proven U.S. land-grant type formula. The crucial three-legged stool of teaching, research and extension is fundamental to this model, which brought about the Green Revolution in Asia that transformed a food-deficit continent into a net exporter within one generation.

**Interventions under the Consortium Initiative**

**Intervention 1: Engage HICD support for instituting improved management skills.** These skills can effectively address the urgent need for change that will fulfill a vision that will determine the direction of restructuring, new facilities, equipment, and staffing.

**Intervention 2: Develop strong extension/advisory services.** Train field advisors, veterinarians, producers, and students of FAUP to provide strong outreach/extension/advisory services.

**Intervention 3: Bring focus on research.** Assist FAUP to concentrate on pure and applied research and training to feed institutes with qualified staff. It should not perform routine testing.

**Intervention 4: Bring focus on quality education and staff.** Support FAUP to focus on quality education and provide internationally trained, competent staff.

**Intervention 5: Train FAUP’s scientific departments to conduct fundamental and applied research** to educate B.Sc., M.Sc. and Ph.D. students and feed agencies and laboratories with appropriate information and scientists.

**Intervention 6: Restructure KIA and KFVA to function as national reference laboratories and IVE and FI to focus mainly on field diagnostic expertise, sending complex samples to KIA.**

**Intervention 7: Promote applied research** to support diagnostic activities and to respond to problems occurring in practice as identified by the field advisory service, inspectors and/or growers themselves.

**Intervention 8: Train staff to replace or add competent, well-trained personnel** in the neglected fields of plant health and molecular identification/diagnosis and training, and redirect and reinstruct their staff as required.

**Intervention 9: Actively engage with producers, growers, farmers, private agricultural enterprises, and the processing industry** to provide first line education and support for field advisors and veterinarians.

**Results**

If carefully implemented through a well-conceived and managed HICD process, the results from this proposed core intervention should include increased quality of faculty, research, teaching, student performance and concrete, practical skills.
In terms of return on investment, global research on educational partnerships reveals that the most successful involve cost-sharing among all parties. This typically generates funding that at least equals that provided by the donor. Furthermore, once partnerships are established, the parties typically join forces to seek additional funding to support the activities that emerge from the cross-fertilization and stimulus that come from faculty and student exchanges and lead to proposals for new initiatives beyond the original scope of work, innovative research proposals, and opportunities to bring about further positive change. These efforts can yield leveraged funding from externals sources that continues after project completion and frequently amounts to at least double—and often as much as seven times—the original funding.

Long range outcomes that can be anticipated will include significant increases in the productivity of the farming sector, increased exports, and increased rural incomes, leading to reduction of rural poverty, reduced urban migration, and enhanced social stability. The potential for Kosovo’s own Green Revolution is considerable.

**Performance Indicators**

The following are specific performance indicators for strategic governance university partnerships. These, and other recommended performance indicators, are elaborated on in the full report.

- Independence of higher education (network) governance; roles and responsibilities not entwined creating conflict of interest
- Governing bodies have wide societal representation, keyed to achieving outcomes for value and contribution to Kosovo’s social and economic development
- Strategic plan for 10-year period (design programs to last past 5-year funding)
- Identify skills, requirements for economic growth, over 5-10 years
- Balance theory and practicum—field activities, internships, apprenticeships
- Initial concept is developed by Kosovo faculty, university
- MOU signed among partners
- Cost share/GoK/University contributions
- Leveraged funding generated by partners from other resources
- Indicators linked to national and agricultural development goals
- Partnerships are built on land-grant model (research-teaching-extension/outreach); partnerships include provision for each of the three critical components: research, teaching, extension/community outreach
- Joint research and publications conducted by Kosovar and U.S. faculty
- Faculty and student exchanges
- Gender and minority equity provisions
- Private sector active engagement
- Practical and professional skills
- Links established with regional, international institutions, EU partners
### Table 4. Gap Analysis of Agriculture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSTITUTIONS</th>
<th>GAP</th>
<th>CORE INTERVENTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Rural Development (MAFRD) | Leadership and most legislation in place for harmonization with EU, but MAFRD suffers from **severe lack of:** | ● Restructure Kosovo agri-rural sector in line with that of the EU  
● Increase government budget to MAFRD and agriculture sector  
● Create/strengthen links with FAUP to train staff for MAFRD  
● Strengthen, train, shift extension/advisory to MAFRD (in process)  
● Fund/support strengthening and reorganization of laboratories, applied research and diagnostic services; improve links with advisory services  
● Improve/strengthen data gathering capacity of diagnostic services |
| ● Coordination and linkages with EU agriculture institutions  
● Strong links with FAUP, laboratories, international ag networks  
● Competent and adequately trained and experienced staff  
● Professional extension/advisory services (under Municipalities)  
● Capacity and focus on applied research and diagnostic services |
| Faculty of Agriculture and Veterinary (FAUP) | FAUP is the only institution for higher education in agriculture but quality of education mediocre to poor due to: | ● Undertake major strengthening of FAUP through comprehensive U.S. & EU partnerships incl. scholarships, faculty & student exchange  
● Focus on quality education with internationally trained, competent staff  
● Create new/missing departments/programs in critical areas  
● Strengthen research through training and international linkages  
● Provide practical, hands-on training, experience in laboratories and in the field with farmers & agri-business |
| ● Lack of necessary disciplines/faculty/programs for critical subj.  
● Lack of practical training, research facilities, teaching methods  
● Lack of professional academic staff  
● Weak links with agribusiness sector & international research |
| Institutes & Laboratories: e.g., Agriculture (KIA); Forestry; Vineyard; Livestock; & Veterinary | These multiple institutes/laboratories are badly coordinated under multiple ministries; face major shortcomings: | ● Strengthen staff & equipment of diagnostic departments/labs  
● Reorganize for coordination under lead of MAFRD, link with FAUP  
● Link with and train field extension staff, inspectors, farmers and private sector advisory services  
● Promote internships, apprenticeships, international partnerships  
● Support development, strengthening of critical institutes for livestock breeding, forest protection, disease and pest control  
● Enhance coordination/linkages with EU and international agriculture research networks and organizations |
| ● Generally institutes are severely understaffed; present staff is insufficiently educated/trained; severely under paid  
● Disparity among institutes: from well-equipped to very poor  
● Systematic surveying/monitoring for pests, diseases, border control weak to non-existent in several institutes  
● Most face severe work overload for current & growth needs  
● Generally poorly equipped to meet EU demands |
| Advisory/Extension services | Weak GoK extension/advisory service decentralized to municipalities, impeding efficiency and needed linkages, including: | ● Shift Extension Service back to Ministry [In process]  
● Develop strong links with FAUP under proven Land Grant model  
● Increase number and training of advisors to reach most farmers  
● Train/provide specialists in key fields, e.g., Farm Management, Agro-economy, Postharvest, Food technology, Processing, Plant Protection, Livestock/Dairy, Disease/Pest Control, Marketing, Non wood forest products |
| ● Poor/no links MAFRD, FAUP, labs, institutes, int’l/EU networks  
● Minimal private advisory services from input suppliers, private veterinarians, some local consultants; poor links to GoK service  
● Advisors have general knowledge, not specializations required |
Conclusion—Building Partnerships that Last

Proposed Critical Keystone Intervention

This assessment concludes that a multi-faceted, strategic, and systemic solution built around the HICD process yields an effective approach and a true opportunity for success. At the heart of the proposed solution is the development of a university-based strategic planning and performance management process in order to reverse the vicious cycle that plagues the public university system in Kosovo. This directly addresses the fundamental issues of educational governance for Kosovo’s higher education network through partnership with a high-level university consortium. This solution is coupled with HICD interventions within GoK institutions to create, over time, a modern, effective and autonomous higher education system for public and private institutions in which the University of Prishtina becomes a first class public university, and perhaps reinvents itself to become the University of Kosovo. As such, UP evolves into the apex of a system that provides guidance, support and uniform standards for all institutions of higher education.

The analysis further recognizes that the value of all educational degrees feeding into the university, coupled with the “best practice” approach to university partnerships, improves the baseline as well as the critical mass necessary to complete and secure results. The Results Framework recognizes that the excellence of an educational system underpins a nation’s development. Parallel to this is the supporting/accompanying set of mechanisms to build enabling institutional systems, processes and performance in key sectors to accommodate new leaders.

It is not the leadership that is the end result, but the impact it will make through the Kosovar institutions. Education and implementing institutions feed each other, and addressing half the equation will not solve or sustain reform or progress. The set of interventions this assessment has identified for institutional support are not currently being met and are required.

Strategy and Governance for Higher Education: Some Options for Further Exploration and Discussion

Discussions among Team members, identified transformational leaders, or “Stars,” and a number of thoughtful leaders interviewed during the sector reviews suggest that the core issues of strategy and governance around university partnerships would be greatly enhanced by the establishment of an oversight body at the highest level of government. Given the United States’ unique relationship with GoK, it is worth exploring a joint initiative for reviewing the higher education sector as a whole, while also building the Education, Mining and Engineering Sectors into long-range plans.

One idea is to explore the potential of a national Presidential commission for higher education to kick-start, oversee and guide a broader initiative of reform and development that engages a consortium of U.S. and EU universities. Three options for further exploration and discussion:

- At the Ambassadorial and Presidential/Prime Minister level: Create and sign a joint agreement/Memorandum of Understanding to convene a high-level commission or panel to oversee the advancement of higher education as a whole.9

- At the highest level of the higher education system: Transform/update/restructure existing education oversight boards/commissions to become an appropriate high-level body to oversee the advancement of higher education.

---

9 Such high level agreements could potentially draw on the strong ties between the U.S. and Kosovo that are symbolized by the monuments and street names honoring President Clinton as well as recent remarks by Secretary of State Clinton promoting increased support for “development,” including a call to “promote effective institutional capacity at national and local levels.” Agreements could also include the personal involvement of the President or retired President of a major U.S. university. An expression of interest of one such institution and its President is included in the annex to the Agriculture Sector Report.
• At the university level: Work with the advisory and governing boards of public higher education institutions to develop a framework for creating a national university of Kosovo as the apex of a higher education network that oversees, monitors, and sets standards for the advancement of higher education including but not limited to the fields of agriculture, rule of law, public administration and information technology.

Whatever approach is taken around strategy and governance, it is recommended that proposed interventions consider:

• Presidential leadership
• Clear criteria for nomination and selection of members—to include women, minorities, civil society, private sector, students
• Appointment from the bottom up rather than top down—nominations from civil society and private sector associations, organization and/or networks
• Autonomy from government or political control— independent from the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and the Kosovo Accreditation Agency, but working in close collaboration with them

The process envisioned here is not limited to USAID and explicitly encourages participation of EU donors, universities and other public and private institutions to enhance progress toward EU integration across the board, including recognition of UP degrees across Europe.

ANTICIPATED OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS

The outcome of this process can leave Kosovo with practical educational tracks within and outside university systems, yielding increased readiness for employment of graduates and the engagement of women and minorities. It provides for the active participation of the private sector and civil society for the promotion of social equity and dialogue. The recommended interventions will strengthen the quality of teaching, research and community outreach and create an environment in which new transformational leaders can help Kosovo achieve its national development goals.

Partner universities and their faculties from developed countries, especially in subject areas crucial to Kosovo’s development, should understand that their assistance must be delivered in a unique social and cultural context in Kosovo. On the other side of the equation, Kosovo’s universities, rectors and professors also need to start frank discussions with American and EU counterparts, from their first interactions, about the conditions for successful cooperation. From the beginning, host country leaders, at the highest level possible, need to take initiative in the creation of partnerships, to build in constructive feedback and course-correcting mechanisms to ensure that their voices are heard throughout the life of the partnerships—and beyond.

All challenges can be overcome, but not with email, phone calls, or one- or two-day visits. They require the development of relationships built and maintained over time—relationships that are founded on friendship, trust and mutual respect that come with shared experiences, disagreements, conversations and collaborative research and problem solving. All of that is demanding, but eminently achievable.10 Drawing on the lessons learned from the more than half a century of experience documented in the research accompanying this assessment, the talented leaders of today’s universities have a unique opportunity. With the implementation of transparent, professional, and efficient Human and Institutional Capacity Development interventions, together they can lay the foundation for a new generation of sustainable educational partnerships that prepare the nation and its students for the challenges of the global economy.