



Counter-Trafficking in Persons Field Guide

January 2023

This publication was produced by the Center for Democracy, Human Rights, and Governance in the Bureau for Development, Democracy, and Innovation within the United States Agency for International Development.

On the cover: After Aditi was rescued from traffickers, she spent time at a shelter run by a local partner of USAID’s Bangladesh Counter-Trafficking in Persons (BC/TIP) project, where she received counseling and job training. The project helps victims regain confidence and purpose. Aditi found her purpose in the project-affiliated survivors’ group ANIRBAN, which means “the flame that never dies.” More than 800 trafficking survivors like Aditi have found a place to heal and start a new life through BC/TIP. Photo courtesy of Misty Keasler, Winrock International.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- ACRONYMS** **4**
- FOREWORD** **5**
- INTRODUCTION** **6**
- I. DEFINING TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS** **8**
- II. USAID’S FRAMEWORK FOR COUNTERING TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS** **10**
 - 4 Ps Framework** **10**
 - Programming Objectives** **11**
- ANNEX A. FORMS OF TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS** **16**
- ANNEX B. INFLUENCES OF SUPPLY AND DEMAND** **20**
- ANNEX C. C-TIP REGULATIONS, POLICIES, AND PROCEDURES** **23**
- ANNEX D. MONITORING, EVALUATION, AND LEARNING FOR C-TIP INTEGRATION** **24**
- ANNEX E. ILLUSTRATIVE RESULTS FRAMEWORK: THE 4PS PARADIGM** **29**
 - Prevention** **33**
 - Protection** **47**
 - Prosecution** **60**
 - Partnerships** **66**

ACRONYMS

ADS	USAID Automated Directives System
CSO	Civil Society Organization
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
C-TIP	Counter-Trafficking in Persons
DO	Development Objective
DOS	United States Department of State
FY	Fiscal Year
IDP	Internally Displaced Person
ILO	International Labour Organization
IR	Intermediate Results
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NAP	National Action Plan
NRM	National Referral Mechanism
OIG	USAID Office of Inspector General
PPP	Public-Private Partnerships
SOP	Standard Operating Procedure
T2WL	Tier 2 Watch List
TIP	Trafficking in Persons
TVPA	Trafficking Victims Protection Act
TVPRA	Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act
UNICEF	United Nations Children’s Fund
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USG	United States Government

FOREWORD

Trafficking in Persons (TIP) is estimated to be a \$150 billion business that derails sustainable development and the protection of human rights globally. While this problem is extremely complex and we must have the humility to accept that no single action alone will have a satisfactory impact, the cost of doing nothing is too great.



Vulnerability to trafficking is heightened when the sectors USAID seeks to support fail to benefit and include the most marginalized. As development practitioners, we must ask ourselves how much success we are having in our economic growth, democracy, education, or health programs if human trafficking is destroying the lives of those in vulnerable situations? The plight of trafficked persons is, in part, a result of our development failures, and the impact of this will affect us all.

The multi-dimensional nature of this complex problem begs for a holistic approach. USAID has technical expertise across a wide range of sectors which allows us to operate in such a manner. Our comparative advantage in the fight against human trafficking is our diverse partnership of stakeholders, such as host governments, civil society organizations, survivors, media, and the private sector. We have a presence in origin, transit, and destination countries, which means we can provide Counter-Trafficking in Persons (C-TIP) interventions throughout the trafficking chain. Our local staff provide in-country expertise and important cultural context. Our commitment to a survivor-centered approach means that our ultimate goal is to empower individuals and help them forge a new path born of healing. To maximize our impact, we need to grow the cadre of C-TIP champions who can continue to raise this topic across our work.

During my career as a Foreign Service Officer, I have been touched by the stories of people who were seeking better opportunities for themselves and for their families but instead were exploited and fell victim to human traffickers. These stories have fueled my desire to seek justice for trafficking survivors, many of whom are migrants and/or from other groups at risk of exploitation that are increasingly becoming commodified. I hope that this Field Guide will inspire you and provide the tools needed to design activities that will combat this heinous crime. Collectively we can help address one of the worst rights violations that anyone could endure and bring hope to survivors as they rebuild their lives.

Clinton D. White

Clinton D. White
Agency Counselor

INTRODUCTION

Trafficking in Persons (TIP) is a gross violation of human rights, including the right to life, liberty, and security, and the right to be free from torture and/or cruel, inhumane, and degrading treatment or punishment. It erodes the safety of communities, the security of borders, the strength of the economy, and the rule of law. TIP weakens state institutions and feeds corruption. In places where organized crime dominates, it negatively impacts the development goals we are trying to achieve.

In 2022, the International Labour Organization (ILO) estimated that 27.6 million people were in forced labor: approximately 17.3 million in private sector areas such as domestic work, construction, and/or agriculture; 6.3 million (including children) in forced commercial sexual exploitation; and 3.9 million people subjected to forced labor by state authorities.¹

Globally, human trafficking is a low-risk, high-reward crime for perpetrators, who profit extensively from the exploitation of others with minimal risk of prosecution. Demand for cheap labor and commercial sexual exploitation creates conditions that facilitate human trafficking, particularly when coupled with the absence of proactive efforts to protect human rights or respond to abuses. Additional drivers of mobility that increase risk to trafficking include climate change impacts, conflict, corruption, socioeconomic and structural inequalities, institutional racism, natural disasters, and practices that discriminate against the most marginalized groups in society. On the supply side, gender inequality, deception by brokers, the complicity of authorities, a lack of monitoring of employers, high costs of education, a lack of job opportunities, and a lack of basic social services create conditions that exacerbate the vulnerability of some adults and children.

For the past 20 years, USAID has demonstrated its commitment to combating TIP through more than \$340 million invested in over 88 countries to prevent trafficking, protect victims, and prosecute perpetrators. As we look to the next generation of USAID efforts in this space, we will build on what works and establish new effective practices based on evidence and learning.

Since the publication of the last USAID C-TIP Field Guide in 2013, the U.S. Government has bolstered its efforts to counter human trafficking through many initiatives. The new [National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking](#), released in December 2021, is a comprehensive and forward-looking strategy with over 60 priority actions focused on the foundational pillars of U.S. and global anti-trafficking efforts – prevention, protection, prosecution, and partnerships. That same month, USAID published its [revised C-TIP Policy](#), reinforcing the same strategy for the Agency.

Purpose and Organization of the Field Guide

This updated Field Guide serves as a reference tool and practical resource for USAID staff to help implement the revised C-TIP Policy programming objectives as new C-TIP activities are designed. It provides Agency-specific guidance to USAID personnel for integrating C-TIP components into existing programs, options for stand-alone C-TIP initiatives, and suggestions on monitoring and evaluating the impact of specific programming interventions. In addition, this Guide emphasizes the importance of uniting all stakeholders, with empowered survivors at the forefront. The main body of the document outlines USAID's framework to address TIP, while the annexes provide practical illustrative activities to help guide program design.

This Guide is part of a larger collection of USAID tools and resources aimed at strengthening our

¹ This estimate does not include those trapped in forced/child marriage.

ability to combat trafficking. As the root causes of human trafficking are manifold and include climate change impacts, lack of educational opportunities, conflict, corruption, socioeconomic and structural inequalities, institutional racism, natural disasters, and practices that discriminate against the most marginalized groups in society, this Guide will be complemented by additional resources that provide guidance on how to integrate C-TIP interventions across USAID programs. All of these resources are meant to utilize a whole-of-government approach in integrating C-TIP strategies into programs in other sectors to reduce trafficking, avoid unintended negative consequences, and improve broader development outcomes.

This Field Guide is organized into the following parts:

- **Section 1** defines the crime of TIP.
- **Section 2** provides USAID's framework for countering TIP, including the programming objectives from the revised C-TIP Policy.
- **Annex A** describes different forms of TIP, as well as what is not defined as trafficking.
- **Annex B** discusses specific supply and demand factors that may shape trafficking in a country or region.
- **Annex C** provides a brief overview of the prohibitions against behaviors that facilitate or support TIP through the Code of Conduct and in agency award requirements for contractors, recipients, and sub-awardees, as well as their employees and agents.
- **Annexes D and E** provide comprehensive programming objectives and illustrative activities within the areas of prevention, protection, prosecution, and partnerships.

I. DEFINING TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS

Trafficking in Persons is defined through two primary legal instruments, the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons (Palermo Protocol) and the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 (TVPA). The Palermo Protocol was adopted by the UN as the main instrument that provides an internationally recognized definition of human trafficking. The TVPA is the US legal framework which directs federally funded counter-trafficking programs.

The Palermo Protocol defines human trafficking as:

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.²

The Protocol also clarifies that the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring, or receipt of an individual under the age of 18 for the purpose of exploitation is considered TIP, even if none of the means listed above (force, coercion, abduction, etc.) are involved.³ Therefore, according to the Protocol, minors in commercial sex work are considered trafficking victims. By definition, they cannot have consented to commercial sex work. Although the Protocol focuses on transnational crime, it requires signatory countries to criminalize TIP through national legislation, even in cases where there is no trans-border movement.⁴ Trafficking can occur inside a country or even within a single town. Movement (whether transnational or otherwise), while often a component of trafficking, is not a necessary element. The presence of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of exploitation is a necessary element of TIP.

The TVPA defines “severe forms of trafficking in persons” in the following terms:

- “Sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age; or

² United Nations General Assembly. 2000. *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*. New York, N.Y., Article 3(a).

<https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/protocoltraffickinginpersons.aspx>

³ Ibid. Article 3c-d.

⁴ Ibid. Article 5; United Nations. 2000. *United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*. New York, N.Y.,

https://www.unodc.org/documents/middleeastandnorthafrica/organised-crime/UNITED_NATIONS_CONVENTION_AGAINST_TRANSNATIONAL_ORGANIZED_CRIME_AND_THE_PROTOCOLS_THEREO.pdf and Article 34 (2); United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC). 2004. *Legislative Guides for the Implementation of the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocol Thereto*. New York, N.Y.,

https://www.unodc.org/pdf/crime/legislative_guides/Legislative%20guides_Full%20version.pdf, p. 9–11 and 276–77.

- The recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.”⁵

Additional information on what does and does not constitute human trafficking can be found in **Annex A**.

⁵ TVPA, Pub. L. No. 106-386, 106th Cong., H.R. 3244 (October 28, 2000), §103(8). <http://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/PLAW-106publ386/pdf/PLAW-106publ386.pdf>. In 2000, the United Nations General Assembly adopted the [Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children](#) (referred to as the Palermo Protocol), which came into force on December 24, 2003. The goals of the protocol are to prevent and combat trafficking in persons; to protect and assist the victims of such trafficking; and to promote cooperation among States Parties in order to meet those objectives.

II. USAID’S FRAMEWORK FOR COUNTERING TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS

USAID’s revised C-TIP Policy highlights a commitment to partnering with trafficking survivors to develop government policy and programs, addressing how migration and climate change can render people vulnerable to trafficking, and promoting partnerships with all sectors of society to build the local capacity needed to address this human rights abuse.

Through the revised C-TIP Policy, USAID aims to achieve the following outcomes:

- Improve the integration of survivor-centered approaches into programs and policies to contribute to the empowerment of the individuals and communities we serve;
- Partner with host country governments, civil society, and the private sector to counter human trafficking;
- Enhance coordination within USAID and with the USG interagency;
- Draw on the best available evidence; and
- Provide clear roles and responsibilities for staff across USAID to implement effective C-TIP programming.

The revised C-TIP Policy builds on principles set forth in the TVPA and subsequent reauthorizations and adheres to the standards in the Palermo Protocol. The Policy is informed by the 4Ps paradigm of Prevention, Protection, Prosecution, and Partnership, which are briefly defined below.

4 Ps Framework

The 4Ps framework — Prevention, Protection, Prosecution, and Partnerships — continues to serve as the fundamental framework used around the world to combat TIP. The section below provides an introduction to this framework, and **Annex E** provides a detailed list of illustrative activities and indicators to design program interventions using this approach.

Prevention. Prevention starts with USAID and its implementing partners adopting safeguarding measures—whether policies, codes of conduct, training, risk analysis and mitigation, or other measures—to proactively identify and respond to potential TIP risks across all operations. Prevention programs include:

- Increasing public awareness of human trafficking and reporting mechanisms in source, transit, and destination countries
- Promoting social and behavioral change to address harmful social norms and behaviors
- Supporting initiatives to strengthen families and communities to prevent the trafficking of children or their placement in institutions
- Eliminating recruitment fees
- Implementing strong national action plans to counter human trafficking

Protection. Protection is the cornerstone of a survivor-centered approach. USAID aims to strengthen judicial and non-judicial measures to provide redress to victims of human rights abuses, end impunity and seek accountability for perpetrators, and potentially deter future violations. Protection programs include:

- Improving victim identification and reporting of crimes
- Developing national and regional referral mechanisms that ensure survivors are safe
- Supporting services that provide shelter, food, counseling, health care, legal assistance, and repatriation and reintegration services

Prosecution. The low rate of TIP prosecutions and convictions worldwide indicates a need for increased anti-corruption and law enforcement efforts and resources. Prosecution programs include:

- Developing anti-trafficking laws with strong criminal penalties
- Providing trauma-informed and victim-centered training to law enforcement officers, prosecutors, civil society organizations, and judges

Partnerships. Successful efforts to counter TIP require effective coordination across a broad range of stakeholders. Partnerships and coordinating bodies bring together local, national, regional, and global networks; survivors and their communities; and representatives of civil society, government, the private sector, labor unions and other types of worker organizations, media, and faith-based organizations.

Programming Objectives

While the four Ps framework is used as the foundational approach for C-TIP projects, the revised C-TIP Policy outlines the programming objectives that serve as the core themes to be woven throughout USAID's C-TIP activities and initiatives. These objectives include: 1) Increased Integration of C-TIP into USAID's Initiatives and Programs; 2) Improved Opportunities for Survivor Engagement; 3) Improved Application of Monitoring, Learning, and Evaluation of C-TIP; 4) Strengthened Relationships with Host Governments, Civil Society, and the Private Sector; and 5) Strategic C-TIP Investments in Targeted Countries. The objectives, along with questions to consider when designing programs, and program examples are described below.

1. Increased Integration of C-TIP into USAID's Initiatives and Programs

C-TIP activities should be integrated into specific sector portfolios where appropriate, either because activities in these sectors can play a key role in reducing vulnerability or because these sectors may be at risk for facilitating trafficking. Sectors that can contribute to combating human trafficking may include agriculture, democracy, human rights and governance, economic growth, education, health, environmental and natural resource management, and humanitarian assistance. Moreover, USAID Missions in countries ranked on Tiers 1 and 2 in the TIP Report should still consider integrating C-TIP prevention activities in their programming and strategies to ensure ongoing attention and accountability to the issue, especially where TIP prevalence is high. Missions can monitor and evaluate C-TIP either as a cross-cutting theme or as an integrated component of a

In **Ghana**, USAID commissioned a study to understand child labor in agriculture. It informed the design of an activity in the Ghana Fisheries Recovery Activity, to combat harmful child labor and trafficking in the fishing sector through behavior change communications, policy development, and livelihoods support in target communities.

project.

Questions to consider:

- Is there an assessment available that outlines the key drivers and flows of trafficking, which could inform different intervention responses?
- Does the available data on TIP show that trafficking is occurring in sectors where USAID currently has programming, such as agriculture, tourism, etc? If yes, consider integrating activities to detect and prevent TIP into those projects (a list of illustrative C-TIP activities can be found in **Annex E**).
- Does the proposed activity require a specialized understanding of counter-trafficking approaches, such as providing trauma-informed care to survivors? Or will the activity rely on other technical approaches, such as social behavior change communications or income generation, where the outcome is meant to reduce vulnerability? Depending on the outcome to be achieved, it may be easier to adapt existing projects to embed a targeted C-TIP activity than creating a new standalone project.

2. Improved Opportunities for Survivor Engagement

USAID takes an inclusive approach to ensure sustainable development, engaging vulnerable and marginalized populations. A survivor-informed approach incorporates the perspectives and knowledge of trafficking survivors into the design and implementation of C-TIP programs and policies that affect them.

To ensure the safety and well-being prioritized by the C-TIP Policy, USAID has identified successful strategies to integrate C-TIP into a variety of projects and elevate the voices of survivors to inform policies and programming. Using a survivor-centered approach to inform programming helps to build effective services for physical, psychological, and emotional healing; deliver legal assistance that meets the needs of survivors; provide safe and secure accommodations; and offer access to workforce development opportunities.

In **Bangladesh**, USAID's Counter Trafficking-in-Persons (BC/TIP) project provided counseling, entrepreneurship, job and life skills training, loan support, and awareness raising activities to empower trafficking survivors to regain agency over their lives. As a result of this support, survivors formed a nationally recognized survivor advocacy group which gave survivors a greater voice in promoting C-TIP activities in Bangladesh.

Questions to consider:

- What mechanisms are available to ensure that survivors are fairly compensated when providing their perspectives?
- What survivor-led or survivor-oriented civil society organizations (CSOs) operate in your context, who could be called on for input?
- How can projects be designed so that implementers commit to capacity building for survivor-led organizations that may have a harder time meeting procurement rules?

3. Improved Application of Monitoring, Evaluation, and Learning of C-TIP

In the **Democratic Republic of the Congo**, USAID's counter-gender based violence (GBV) program, *Tushinde Ujeuri*, an integrated health and conflict mitigation activity, assisted thousands of survivors of gender-based violence through the provision of legal services and rehabilitation and reintegration services, such as training of healthcare providers on identification of victims of human trafficking and gathering data on trafficking reported through service provider intake surveys.

USAID draws on past practice to incorporate new methodologies and quantitative approaches into activities to capture results, effectiveness, and impact of C-TIP interventions and promote learning. Specifically, Missions are encouraged to: (1) increase the use of survey data to guide the design of C-TIP programs; and (2) improve monitoring and evaluation of C-TIP programs. USAID partners with the USG interagency, academic institutions, and the private sector to access innovative studies, evaluations, literature, and evidence reviews to provide relevant C-TIP information and data.

The majority of numbers currently reported on trafficking are not derived using rigorous research methodology. Both trafficking survivors and perpetrators are difficult to identify and track and even more difficult to quantify. To address this issue, officials responsible for data collection, including law enforcement, medical and social service providers, court personnel, and immigration officials should be trained on data collection protocol, and standardizing when and how specific data is collected and to whom it is reported. Additionally, data collection from survivors can be helpful in providing important contextual insight on trafficking patterns and situations.

Questions to consider:

- What C-TIP assessments for the country currently exist, including assessments done by the annual State Department TIP report?
- When designing an evaluation, what is the existing baseline knowledge on trafficking? Questions that assess this include: What are the key forms of TIP in a country/region? What are the specific characteristics of vulnerability to TIP in a country/region?
- What sources of raw data on trafficking currently exist for the country/region? Can these data sources be aggregated?
- When direct data on TIP is not available, what types of proxy data are available?

4. Strengthened Relationships with Host Governments, Civil Society, and the Private Sector

There is no single entity — whether survivors, government, civil society organization, private sector actor, or researcher — that can effectively combat a crime as complex as trafficking alone. Successful efforts require effective coordination across a broad range of stakeholders. Partnerships and coordinating bodies should focus on bringing together local, national and regional networks.

This process requires engaging and leveraging partners to elevate innovative solutions to these

SALT, a public-private partnership between USAID, the Walton Family, Packard, and Moore Foundations, is a global alliance to promote sustainable fisheries through improved transparency in seafood supply chains. SALT addresses labor trafficking and human rights by deepening an understanding of how electronic catch documentation and traceability can support human and labor rights for all seafood workers.

longstanding TIP obstacles.

Questions to consider:

- Who are the key stakeholders involved in combating trafficking in a given country or region (including stakeholders who are tasked to prevent TIP, protect survivors, and prosecute traffickers)?
- If TIP is occurring in particular industries, who are the key private companies that operate in the industry that can lead on addressing TIP in their supply chain?
- Are survivors groups and networks included as leading voices in partnerships and compensated for their time?
- Do stakeholders have the technical capacity to counter TIP?
- Is there a clear understanding among partners of each other's strengths and contributions towards achieving common goals?

5. *Strategic C-TIP Investments in Targeted Countries*

In **Colombia**, Conectando Caminos por los Derechos (CCD) supports medium and long-term development for Venezuelan migrants, Colombian returnees and receptor communities in Colombia. The Activity is based on a three-pronged approach that provides local committee advocacy, inter/intra-institutional coordination strengthening, and capacity strengthening for addressing TIP across CCD's 10 prioritized urban geographies, where over 60 percent of migrants and Colombian returnees reside. This approach is also complemented by three cross-cutting components: communications; capacity development; and monitoring, evaluation, and learning.

USAID prioritizes investments in countries where they can have the most impact. These may include countries of global strategic importance, those with significant trafficking problems, and where USAID has a presence. In particular, USAID programming should prioritize C-TIP activities in countries that have been ranked as Tier 2 Watchlist or Tier 3 in the annual TIP Report, given that countries with this ranking either have a significant number of trafficking victims and/or the government has failed to provide evidence that it is making significant efforts to address TIP. These countries often set negative norms on C-TIP in their regions, requiring both an internal (within a country's borders) and

external (regional) context for successful interventions. Other factors to consider include USG interagency C-TIP programming, conflict and crisis in the country or region, disasters, pandemics, and other unforeseen events.

In order to effectively tackle the issue, regional programming may be considered to bring together countries that are affected by the same or similar trafficking trends, particularly countries placed on the Tier 2 Watchlist. Regional initiatives and programs play a crucial role in ensuring that the systems built in single-country programs are able to coordinate with and positively influence each other. Past USAID regional C-TIP programs have linked National Referral Mechanisms, supported safe migration through innovative communications campaigns that target persons vulnerable to trafficking and help understand big picture trends that drive demand for goods and services produced by trafficked victims. Additional benefits of regional programming include increasing collaboration between governments, strengthening security in border regions, enhancing civil society, and enabling businesses to monitor and prevent TIP and the exploitation of vulnerable workers from recruitment to employment. Regional projects can also assist with pooling financial and personnel resources; facilitating the sharing of best practices (e.g.,

improving the framework for legal migration); and tapping into U.S. interagency cooperation and expertise.

Questions to consider:

- What best practices from similarly-situated countries and regions can be applied?
- What previous donor investments have been made to combat TIP in a given country or region? If there has been significant investment, how can activities shift towards sustainability of efforts? If TIP is an emerging issue, what assessments are available to inform applying best practices from other similarly situated countries or regions?
- If trafficking patterns involve movement, such as significant levels of emigration or immigration, what other countries are involved in the chain of trafficking? How could regional programming impact C-TIP efforts in origin, transit and destination countries? Does it make sense to consider regional programming?
- What are some complementary short- and long-term programming options to consider, particularly in Tier 2 Watch List countries that are at risk of being downgraded to Tier 3?

ANNEX A. FORMS OF TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS

The following are major forms of human trafficking:⁶

FORCED LABOR

Forced labor, sometimes also referred to as labor trafficking, encompasses the range of activities involved when a person uses force, fraud, or coercion to exploit the labor or services of another person.

The “**acts**” element of forced labor is met when the trafficker recruits, harbors, transports, provides, or obtains a person for labor or services.

The “**means**” element of forced labor includes a trafficker’s use of force, fraud, or coercion. The coercive scheme can include threats of force, debt manipulation, withholding of pay, confiscation of identity documents, psychological coercion, reputational harm, manipulation of the use of addictive substances, threats to other people, or other forms of coercion.

The “**purpose**” element focuses on the perpetrator’s goal to exploit a person’s labor or services. There is no limit on the location or type of industry. Traffickers can commit this crime in any sector or setting, whether legal or illicit, including but not limited to agricultural fields, factories, restaurants, hotels, massage parlors, retail stores, fishing vessels, mines, private homes, or drug trafficking operations.

All three elements are essential to constitute the crime of forced labor.

There are certain types of forced labor that are frequently distinguished for emphasis or because they are wide-spread:

Domestic Servitude

“Domestic servitude” is a form of forced labor in which the trafficker requires a victim to perform work in a private residence. Such circumstances create unique vulnerabilities. Domestic workers are often isolated and may work alone in a house. Their employer often controls their access to food, transportation, and housing. What happens in a private residence is hidden from the world, including from law enforcement and labor inspectors, resulting in barriers to victim identification. Foreign domestic workers are particularly vulnerable to abuse due to language and cultural barriers, as well as a lack of community ties. Some perpetrators use these types of conditions as part of their coercive schemes to compel the labor of domestic workers with little risk of detection.

Forced Child Labor

The term “forced child labor” describes forced labor schemes in which traffickers compel children (those under the age of 18) to work. Traffickers often target children because of their vulnerability and their dependence on adults for basic needs, which makes them easy to manipulate and control. Although some children may legally engage in certain forms of non-harmful work, forcing or coercing children to work remains illegal. The sale of children, forced or compulsory child labor, and debt bondage and serfdom of children continue to exist, despite legal prohibitions and widespread condemnation. Some indicators of forced labor of a child include situations in which the child appears to

⁶ <https://www.state.gov/reports/2022-trafficking-in-persons-report/>

be in the custody of a non-family member and the child's work financially benefits someone outside the child's family; or the denial of food, rest, play, or schooling to a child who is working.

SEX TRAFFICKING

Sex trafficking encompasses the range of activities involved when a trafficker uses force, fraud, or coercion to compel another person to engage in a commercial sex act or causes a child to engage in a commercial sex act.

The crime of sex trafficking is also understood through the "acts," "means," and "purpose" framework. All three elements are required to establish a sex trafficking crime (except in the case of child sex trafficking, where the means are irrelevant).

The "**acts**" element of sex trafficking is met when a trafficker recruits, harbors, transports, provides, obtains, patronizes, or solicits another person to engage in commercial sex.

The "**means**" element of sex trafficking occurs when a trafficker uses force, fraud, or coercion. Coercion in the case of sex trafficking encompasses the broad array of means included in the forced labor definition. These can include threats of serious harm, psychological harm, reputational harm, threats to others, and debt manipulation.

The "**purpose**" element is a commercial sex act. Sex trafficking can take place in private homes, massage parlors, hotels, or brothels, among other locations, as well as on the internet.

Child Sex Trafficking

In cases where an individual engages in any of the specified "acts" with a child, the means element is irrelevant regardless of consent and whether evidence of force, fraud, or coercion exists. The use of children in commercial sex is prohibited by law in the United States and most countries around the world.

UNLAWFUL RECRUITMENT OR USE OF CHILD SOLDIERS

Another manifestation of human trafficking occurs when government forces or any non-state armed group unlawfully recruits or uses children – through force, fraud, or coercion – as soldiers or for labor or services in conflict situations.⁷ Often in conflict situations, children are also used as sex slaves. Sexual slavery, as referred to here, occurs when armed groups force or coerce children to "marry" or be raped by commanders or combatants. Both male and female children are often sexually abused or exploited by members of armed groups and suffer the same types of devastating and life-long physical and psychological consequences associated with sex trafficking.

DEBT BONDAGE

"Debt bondage" is focused on human trafficking crimes in which the trafficker's primary means of coercion is debt manipulation. U.S. law prohibits perpetrators from using debts as part of their scheme, plan, or pattern to compel a person to work or engage in commercial sex. Traffickers target some individuals with an initial debt assumed willingly as a condition of future employment, while in certain countries traffickers tell individuals they "inherited" the debt from relatives. Traffickers can also manipulate

⁷ ILO Convention No.182 defines forced or compulsory recruitment of children for use in armed conflict as a worst form of child labour.

debts after the economic relationship begins by withholding earnings or forcing the victim to assume debts for expenses like food, housing, or transportation. They can also manipulate debts a victim owes to other people. When traffickers use debts as a means to compel labor or commercial sex, they have committed a crime.

What Is NOT Human Trafficking?

The following are examples of situations that do not constitute human trafficking under U.S. law, although other criminal statutes may apply and victims of crime may be eligible for services. Each situation should always be examined closely to determine if trafficking occurred.

Human Smuggling

Human smuggling is distinct from human trafficking. Human smuggling occurs when a person voluntarily enters into an agreement with a smuggler to gain illegal entry into a foreign country and is moved across an international border. People who are smuggled can be extremely vulnerable to human trafficking, abuse, and other crimes, as they are illegally present in the country of destination and often owe large debts to their smugglers. The key differences between the two crimes include:

Consent - smuggling, even if dangerous or degrading, involves consent. Trafficking survivors, on the other hand, have either never consented or if they initially consented, that consent has been rendered meaningless by the coercive, deceptive or abusive action of the traffickers.

Exploitation - smuggling ends with the migrants' arrival at their destination, whereas trafficking involves ongoing exploitation.

Transnationality - smuggling is always transnational, whereas trafficking may not be. Trafficking can occur regardless of whether there is movement involved.

Source of profits - in smuggling cases, profits are derived from the transportation or facilitation of the illegal entry or stay of a person into another county, while in trafficking cases profits are derived from exploitation.

Illegal Adoptions

The kidnapping or unlawful buying/selling of an infant or child for the purpose of offering that child for adoption represents a serious criminal offense, but it is not a form of human trafficking, as it does not necessarily involve the use of force, fraud, or coercion to compel services from a person. As stated in the *travaux preparatoires* of the Palermo Protocol, only “where illegal adoption amounts to a practice similar to slavery... it will also fall within the scope of the Protocol.”

Trafficking in Human Organs

The trafficking of human organs — such as kidneys — is not in itself a form of human trafficking. The international trade in organs is substantial and demand appears to be growing. Some victims in developing countries are exploited as their kidneys are purchased for low prices. The Palermo Protocol includes in its definition of illegal human trafficking the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring, or receipt of persons by coercive means for the purpose of removal of organs.

Child, Early, and Forced Marriage

Child, Early, and Forced Marriage is a human rights violation and an impediment to sustainable global development, but it is not defined as human trafficking under the TVPA. UNICEF and international laws, treaties, and conventions have defined child marriage (also called early marriage) as a formal or informal union where one or both parties are under the age of 18. Forced marriage is defined as marriage at any age that occurs without the free and full consent of both spouses; therefore it includes child and early marriage, as children under 18 are not able to give full consent.

Child Sexual Abuse Materials

Sex trafficking of children can involve several different forms of exploitation, including the production of child sexual abuse materials (CSAM). However, the production of sexual images representing children — which increasingly includes drawings, the use of mobile phones and computer-generated images — is not sex trafficking unless a child is actually induced to perform a commercial sex act for the purpose of producing these abusive materials. Distribution and possession of child sexual abuse materials, while often criminally prohibited, are not acts of human trafficking.

Prostitution

Prostitution by willing adults is not human trafficking regardless of whether it is legalized, decriminalized, or criminalized. However, pursuant to the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act (TVPRA) of 2008, the definitions of human trafficking under U.S. law are not construed to treat prostitution as a legal form of employment.

ANNEX B. INFLUENCES OF SUPPLY AND DEMAND

Human trafficking is a complex phenomenon that varies by country and region and is influenced by social, economic, cultural, and political factors. It is important to understand the specific factors that have shaped trafficking in the country or region where C-TIP programming is being designed to ensure that programs address the root causes and can have the intended impact. The economic concept of supply and demand is commonly used to describe the activity and can be used to create data-driven programming.

The Supply Side of Human Trafficking

Trafficking victims comprise the supply side of the equation. The supply of vulnerable individuals is influenced by both individual level factors as well as societal factors, such as economic, social, cultural, political, and environmental factors. While the specific vulnerability characteristics will vary by the type of trafficking and across contexts, some of the risk factors that create vulnerability to human trafficking may include the following:

- Poverty
- Corruption
- Weak rule of law
- Lack of social and political opportunities
- Discrimination based on caste, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, religious affiliation, etc.
- Lack of access to education and jobs
- Climate change impacts on food security, availability of water and arable land, and displacement caused by extreme climate events
- Family disruptions (i.e., parental or caretaker deaths that leave orphaned children)
- Family dysfunction (e.g., caused by abuse, drugs, alcohol, or violence)
- Dislocation and/or danger caused by civil unrest, internal armed conflict, war, or militarism
- Domestic violence
- Presence of traffickers, recruiters, loan sharks, and other predatory individuals within a community

The above list is not exhaustive of all conditions that may create vulnerability to trafficking, but is meant as a starting point to consider what factors need to be addressed in activity design. Understanding what creates vulnerability within a given context is a critical component to designing effective C-TIP activities.

There is also emerging evidence of the links between the institutionalization of children in care and trafficking. Residential care institutions can act as central components in child trafficking flows: being in residential care systems can create vulnerabilities for children, care systems may be a destination for children who have been trafficked and can be a source for recruiting persons to be trafficked. The following links between residential care and trafficking have been identified:

- Children are recruited and trafficked into institutions for the purpose of financial

profit and other forms of exploitation often known as “orphanage trafficking.” This can include sexual abuse by volunteers or visitors, forced labor, performing shows or making gifts for visitors.

- Children in residential care can be targeted by traffickers into other forms of exploitation including sexual abuse, forced labor and forced criminality.
- Young people who leave care, often called “care leavers,” are at high risk of trafficking and exploitation due to their lack of life-skills and family and community support.
- Child trafficking victims and unaccompanied children can be placed in residential care, which can put them at risk of trafficking and re-trafficking.⁸

The Demand Side of Human Trafficking

Many factors create vulnerability to human trafficking. However, human trafficking does not exist solely because people are vulnerable to exploitation.⁹ It can be fueled by:

- Demand for cheap labor, services, and commercial sexual exploitation
- Deception by brokers
- Complicity of authorities
- Lack of monitoring of employers

Consumers often provide the demand, and thus the profit incentive, to the traffickers. Consumers can include companies that subcontract certain types of services, end-consumers who buy cheap goods produced by trafficking victims, or individuals who use the services of trafficking victims. By changing purchasing choices and asking questions about how products were made, consumers can reduce these types of demand and help stem human trafficking.

Additional Factors That Contribute to Human Trafficking

Several additional systemic factors contribute to human trafficking, including the following:

- Growing restrictions on legal immigration: In the face of increasing restrictions on legal immigration, many migrants willfully ignore the associated risks of human trafficking and resort to alien smugglers for assistance.
- Impunity for traffickers: Trafficking thrives in situations where it is a low risk-high reward activity. In environments where traffickers and corrupt officials can act with impunity, it can inspire further criminal activity and make trafficked persons and the wider community hesitant to intervene.
- Treating human trafficking victims as criminals: Many victims are reluctant to cooperate with law enforcement to prosecute offenders because victims may be treated as criminals and fear retribution due to insufficient witness protection programs. Legal and administrative penalties imposed on TIP victims further violate their rights and obstruct efforts to identify and prosecute traffickers.

⁸ Emiel Coltof and Abigail Munroe. 2021. *Cycles of Exploitation: The Links Between Children's Institutions and Human Trafficking*.
<https://bettercarenetwork.org/library/particular-threats-to-childrens-care-and-protection/effects-of-institutional-care/cycles-of-exploitation-the-links-between-childrens-institutions-and-human-trafficking>

⁹ Human Trafficking Hotline: <https://humantraffickinghotline.org/type-trafficking/human-trafficking>

- Social customs that perpetuate vulnerability: In some countries, for example, it may be common for parents to entrust their children to the care of more affluent friends or relatives to increase their educational opportunities. Children separated from the care, protection, and oversight of their parents can be particularly at risk of being subjected to exploitative and abusive situations.
- Harmful gender norms: This can include a wide range of harmful norms, such as the use of sexual violence against women and girls and members of the LGBTQ+ community and stigma around reporting sexual violence that can be used to create vulnerability or coerce further exploitation. Harmful gender norms can also include expectations on the division of labor and income generation within a family that may make male family members more vulnerable to accepting risky job opportunities.

ANNEX C. C-TIP REGULATIONS, POLICIES, AND PROCEDURES

C-TIP Code of Conduct

In 2011, USAID adopted a C-TIP Code of Conduct that prohibits all employees, contractors, subcontractors, grantees, and sub-grantees from engaging in behaviors that facilitate or support TIP. All USAID staff, regardless of their hiring mechanism or employment location must abide by the Code and complete its associated online training within the first five months of their employment.

USAID has similar prohibitions related to behaviors that facilitate or support TIP in its award requirements for contractors, recipients, and sub-awardees, as well as their employees and agents.

Acquisition: The Federal Acquisition Regulation ([FAR Subpart 22.17](#), [FAR 52.222-50](#), and [FAR 52.222-56](#)) provides mandatory requirements for all federal acquisition awards to strengthen protections against trafficking in persons in federal contracts. All requirements flow down to acquisition subcontracts.

Assistance: All assistance awards to U.S. and Non-U.S. non-governmental recipients must include the Mandatory Standard Provision entitled “Trafficking in Persons.” These provisions provide mandatory C-TIP requirements for all USAID assistance awards. Requirements do not flow down to assistance subawards. Instead, assistance subawards are required to have provisions that prohibit certain conduct and authorize termination for noncompliance.

The mandatory standard provision on TIP is included in [ADS 303maa](#), Standard Provisions for U.S. Nongovernmental Organizations, [ADS 303mab](#), Standard Provisions for Non-U.S. Nongovernmental Organizations, and [ADS 303mat](#), Standard Provisions for Fixed Amount Awards to NGOs. The provision ensures USAID compliance with various legislative requirements, such as the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 and Section 1704(a) of the National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 2013 (Pub. L. 112-239, enacted January 2, 2013), intended to ensure that U.S. Government acquisition and assistance actions are not tainted by TIP. The provision reflects the U.S. Government’s policy against human trafficking and lists specific trafficking in persons-related prohibitions and requirements that are mandatory for both U.S. and non-U.S. recipients.

[ADS 303.3.32](#) provides guidance to USAID staff on how to monitor and enforce implementer compliance with TIP requirements in assistance awards.

ANNEX D. MONITORING, EVALUATION, AND LEARNING FOR C-TIP INTEGRATION

As a cross-cutting issue, dedicated C-TIP projects can combine programming elements from different sectors, as demonstrated in the Results Framework in **Annex E**. Programming to prevent TIP, for example, could involve legislative reform, anti-corruption, civil society engagement, agricultural programming, climate change, economic growth, or education elements depending upon the country context. Likewise, the Protection Objective could engage medical personnel, law enforcement and justice sector actors, as well as policymakers.

USAID’s revised C-TIP Policy prioritizes an integrated approach in order to maximize our programmatic reach. Project designs for economic growth programs in some countries can address the likelihood of forced or child labor in sectors such as manufacturing and agriculture where the incidence rate is most prevalent. Health programs may incorporate the unique medical and psychological needs of survivors as a discrete target beneficiary. Similarly, in countries where sex trafficking is prevalent, HIV/AIDS programming should consider ways to reach these survivors. The chart below lists various examples of how C-TIP elements could be integrated into diverse programs.

FEED THE FUTURE

PROJECT PURPOSE	POTENTIAL C-TIP ACTIVITY	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
Promote agricultural production	Prevent child trafficking in agriculture	% of farm laborers who are children is lowered
		Laws regulating use of child labor in conformity with international labor standards
		% of target group (rural children) who stay enrolled in school
Incorporate international human rights standards into domestic agricultural policy	Work with government and civil society to assess impact of agricultural policy on immigration dynamics	# of policies that mitigate negative effects on migrant/undocumented workers or other vulnerable populations
	Support agribusiness to reduce TIP in the supply chain	Supply chain analysis conducted by agricultural commodity
		# of agribusiness firms who adopt policies to reduce TIP in their supply chain

	Work with agribusiness to develop and apply standards for the protection of casual laborers	# of agribusiness firms who adopt practices to uphold casual laborers rights
		% of casual laborers who are aware of their rights

ECONOMIC GROWTH/PRIVATE ENTERPRISE

PROJECT PURPOSE	POTENTIAL C-TIP ACTIVITY	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
Promote economic growth/SMEs	Increase social and economic opportunities for vulnerable persons in source communities	% of targeted vulnerable persons employed, enrolled, or participating in micro-credit schemes
		# of businesses participating in employment programs for vulnerable groups
	Support adoption of economic policy that fairly regulates labor immigration	# of policies that mitigate negative effects on vulnerable populations
	Support businesses to reduce the enabling environment for TIP	# of businesses that adopt internal policies for fair recruiting & labor standards
Increase capacity of labor unions, labor inspectors, and government officials to develop and implement protective labor regulations	Train labor inspectors, union leaders and government officials on TIP issues and how to identify TIP	# of labor inspectors, union leaders and government officials trained and knowledgeable on trafficking issues
		% of TIP survivors identified by labor inspectors, labor unions, and government officials that receive direct assistance
	Build capacity of unions to provide safety net for most vulnerable	# of unions providing outreach and services to those most vulnerable to TIP
	Work with government to develop and implement regulations for safe labor migration	# of recruitment agencies in compliance with C-TIP regulations

EDUCATION

PROJECT PURPOSE	POTENTIAL C-TIP ACTIVITY	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
Promote higher graduation rates in primary education	Institutionalize C-TIP curriculum in primary school education	True/Yes
	Train teachers on TIP and their role in preventing it	# of teachers trained
		% of vulnerable persons graduate
Promote vocational training	Provide vocational training and placement opportunities for vulnerable groups, including TIP survivors	% of vulnerable persons to get jobs

GLOBAL HEALTH

PROJECT PURPOSE	POTENTIAL C-TIP ACTIVITY	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
Improve quality and accessibility of medical treatment and care	Train health care providers and substance abuse counselors on TIP, including symptoms of victim/survivors and special care needs	% of health care providers who have received specialized training
		Level of satisfaction of survivors who received medical assistance
Mainstream rights-based approach to medical services	Capacity building at national and local levels to mainstream C-TIP prevention and protection activities	# C-TIP policies adopted

MEDIA

PROJECT PURPOSE	POTENTIAL C-TIP ACTIVITY	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
Enhance capacity of media to report accurately and professionally	Train journalists on accurate TIP reporting	# journalists trained
	Train journalists in investigative techniques to uncover trafficking scams and organizers	# of accurate and discrete instances of media coverage on TIP issues

Promote use of social media to promote social policy	<p>Build awareness campaigns on C-TIP around large events such as a sporting event, concert, etc.</p> <p>Develop mobile app with information for migrants and survivors to access services</p>	<p># C-TIP campaigns using social media</p> <p># of users of mobile app to access information and/or services on TIP</p>

CONFLICT/CRISIS/DISASTER ZONES

PROJECT PURPOSE	POTENTIAL C-TIP ACTIVITY	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
Provide appropriate and comprehensive direct assistance to conflict survivors	Establish SOPs/Guidelines for identification and sheltering of survivors	# of survivors identified using SOPs/guidelines and referred for services
		# of survivors removed from detention facilities
		% of re/integrated survivors employed, re/inserted in an education system, etc.
Promote protection of human rights	C-TIP training for human rights defenders	# trained to assist survivors; # of survivors assisted with services
	Public information campaigns to raise awareness of TIP in conflict zones	% increase in # of citizens who are aware of TIP issues
Promote protection and resiliency of vulnerable populations	Work with governments and civil society to ensure consideration of C-TIP implications in disaster risk reduction and humanitarian assistance policies	# of C-TIP policies that address most vulnerable populations

GLOBAL CLIMATE CHANGE (GCC)

PROJECT PURPOSE	POTENTIAL C-TIP ACTIVITY	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
Promote protection of those displaced or made vulnerable by GCC	C-TIP awareness for communities whose livelihoods have been negatively affected by GCC	# of awareness campaigns
	Provision of services for those affected by GCC, including those who must relocate	# of survivors assisted with TIP services
	Work with local research institution to collect data on demographics of affected populations	# of studies that identify GCC-related migration/TIP dynamics

CIVIL SOCIETY

PROJECT PURPOSE	POTENTIAL C-TIP ACTIVITY	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
Empower local civil society organizations to promote social policy	Provide technical and organizational capacity building support to C-TIP CSOs	# of CSOs effectively advocating for TIP prevention and protection
Empower local communities to identify and support survivors	Develop community watch groups to detect TIP, raise awareness, and provide assistance	# of watch groups developed # of community members assisted # of awareness raising events conducted
Provide legal assistance to TIP survivors	Train and provide lawyers and paralegals to assist survivors with legal and administrative needs (e.g., passports, child support, government assistance, etc.)	# of lawyers and/or paralegals trained to support TIP survivors # of cases/matters and/or survivors assisted

ANNEX E. ILLUSTRATIVE RESULTS FRAMEWORK: THE 4PS PARADIGM

This section lays out a sample illustrative results framework for C-TIP activities that can be used to inform the development of C-TIP programming using the 4P framework. This follows the primary three components laid out in the TVPA: 1) Prevent trafficking in persons, 2) Protect survivors, and 3) Prosecute the perpetrators. It also includes illustrative results for the fourth component in C-TIP programming of utilizing partnerships to advance these objectives. Following the results framework, this annex provides a detailed list of illustrative activities and performance indicators.

Prevention

DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE 1: Comprehensive measures to prevent all forms of TIP are established and institutionalized

RECRUITING AND LABOR PRACTICES	VULNERABLE INDIVIDUALS AND GROUPS	ANTI-CORRUPTION	DEMAND REDUCTION
IR 1.1: Appropriate controls over labor recruitment and working conditions adopted and implemented	IR 1.2: Decreased engagement in high-risk behaviors and expanded economic and educational opportunities as alternatives to TIP	IR 1.3: Corrupt practices that facilitate trafficking reduced	IR 1.4: Demand for goods or services produced or provided by trafficked persons reduced
1.1.1: Licensing and regulatory controls over recruitment/sponsoring agencies (or individual recruiting agents) developed (or strengthened) and enforced	1.2.1: Potential victims and their families, educators, and community leaders informed of the risks and perils of trafficking and instruction provided on how to decrease that risk	1.3.1: Capacity of governmental agencies to expose, investigate, and prosecute instances of corruption facilitating TIP increased	1.4.1: Public informed of the incidence of TIP in production of certain goods or services
1.1.2: Labor standards enforced and rights protected to ensure “decent work”	1.2.2: Expanded economic and educational opportunities for vulnerable populations created	1.3.2: Transparency of governmental practices related to TIP increased by civil society activism and open government initiatives	1.4.2: Commercial sex users informed of the correlation between commercial sex and trafficking
1.1.3: Official or voluntary monitoring networks ensure compliance with licensing and labor standards			1.4.3: Employers in industries known to utilize forced and child labor proactively oppose all forms of TIP

1.1.4: The establishment (or strengthening) of incentives that encourage employers to keep their employees — and encourage employees to remain — in the formal labor sector supported			
---	--	--	--

Protection

DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE 2: Survivor-centered services to provide protection and assistance to trafficked persons and to meet special needs of trafficked children are established and sustainable

SURVIVOR ENGAGEMENT AND SUPPORT SERVICES	REPATRIATION AND REINTEGRATION	SPECIAL NEEDS OF CHILD SURVIVORS OF TRAFFICKING	LAW ENFORCEMENT/ POLICE INTERACTION
IR 2.1: System of specialized comprehensive and non-discriminatory services for survivors established and maintained	IR 2.2: Voluntary repatriation and reintegration processes available to survivors of trafficking in line with international standards	IR 2.3: The special needs of trafficked children included in a comprehensive victim assistance framework	IR 2.4: Law enforcement entities enhance protection of trafficked persons
2.1.1: Systematic procedures guide first responders in the process of identification of trafficked persons	2.2.1: Rights-based procedures in destination countries ensure trafficked persons are not deported inappropriately or punished for crimes associated with being trafficked and have legal alternatives to removal to countries where they may face retribution or hardship	2.3.1: Laws and procedures to identify child survivors and victims of forced labor and trafficking strengthened	2.4.1: Law enforcement entities and local communities facilitate victim identification and protection

2.1.2: Basic services for survivors of trafficking available (e.g., counseling, shelter, security, food, legal services and where appropriate, vocational or job training)	2.2.2: Countries of origin and destination mutually employ practices for safe and voluntary repatriation and reintegration of trafficked persons	2.3.2: Facilities and services to effectively address the special needs of trafficked children established and/or enhanced	2.4.2: Capacity of law enforcement to assist trafficked persons in accessing social services increased
2.1.3: Access to justice for survivors of trafficking increased	2.2.3: Systematic reintegration procedures in countries of origin protect trafficked persons against exploitation and re-trafficking	2.3.3: Legal needs of trafficked children during trials against traffickers adequately met	
	2.2.4: Social/cultural stigma associated with survivors of TIP mitigated		

Prosecution

DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE 3: Prosecution of those willfully engaged in TIP strengthened, resulting in increased convictions and sentencing

JUSTICE SYSTEM	SUPPORT AND WITNESS PROTECTION PROGRAMS
IR 3.1: Justice systems capable of effectively, fairly, and efficiently handling TIP cases	IR 3.2: Safety and protection of trafficked persons institutionalized throughout legal proceedings
3.1.1: Administrative procedures promote processing of TIP cases	3.2.1: Survivor rights protected in the course of legal proceedings
3.1.2: Law enforcement's capacity to investigate TIP cases and support prosecution of traffickers increased	3.2.2: Survivors provided for and protected after trial as feasible

Partnerships

DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE 4: A global movement dedicated to the eradication of all forms of TIP collectively and productively supported by governments, civil society, and the private sector

NATIONAL COORDINATION	DATA COLLECTION	INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION	PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS AND INTRAGOVERNMENTAL PARTNERSHIPS
IR 4.1: NRM and/or NAP coherently coordinate C-TIP activities effectively	IR 4.2: Reliable data on TIP activity effectively collected and shared among interested governmental and non-governmental parties	IR 4.3: Legal and voluntary mechanisms supporting international, intergovernmental and regional collaboration and partnerships to effectively combat cross-border trafficking adopted (or strengthened) and utilized	IR 4.4: Establishment of partnerships between both public and private entities and donors and within the U.S. government
4.1.1: A comprehensive NRM and/or NAP delineates referral strategies or establishes actions to provide support and protection services for trafficked persons developed or strengthened	4.2.1: Capacity to measure incidence of TIP developed or strengthened	4.3.1: Relevant international instruments ratified	4.4.1: Private companies establish PPPs and CSR programs to combat TIP
4.1.2: A coordinating mechanism effectively reviews performance of NRM or oversees implementation of the NAP	4.2.2: Integrity and utility of TIP data increased	4.3.2: Increased government capacity to implement international instruments	4.4.2: USG collaboration strengthened internally to combat TIP
4.1.3: The NRM and/or NAP effectively implemented	4.2.3: Formal mechanism established (or strengthened) to share TIP data or information with relevant entities within and across national borders	4.3.3: Cross-border and regional networks facilitate widespread awareness raising, identification, care, repatriation and reintegration of survivors, cross-border investigations, and services	

Overview of Results Frameworks for the 4Ps with Illustrative Activities and Possible Indicators

Prevention

Development Objective I: Comprehensive measures to prevent all forms of TIP are established and institutionalized

State of the art prevention efforts begin with benchmark survey data that enable those designing programs to identify their starting point for action. This can include gathering data to better define vulnerability to trafficking in a specific context, the suspected patterns of how trafficking occurs in a given region, and the level of awareness in the community to identify and respond to potential trafficking situations.

Prevention activities have primarily taken the form of public education and awareness campaigns directed at populations vulnerable to trafficking and first responders, such as social workers and police. Too often, these campaigns have been designed to raise general awareness on trafficking and lack quality survey data about actual vulnerability factors or context data on how trafficking occurs in a given region and have no measurement of impact.

While public education and awareness programs are critical to combating trafficking, they are not the only prevention strategies. Prevention efforts must be matched with activities that allow people to put evidence-based knowledge of trafficking to use. Vulnerable populations should have access to programs that address the root causes of vulnerability, such as the lack of educational or employment opportunities or the presence of gender, ethnic, or other forms of discrimination. First responders and other responsible authorities should be equipped with the skills and resources to identify vulnerable persons and take proactive steps to prevent trafficking. Awareness programs must be leveraged by integrating tools through which individuals are equipped and empowered. An awareness campaign that also provides guidance to communities on how to form neighborhood counter-trafficking vigilance committees to report and investigate suspected cases is one example. An economic growth program that provides vocational and livelihood training to reduce vulnerabilities is another example. These prevention strategies embrace a multi-layered integrated approach to create an environment to prevent trafficking. Such an approach reflects increased understanding of trafficking in both the formal and informal labor markets and the need for transparency and monitoring in corporate supply chains to prevent corruption. These activities should engage survivors of TIP to better inform the messages and resources so they are more tailored and responsive to the local context. The IRs under this objective work together to prevent TIP by regulating and monitoring formal market sectors, strengthening vulnerable populations, curbing public corruption in TIP, and reducing the demand for commercial sex and cheap labor.

When examining prevention programs, it may be useful to use proxy measures as a means to measure the extent to which awareness activities were successful in preventing trafficking situations. A key consideration for proxy variables should be the level of knowledge imparted by programs and the resulting changes in knowledge, attitudes, and practices among vulnerable populations. For instance, if the goal of the project is to increase awareness of the dangers and signs of trafficking then the attitudes and awareness of the target population should be initially measured along with a part of the population that will serve as a control group. Or, if the goal is to combat labor trafficking, then it may be useful to track the number of people who look for work in areas that could lead them to be trafficked (e.g., women who apply for domestic servant positions through newspaper ads).

Recruiting and Labor Practices

IR 1.1: Appropriate controls over labor recruitment and working conditions adopted and implemented

Issue: Traffickers can lure victims into forced labor situations within a particular country or can recruit them from abroad. Typically individuals are lured through promises of legitimate work, often presenting the appearance of a credible employment agency or a trusted friend. Fraudulent contracts, passports, and visa documentation can buttress the appearance of legitimacy. Similarly, fraudulent documentation creates the impression of a legitimate labor force, sometimes fooling even the businesses employing the trafficked individual. In addition, high and illegal recruitment fees are exploitative recruitment practices that can lead to situations of debt bondage. It is now a best practice to ensure that recruitment fees are paid by the employer. Victims themselves are prevented from reporting their conditions through physical restraint, threats of repercussion, or lack of knowledge. Language barriers and lack of social support may also pose challenges to reporting.

Labor standards in small enterprises and the informal labor sector can be especially difficult to enforce. Workers in the informal sector, such as individuals recruited as domestic servants in households or as laborers on fishing boats or small farms, are particularly vulnerable to trafficking. Creating avenues for “decent work” has proven an effective deterrent to TIP by offering workers safe environments and protection of their labor rights, thereby reducing vulnerability.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level:

- Percent of targeted improvements to labor recruitment regulation implemented
- Percent of targeted improvements to procedures for labor inspections implemented
- Number of labor inspections conducted in targeted industries with suspected high levels of trafficking
- Number of private-sector firms which enact internal policies and practices to ensure that their supply chains do not use trafficked or forced labor

Illustrative Activities:

1.1.1: Develop (or strengthen) and enforce rigorous licensing and regulatory controls over recruitment and sponsoring agencies or individual agents through:

- Licensing of business entities seeking to engage in hiring (either as recruiting or sponsoring agencies) to include background checks of principals and verification of business financing and contact information.¹⁰ Individual recruiters should be targeted in addition to companies and/or agencies. A significant part of exploitative recruitment practices involves individual, unlicensed recruiters who make fraudulent offers and charge illegal fees to vulnerable segments of the population. Best practices mandate that employees should not be responsible for recruitment fees.

¹⁰ “Sponsoring agencies” are typically logistical facilitators in destination countries and arrange for travel documentation, transit, housing, and employment placement for workers. Trafficking schemes often involve the recruiter, the sponsoring agency, and the employer, although in some instances the employer simply contracts with the sponsoring agency for temporary laborers at market value and is unaware of the exploitative relationship.

- Stringent regulation of business practices, which includes requirements to prominently display a valid business license and provide prospective workers with warnings on risks of trafficking and instructions on how to report violations to law enforcement. Other regulations should require providing contracts in the prospective worker's native language; informing workers of the process for reporting sexual or physical abuse; maintaining placement files with a copy of the worker's passport, visa, and contracts for each recruited individual; advising prospective workers of their right to consult an attorney or other advisor prior to signing contracts; ensuring workers have regular and frequent access to modes of communication; and providing contact information for the entity with whom the employment relationship is envisioned; and providing a statement of worker rights and labor standards.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Licensing requirements updated to include background checks, financing and contact verification (Y/N)
- Number of labor/employment agencies licensed under updated criteria
- Percent of labor/employment agencies displaying business licenses and trafficking warnings
- Percent of labor/employment agencies complying with newly implemented best practice regulations such as contracts in native language, no recruitments for employees, and prospective workers advised of their rights

1.1.2: Develop (or strengthen) and enforce international labor standards by:

- Ensuring that national laws and regulations are consistent with international norms and the country's national labor laws (assuming that existing labor laws are well developed), setting clear limitations on the number of hours, establishing wage rates, requiring safe working conditions free from the use of child and forced labor, and prohibiting employers or recruiters from withholding workers' passports.
- Requiring businesses to register employment of foreign nationals. Follow-up inspections should include spot verification of the authenticity of the worker's travel documentation and employment permit. Confidential interviews with randomly-selected workers should confirm that conditions of employment comply with minimum labor standards.
- Prohibiting employers from obtaining and holding for any period the travel documents of their foreign national employees. Such documentation includes passports, visas, and other documents permitting the employees to travel and remain in the host country.
- Utilizing formal monitoring mechanisms of licensed entities, including verifying the legitimacy of positions filled and confirming authenticity of documentation in placement files.
- Training labor inspectors to identify cases of TIP during the course of regular workplace inspections.
- Criminalizing the exchange of a child's labor in payment of a debt.

- Prohibiting the exchange of an individual's labor in payment of a debt in the absence of a contract specifying a reasonable, predetermined date when the debt will be paid off by the labor and the laborer may exit the agreement.
- Partnering with government and civil society to ensure that laws and regulations pertaining to establishing and registering businesses, obtaining permits and certifications are consistent with international norms and are enforced. This may be done through collaborations with host government law enforcement mechanisms.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of labor inspectors trained to identify trafficking cases
- Policies and procedures for labor inspections developed through a participatory process (with police and labor inspectorate) that forms the foundation for inspection techniques training
- Number of trainers trained to deliver new curricula
- Percent of labor inspectors trained on improved inspection techniques who pass a follow-up test one year after training
- Number of follow-up confidential interviews conducted by labor inspectors with randomly-selected workers

1.1.3: Develop (or strengthen) either official or voluntary monitoring networks (depending on the country context) ensuring compliance with labor standards licensing through:

- Self-regulation and codes of conduct by employment agencies and businesses, especially in low wage or manual labor industries known to utilize trafficked labor (e.g., mining, hospitality, entertainment, construction, domestic work, manufacturing, agriculture).
- Civil society and media monitoring of employment and sponsoring agencies and companies, as well as individual recruiters. While monitoring of private enterprise has limitations, the existence and authenticity of public documents, including licensing of employment agencies and issuance of work permits is possible where reasonable access-to-information laws exist. CSOs and journalists can also verify employment conditions by interviewing willing workers. Journalists should be trained to conduct investigative reporting that can uncover scams, forced labor, and trafficking organizations and schemes.
- Strengthened unions and worker organizations that safeguard members and reach out to non-unionized workplaces and publicize rights. This includes the implementation of workplace mechanisms that allow workers to report individuals who are vulnerable to exploitation, providing such information into reporting processes in a NAP.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of companies participating in self-regulation
- Number of companies adopting codes of conduct addressing TIP
- Number of trafficking-related violations identified by civil society and/or media

and/or unions

1.1.4: Support the establishment (or strengthening) of incentives that encourage employers to keep their employees — and encourage employees to remain — in the formal labor sector with:

- Preferred tax treatment rewarding companies that create/provide legitimate jobs in the formal sector.
- Streamlined business regulation process that enable employers to register easily
- Labor laws that significantly restrict informal employment. Employees in the informal labor market are generally at greater risk of being trafficked or exploited.¹¹

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of incentives established or strengthened that encourage workers to reside in the formal sector (quality of incentives should be assessed)
- Increase in formal employment where those vulnerable to TIP have relevant skills

Measurement Approach: At the IR level, measurement of whether controls over labor recruitment and employment of foreign nationals have been adopted and implemented is relatively straightforward. Adoption and implementation of those controls targeted by the intervention can be measured directly.

One challenge with measuring progress in the area of enforcement of minimum labor standards is the difficulty of interpreting data on changes in the number of trafficking cases identified by labor inspectors. Better-trained inspectors would be expected to identify more trafficking cases, at least initially. However, as the deterrent effect of improved inspections takes hold and other anti-trafficking measures begin to have an impact, the number of trafficking cases that will be identified may drop (This may be in some cases because traffickers move their operations elsewhere as a result of increased labor inspections). Thus, while it is important to track the total number of trafficking cases identified by inspectors, it is best to use the data as a contextual indicator rather than an actual performance indicator.

Sustainability: Codifying minimum labor standards and incorporating C-TIP measures into business regulation create an excellent framework that can guide other interventions. Moreover, businesses are increasingly motivated to combat TIP through Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) initiatives and codes of conduct. Ethical and legitimate companies compete with traffickers who promise unrealistic salaries. Similarly, companies complying with international labor standards are disadvantaged by competitors who use forced labor to keep production costs low. As businesses and labor unions are increasingly engaged in monitoring workplaces and supply chains against TIP, these efforts will work to enhance the public regulation of workplaces and compliance with national labor laws.

Special Considerations: Legislation prohibiting labor trafficking is less widespread than that addressing sex trafficking. Accordingly, interventions may need to be premised on the development or strengthening of a labor code that incorporates international labor standards and C-TIP regulation. Enforcement of labor standards will be complicated by the substantial informal

¹¹ Note that while this is generally a good practice, it is important to be sensitive to the fact that some informal sector workers, such as women who wish to conceal from their husbands that they are working, may not want their jobs to be formalized.

sectors that characterize many of the economies in countries of origin and, to a lesser extent, destination countries. Similarly, cultural practices and economic necessities that engage children in family farms and businesses would likely be excluded from labor standards, creating opportunities to conceal trafficking schemes under the guise of familial labor. Cultural practices have also created restrictions on women where countries, alleging protection, have refused to allow women of a certain age to travel and work in other countries. Where workers' rights and licensing requirements exist, or are developed, they should be incorporated into civic education materials informing vulnerable populations of their rights and providing them with a means of identifying fraudulent recruiters.

Vulnerable Individuals and Groups

IR 1.2: Decreased engagement in high risk behaviors and expanded economic and educational opportunities as alternatives to TIP

Issue: A lack of economic opportunities makes people vulnerable to all forms of trafficking. Internal trafficking often targets vulnerable children and youth for exploitation largely within the informal sector. Some victims are duped by promises of legitimate employment opportunities, while others agree to what they know will be onerous working conditions, believing that they will be able to earn money and return home at will. Family and community members are frequently involved in the recruitment process, often unaware of the true nature of the situation but sometimes complicit with the traffickers. Moreover, traffickers capitalize on situations that make it difficult to account for people, including internal displacement following conflict and natural disasters, and target undocumented or marginalized populations such as Roma, runaways, and orphans.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level include

- Percentage increase in household incomes among vulnerable households
- Percentage increase in households accessing new or alternate income generating activities
- Percentage increase in enrollment rates in educational institutions among vulnerable populations

Illustrative Activities

1.2.1: Inform vulnerable groups and their families, educators, and community leaders of the risks and perils of trafficking and instruction as to how to decrease that risk with:

- Public information and/or social marketing campaigns drawing on public opinion survey data that inform vulnerable groups and their families, educators and community leaders of the risks and perils of trafficking. Depending on the cultural context, consider various forms of conveying C-TIP information such as street theater, art displays, fairs, or other events that draw large crowds.
- Trafficking prevention programs at orphanages, schools, sport clubs, and community centers in areas particularly targeted by traffickers. Training can include local TIP patterns, trends, and recruitment strategies (although these are rapidly changing, so must be updated to respond to the reality on the ground) recognizing signs of TIP, appropriate actions to take in case of suspected TIP activity, and counseling techniques.
- Education campaigns that target street and other children who would not be reached through school or other community-based programs.

- Community development programs bringing together ethnic and faith-based groups, civil society, and families to eliminate TIP in their neighborhoods. Community watch groups that train community members of signs of TIP, how to engage with relevant authorities, and increase knowledge of how to provide resources.
- Youth-oriented awareness campaigns using popular social media. Such campaigns will provide information and confidential referrals on services available to youth at risk for labor and sex trafficking.
- Information campaigns in IDP/refugee camps exposing scam tactics and encouraging residents to report instances of abuse.
- Media campaigns with appropriately reported TIP stories, taking into account the sensitivity of the subject matter, the need for confidentiality regarding the identification of victims, including children, and the avoidance of sensationalism.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Percent of target group with increased knowledge of TIP and safe migration practices
- Percent of target group demonstrating changed behavior as a result of increased TIP knowledge
- Number of specific sub-populations receiving messages tailored to their particular circumstances and vulnerabilities to human trafficking
- Number of public awareness campaigns about TIP replicated by host-country government, CSOs, or communities without additional USAID support
- Number of public awareness campaigns that reduce stigma around harmful cultural and/or gender norms that may create or increase vulnerability to trafficking
- Number of awareness campaigns tied to other prevention activities that enable people to take specific action such as hotlines to report risks, etc.
Number of schools/teachers teaching about the risks of TIP in their curriculum
- Percent of schools in target area where counter-trafficking curriculum is institutionalized as a regular part of the instructional program
- Number of schools/teachers making referrals regarding suspected TIP activity
- Number of people in host country trained on TIP-related issues with USG assistance

1.2.2: Expand economic and educational opportunities for vulnerable populations as alternatives to TIP through:

- Skills training and vocational education programs tailored to the most economically viable sectors in the region. These programs should be developed in collaboration with local businesses to ensure that participants receive training that will most likely lead to legitimate employment.
- Coordination with existing businesses to create employment opportunities for vulnerable groups. These activities should also work with businesses to improve the enabling environment on diversity, equity, inclusion, and accessibility (DEIA) issues so that these businesses serve as an attractive employment option for vulnerable populations.
- Small business development programs. These programs should include instruction

and support in the development of business plans (including market analysis, financial management, marketing strategies, etc.) and be linked to micro-credit lending opportunities.

- Primary education programs, improving the quality of education and creating incentives for parents to enroll and keep girls and boys in school.
- General Education Development programs to improve literacy and basic education.
- Programs designed to expand economic opportunity for populations vulnerable to TIP need to be coupled with TIP education. There have been cases where small loans actually increased TIP and/or exploitation; those receiving the loans then used minors in their new small businesses.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of individuals completing vocational training who obtain employment locally within three months
- Number of individuals receiving small business support/training who open businesses within three months and are increasing their weekly income from that business within six months
- Number of vulnerable individuals enrolled in/completing educational programs designed to increase their economic opportunities
- Percentage of vulnerable groups completing educational milestones (primary school, secondary school, GED, vocational school)
- Literacy rate among vulnerable groups

Measurement Approach: Vulnerability is difficult to measure and will vary depending on the specific context of an activity. Countries that collect data on survivors typically also have robust data on both the push and pull factors of vulnerability that can help projects create more detailed vulnerability profiles.¹² When this specific data is not available, an understanding of the factors that make groups particularly vulnerable to trafficking can be used to develop proxy indicators that effectively measure reduction in vulnerability. At the IR level, reduction in vulnerability will likely best be measured by a concise set of indicators that address the most important factors that contribute to vulnerability in that particular country context. For instance, performance indicators relating to a lack of viable economic opportunities or a lack of job skills can serve as proxies for measuring whether vulnerability has decreased. In areas where a lack of understanding of the risks of trafficking contributes to vulnerability, then increased awareness of those risks can be measured. Local organizations working on human trafficking, human rights, child protection, or related areas can serve as excellent sources of information to determine the most vulnerable populations within a given country.

¹² Push factors typically include characteristics that make a person more susceptible to accepting a risky offer that could lead to trafficking. Push factors may include instability within the family, limited access to employment options, high levels of debt, limited vocational or educational opportunities, etc. Pull factors typically reference the way in which an opportunity that will lead to trafficking is presented - this may include jobs advertised by recruitment agencies, offers for casual or informal employment, etc. The specific push and pull factors that create vulnerability are usually tailored to fit within culturally acceptable norms within a given context and will vary from one community to the next.

Awareness raising presents its own set of measurement challenges: 1) to what extent did the target group's level of knowledge and/or awareness change as a result of the interventions; 2) whether this knowledge led to behavior change; and 3) to what extent, if any, this behavior change prevented trafficking from occurring. The fundamental challenge at the last stage is measuring something that did not happen.

To address these issues, awareness raising campaigns should be well researched, based on a solid understanding of trafficking patterns in a given context, public opinion, and other data sources. Tailored messages that target specific segments of the population and provide concrete examples of how to avoid/prevent trafficking scenarios or access services are the most effective. With this approach, it is possible to conduct impact evaluations of awareness raising campaigns provided that a treatment and control design is planned from the beginning of the intervention. Questions about TIP awareness and responses can also be included in other household surveys that are being conducted on topics such as economics, politics, and justice.

Sustainability: Introducing C-TIP messages into education systems helps ensure that future generations are well-informed about TIP to prevent future instances of trafficking. However, in desperation, people sometimes submit to trafficking situations. Greater impact, therefore, requires the creation of viable economic alternatives. Well-developed public-private partnerships (PPPs) can ensure that programs promoting such alternatives are both effective and enduring. Local employers benefit from skills/vocational training programs that produce personnel qualified for their employment needs and may therefore support ongoing learning opportunities, such as internships, apprenticeships, and entry level positions. Governments can provide further incentives for businesses to assume support for such programming through tax credits.

Special Considerations: Cultural norms and economic realities may limit the efficacy of education programs in public schools. Girls' education is not emphasized in all cultures, and poverty often causes parents to send their children to work instead of school. Similarly, written messages on fliers may not reach illiterate and extremely poor people. It is important to consider the geographic reach of radio and television service when considering the use of public service announcements over these mediums. Graphic novels, short videos using social media outlets, and cell phone messaging can also assist in reaching a more diverse group with varying language capabilities. Accordingly, special care should be taken to ensure that the information campaigns reach the target population and are easily understood. C-TIP campaigns can be more effective if they are tailored to a particular audience or region and are informed by focus groups results and high quality survey data. Urban and rural populations often require different types of outreach and messaging.

Anti-Corruption

IR 1.3: Corrupt practices that facilitate trafficking reduced

Issue: Anti-corruption measures are often a low priority in C-TIP programming. On the other hand, collusion between law-enforcement officials and traffickers, lack of political will and lack of data on TIP-related corruption impedes the implementation of robust anti-corruption programming. Media can play a key role in exposing corruption and reporting on TIP, but it is sometimes hindered in such reporting by a lack of training in investigative journalism, harsh anti-defamation laws, and threats from trafficking syndicates. Effective media training can improve the quality of C-TIP reporting and also take into consideration the special needs of survivors, including the need for protection from traffickers during legal proceedings. Stories should raise awareness of threats posed by multiple forms of human trafficking.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level include:

- Number of corrupt practices facilitating trafficking whose incidence is reduced¹³
- Number of licenses for recruitment agencies and travel/tour agencies (issued, suspended, revoked)
- Number of inspections of high-risk businesses to check compliance
- Anti-money-laundering risk matrices that look at excessive profits and “red flag indicators” to identify businesses with high potential for engagement in trafficking
- Number of exit versus entry visas
- Global Integrity (NGO) country-level surveys
- Number of safeguards and changes in procedures related to specific targeted corrupt practices implemented
- Number of anti-corruption cases filed and/or prosecuted and number of convictions that involved TIP-related corruption offenses
- Percent change in attitudes and perceptions about TIP-related government corruption
- Reports of missing persons filed in geographic areas vulnerable to trafficking

Illustrative Activities

1.3.1: Build capacity of governmental agencies to expose, investigate, and prosecute instances of corruption facilitating TIP through:

- Helping agencies analyze internal processes to isolate corrupt practices that could contribute to TIP. While many countries have independent anti-corruption agencies, few have specialized training for the types of corruption associated with TIP. Training within anti-corruption agencies will improve investigation techniques specific to the types of corruption that facilitate TIP.
- Establishing TIP departments in Internal Affairs (IA) Units and Offices of the Inspectorate General (OIG). Linking with TIP hotlines (telephonic or via Internet) provides an opportunity to make anonymous complaints/reports of public corruption to the IA Units in law enforcement and OIGs in ministries. Training IA Units and OIGs on investigative techniques unique to TIP cases will help governments install internal checks to identify corrupt practices and isolate corrupt individuals in the field. Special emphasis should be given to governmental entities whose work most closely touches the different aspects of trafficking, including ministries responsible for labor, tourism, immigration, migration, business licensing and regulation, and justice, as well as law enforcement (including border guards).
- Technical assistance to government agencies responsible for facilitating international travel, issuing work permits, registering business entities, and enforcing labor codes.

¹³ This indicator might be measured by formal reassessments of those practices or by surveys of individuals who regularly deal with a particular corrupt practice, such as surveying truck drivers who cross borders regularly on how often they are inspected or how often they are asked for bribes (If only a few corrupt practices are targeted, then indicators tailored to those practices would be appropriate.)

A thorough analysis will identify the primary opportunities for corruption, whether through improper issuance of visas or work permits, failing to properly document transactions, or lax enforcement of labor codes. Steps to minimize discretionary activity by standardizing operating procedures and automating routine functions will help isolate deviations from the norm, which should be investigated for potential abuse of office. Improve coordination between government agencies and CSOs who can provide services and resources and offer a coordinated approach that is survivor-centered.

- Incorporate document-tracking systems. Strict controls and documentation of the issuance of official documents, including passports, visas, birth certificates, and business licenses enhance accountability. Document numbering, official seals, watermarks, dual signature approvals, and other document security systems not only thwart counterfeiters but also help expose public officials issuing fraudulent documents.
- Improve capacity of border and customs agencies to conduct interventions at border checkpoints, including training, development of risk management profiles, sector specific mapping, and risk indicators for specific situations. Provide pamphlets or other information that border and customs agents can hand out to arriving migrants.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of corrupt practices facilitating trafficking identified (contextual indicator)
- Number of government officials trained on how specific corrupt practices facilitate trafficking, disaggregated by governmental unit
- Number of IA/OIG units established or with strengthened capacity to address corruption related to TIP
- Number of new anti-corruption investigations into corrupt practices that facilitate TIP opened/completed
- Number of government agencies modifying procedures to reduce opportunities for corruption that facilitate TIP
- Percent of targeted official documents with strengthened document tracking systems
- Number of inspections to ascertain compliance among high-risk entities for trafficking

1.3.2: Increase transparency of governmental practices related to TIP through:

- Strengthening civil society's ability to monitor government activities contributes both to exposing and curbing corrupt practices. Legislative, policy, and/or regulatory reform are often needed to liberalize public access to records and court proceedings. Even where the administrative framework is sufficient, the right to access public documents and proceedings often goes unused. Training for civil society organizations on their rights and procedures under freedom of information laws and open meeting laws will lead to greater transparency. Conversely, training for government officers will promote compliance with "sunshine" laws.
- Strengthening media capacity to investigate and report on corrupt practices facilitating TIP. Journalist training on issues specific to TIP and governmental

practices that facilitate TIP will improve their capacity to investigate and report on instances of corruption related to TIP. New media designs can be used to engage potential witnesses and gather information, as well as to publicize the outcome of media investigations.

- Supporting e-government or other open government initiatives. Electronic capacity to apply for or update vital documents, register businesses, track international migration, and apply for social benefits not only streamlines the service but also combats corruption by minimizing discretionary authority of civil servants and provides greater access to government information. Electronically recording complaints to police, an anti-corruption authority, IA and OIG units, and court cases will enable monitoring efforts to help ensure that appropriate action was taken and isolate deviations of conduct that could evidence corruption.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of civil society representatives trained on transparency rights and TIP-related corruption issues
- Number of civil society representatives trained to collect reliable, quantifiable data on TIP that can be shared with government and other external stakeholders
- Number of reforms to “sunshine”/freedom of information legislation, increasing access to public documents and meetings
- Number of members of the media trained on investigating TIP-related corruption issues
- Number of e-government applications implemented to increase transparency
- Number of whistleblower programs established/supported
- Number of witness protection programs established/supported that can report on the number of witnesses granted protection under the program

Measurement Approach: As with the incidence of trafficking, it is difficult to measure corruption directly. Measuring the impact on TIP effectuated by the *absence* of corruption is even more challenging. Broad indices published annually, particularly by Transparency International, reflect how perceptions of corruption have changed at the national level. An anti-corruption element of a C-TIP program will likely require a nuanced approach, though the Transparency International score can provide an important contextual indicator.

Sustainability: Although reforming public access laws can be an arduous process, once accomplished, it can be difficult to repeal those rights. As CSOs and journalists become accustomed to accessing public documents, attending meetings, and monitoring government performance, efforts by the government to circumscribe those rights would draw scrutiny from citizens and donors alike. Similarly, although automating processes can be expensive and time consuming, once the equipment and programs are in place and people are trained on their use, the resulting efficiencies typically offset the incremental costs of maintaining the equipment. Likewise, effective government control offices (OIGs and IA Units) can be justified by the cost-savings to the state attributed to reduced corruption.

Special Considerations: TIP is often a complex, sophisticated, and violent form of organized crime. Government complicity is common but can be limited to a few people at various junctures, often in exchange for modest services without a money trail. As such, it can be very challenging to link governmental actors and actions to a TIP scheme. Moreover, threats of violence from a

trafficking coalition, or of civil or criminal liability under draconian defamation laws, are strong deterrents for journalists, activists, and even prosecutors working to expose and prosecute public officials facilitating the crime. Furthermore, anti-corruption programming is a sensitive issue for many governments and addressing TIP too directly through anti-corruption efforts may risk eroding the political will necessary for complementary aspects of TIP programming.

Demand Reduction

IR 1.4: The demand for goods produced by trafficked persons or for services provided by trafficked persons is reduced

Issue: Increasingly, C-TIP programs are targeting the demand side of trafficking in order to reduce the profitability of the crime. Public education campaigns to reduce consumer demand for products in other contexts (e.g., diamonds, ivory) have proven somewhat effective in reducing criminal conduct. Similarly, curbing demand for products of trafficked labor in industries such as agriculture, hospitality, construction, food processing, garments, and commercial sex can reduce the incidence of trafficking. In countries where forced begging is prevalent, demand reduction campaigns may focus on addressing the “pity market” of persons who give money, not to buy a product but out of pity for an individual.

Possible Indicators at the IR Level include:

- Average prices for goods/services in targeted industry (Average price data would typically be obtained by mystery shoppers — individuals hired by an implementing partner to pose as potential patrons and negotiate pricing for a particular standard good or service. This approach can be used in both licit and illicit industries but should be governed by appropriate ethical guidelines).¹⁴
- Percent of surveyed potential clients/consumers/employers indicating they have changed behavior because of concerns about trafficking
- Percent of surveyed potential clients/consumers/employers indicating they are aware of trafficking issues in the targeted industry

Illustrative Activities

1.4.1: Inform prospective consumers of the prevalence of TIP in the production of certain goods by:

- Posting information at airports, hotels, information kiosks, travel agencies, convention centers, and tourist sites advising visitors of the prevalence of trafficked labor in the production of specific goods marketed to foreigners in particular countries, as identified by the Bureau of International Labor Affairs.¹⁵ Examples include handicrafts, carpets, pirated CDs, and counterfeit designer goods.
- Supporting broad public education campaigns informing consumers of the prevalence of trafficked labor in the production of goods marketed globally from countries identified by the Bureau of International Labor Affairs in specific product lines, such as garments, jewelry, and shoes.

¹⁴ Disaggregate price data by both labor and commercial sex industries.

¹⁵ For listing of goods in countries believed to be produced with trafficked labor, see:

<https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/reports/child-labor/list-of-goods>

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of public awareness campaigns about TIP completed
- Number of public awareness campaigns replicated by host country governments or NGOs without further USAID assistance
- Number of putative consumers reached with awareness messages
- Decrease in sales of specified goods in targeted sales markets

1.4.2: Inform prospective customers/clients of commercial sex workers of the correlations between commercial sex and trafficking through:

- Informational campaigns advising potential clients of the prevalence of trafficking survivors among commercial sex workers. As commercial sex tends to thrive where there are large populations of men away from their homes, campaigns can target popular tourist and business destinations, installations of military and peacekeeping forces, construction sites, and large sporting events. Accordingly, public information campaigns in conjunction with the hospitality industry, sport associations, security contractors and armed forces, can raise awareness. In addition to reducing demand, informational brochures can contribute to the identification and protection of survivors by including information on how to report suspected incidents.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of public awareness campaigns about TIP completed
- Number of public awareness campaigns replicated by host country governments or CSOs without further USAID assistance
- Number of consumers reached with awareness messages
- Number of victims/survivors identified through reports from clients/consumers

1.4.3: Employers proactively raise awareness, prohibit engagement, and promote reporting of suspected TIP activity in industries known to use forced and child labor through:

- Adoption and implementation of Codes of Conduct for sectors such as hospitality, entertainment, mining, manufacturing, agriculture, and the armed forces. The Codes of Conduct should require those entities to avoid all forms of TIP, provide specific information on fair labor standards and worker rights, and detail procedures for reporting abusive labor practices to law enforcement. Particularly among diplomatic Missions, military forces, and multinational corporations and the contractor community, Codes of Conduct should discourage or prohibit the purchase of goods and services affiliated with TIP.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of entities incorporating model C-TIP provisions in their Code of Conduct
- Number of reports of suspect TIP activity from entities with C-TIP provisions in their Code of Conduct

Measurement Approaches: Directly measuring the effectiveness of efforts to reduce demand for goods produced by trafficked persons is challenging. Measurement at the IR level can focus on

the supply side by attempting to look directly at sales trends through an examination of proxies correlated with sales, or on the demand side by collecting data from customers about their likelihood to purchase goods or patronize services. Supply side measures are inherently challenging because of the difficulty of disentangling other causes of changes in sales from the effect of USAID interventions. However, they may serve as an effective complement to demand-side measures.

Sustainability: Shaping domestic and global demand by exposing TIP in specific instances creates economic opportunities for manufacturers and service providers that adhere to fair labor standards. To capitalize on the shift in demand, there is a strong impetus for organizations to adopt anti-trafficking messages in their marketing strategies, ensuring consumers of the absence of TIP in their goods and services. Accordingly, donor-supported demand reduction activities that raise awareness of TIP will eventually be replaced with positive marketing within the private sector, as has been observed with environmental conservation (i.e. advertising use of recycled products and environmentally sustainable production methods), organic foods, and humane treatment of animals.

Protection

Development Objective 2: Survivor-centered services to provide protection and assistance to trafficked persons and to meet special needs of child survivors of trafficking are established and sustainable

The successful implementation of protection programs depends upon safely identifying and assisting trafficking survivors through services, such as shelter, security, health, counseling, legal and reintegration assistance. Identification protocols are often outlined in National Referral Mechanisms or similar standard operating protocols that detail how victims are identified and how they can be referred to services. In addition to being an important first step in providing services, these mechanisms can hold a wealth of qualitative information about how trafficking occurs and who is impacted.

Developing protection indicators can also provide valuable information on how well programs are addressing survivor needs around reintegration and safety/security issues. Although it may initially be counterintuitive, it is important to look for an increase in the number of survivors identified and assisted through protection programs. This indicator data alone does not mean there has been an increase in the incidence of trafficking, but rather can signal that protection efforts are becoming more effective. Conversely, a decrease in the number of survivors assisted, especially if it is a sudden decrease, can be a signal of issues in the identification and referral system.

Comprehensive services necessary to rehabilitation and restoration are best provided through partnerships uniting all relevant stakeholders acting on behalf of survivors. The five IRs under this objective focus on the identification of trafficked persons, assistance with return and repatriation for foreign survivors of trafficking, the special needs of child survivors, and the importance of law enforcement in the protection and assistance of trafficked persons.

When conducting evaluations of protection programs, it is critical that the full impact is understood, including unintended consequences to both survivors and the communities where they are placed. For example, due to social stigmas, some survivors will be ostracized by members of their own community if they are identified as having been trafficked. If those survivors are placed in shelters near their home communities, where they risk being identified, the unintended consequence of placing them in the shelter will be social isolation rather than reintegration. They may be at risk of being re-trafficked or engage in activities that could

jeopardize other survivors in the shelter. Therefore, it is highly recommended that evaluations of protection projects have at least one research question on unintended consequences.

Survivor Services

IR 2.1: System to proactively identify and refer survivors to specialized services is developed or strengthened.

Issue: In many situations, trafficked persons may be hesitant to self identify to authorities as trafficking victims. This may be due to a variety of factors, including fear of reprisal from traffickers, fear of being criminalized by authorities, or even a lack of awareness about the legal definition of trafficking and that they are a victim of this crime. A robust system to identify trafficked persons is one of the most important first steps in ensuring that survivors can access social, rehabilitation, and legal services. The processes in place to identify and refer trafficked persons may vary by country. In instances where movement has been involved in the trafficking situation, the authorities responsible for identification and referral may or may not be connected to the responsible authorities in the sending/receiving country, which can further complicate the step of identifying who needs to be referred to services. Finally, not all countries have the same capacity to identify trafficked persons; in some instances this may mean that a portion of irregular or other returning migrants who return to their home country are not properly identified as trafficking victims or provided with the appropriate services in the destination country. In these instances, origin countries may need to make a larger investment in identifying and assisting trafficked persons.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level include:

- Number of agreements, including a National Referral Mechanism, Standard Operating Procedures or Memoranda of Understanding that outline identification and referral processes
- Number of first responder or Responsible Authority stakeholders who are trained in the identification and referral processes
- Percentage increase in the number of trafficking survivors identified through these formal identification mechanisms
- Number of data management systems that can track and monitor cases identified

Illustrative Activities

2.1.1: Develop (or strengthen) and implement systematic procedures to guide first responders (e.g. police, border guards, immigration officials, medical staff and labor inspectors) in victim identification by:

- Developing (or strengthening) standard interview guidelines and procedures for first responders to facilitate the rapid and accurate identification of trafficked persons. The procedures should consist of uniform standards across all agencies, conforming to international norms and national standards on victim identification acknowledged by all relevant actors. Social services should not be contingent on cooperation with law enforcement or self-identification.
- Developing or strengthening mechanisms that allows for different responsibility authority agencies to collaborate on identification and referral. This may be codified

through a formal National Referral Mechanism, through standard operating procedures, or memoranda of understanding.

- Integrating TIP training into the formal training curricula for health care providers. Training could cover topics such as victim identification, guiding principles regarding provision of care to survivors, provision of information to support individual decision-making, handling of sensitive information, trauma-informed approaches, and consent-based notification to authorities (such as immigration services or police).
- Establishing and building capacity of a multi-disciplinary task force or other body, linking public and private resources to identify and protect survivors in accordance with an established identification system. The task force should be part of an NAP and/or be affiliated with the government coordinating mechanism (such as a national referral mechanism (NRM)).

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Development and implementation of standardized interview guidelines and procedures for first responders (Y/N)
- Number of mechanisms developed and implemented to enhance collaboration between first responders
- Percentage increase in trafficked persons identified by trained first responders, as compared to control group

2.1.2: Provide the skills and tools needed to enable first responders to carry out the identification process by:

- Training state and non-state actors most likely to encounter trafficked persons on proper victim identification and referral. These actors will vary depending on the patterns of where and how trafficking occurs within a given country.
- Develop a service provider directory which outlines the agencies involved in the identification and referral process, along with their points of contact so that they may easily be contacted by other first responders.
- Develop or strengthen the data collection platform that can record information on the number of cases identified and referrals made by different agencies. In some instances it may be appropriate for this system to also include sanitized information on trafficking cases so that authorities can develop a more representative understanding of vulnerability and trafficking trends.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of first responders, health care providers and non-state actors trained on identification and referral procedures
- Number of actions taken by multi-disciplinary task force (or qualitative review of task force actions)
- Number of platforms developed to improve collaboration and/or data collection.

IR 2.2: System of specialized comprehensive and non-discriminatory services for survivors established and maintained

Issue: Once identified and released from an exploitative situation, survivors face obstacles accessing essential services. Services should be accessible to all survivors, regardless of age, gender, and immigration status. Trafficked persons generally require housing, medical and psychological treatment, legal services, and economic support, including access to livelihood opportunities. However, eligibility for state-supported services often requires that the individual be formally identified as a crime victim and may also be conditioned on cooperation with law enforcement. Even where this is not the case, cultural stigma and fear make many survivors reluctant to identify themselves as crime victims. Services, moreover, are often limited to children or female survivors of sex trafficking. Finally, survivors without legal residency status may not be allowed to remain in the country to participate in possible criminal proceedings, thereby effectively denying them access to critical services.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level include:

- Number of TIP survivors assisted by USG programs
- Percent of identified trafficking survivors who receive two or more services from a suite of comprehensive services
- Percent of targeted services available to survivors
- Qualitative assessment of the scope of services provided, informed by survivor engagement and expertise
- Qualitative assessment of the services provided

Illustrative Activities

2.2.1: Support provision of basic services for survivors of trafficking through:

- Promoting liaisons and collaboration between government, labor, business, civil society, medical, legal, and cultural circles. In particular, establishing links between law enforcement, immigration and labor officials who identify trafficking cases and civil society organizations that provide care to trafficking survivors.
- Maintaining and publishing a current directory of resources available to trafficking survivors and first responders drawing on diverse networks, including civil society, media, cultural and religious leaders, hotlines, legal resources, organized labor, and private channels.
- Establishing a network of licensed safe shelters, equipped to provide appropriate medical, social, and psychological care to survivors in a safe environment. Shelters use a universal, mutually agreed upon case management system and database system.
- Providing basic services (appropriate medical, legal, social, and psychological care) in non-residential locations in multiple locations to male, female, and child survivors of all forms of trafficking. (Many TIP survivors may not want or need to enter shelters, but still need access to services.)
- Developing or strengthening job placement services for survivors. PPPs, tax incentives for businesses that employ survivors, social enterprises, and placement within public service can help on a long-term or short-term basis pending

resettlement or repatriation.] (Note: Activities that identify trafficked persons to employers and fellow employees may not be welcome by some TIP survivors).

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of shelters/safe houses/non-residential service providers established for TIP survivors
- Percent of identified trafficking survivors completing intake procedures at official shelters
- Number of identified trafficking survivors receiving psychological, counseling, legal or other services
- Number of health clinics and facilities which are able to provide care for, or refer for care, trafficking survivors and their children
- Number of identified survivors obtaining legal residency status (if relevant to context)
- Number of survivors receiving (and/or completing) vocational training
- Number of survivors retaining jobs in which they were placed for at least 60 days

2.2.2: Support access to justice for survivors of trafficking through:

- Training legal aid providers on forced labor and migration issues and the rights and needs of trafficking survivors, including rights on residency, restitution, participation in criminal proceedings, protective services, and repatriation.
- Supporting advocacy efforts to expand survivor protections, including effective restitution policies, residency status for undocumented workers, and witness protection.
- Supporting labor courts for exploited workers to contest abusive working conditions, including forced labor, through administrative proceedings and claims for restitution.
- Supporting legal residency status for survivors pending legal proceedings that allow access to employment and educational and vocational training.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of legal services providers trained on TIP issues
- Number of laws, regulations, and procedures adopted or modified to expand protection of survivors
- Number of labor courts receiving technical assistance

Measurement Approaches: While measuring service provision tends to be relatively straightforward, there remain challenges to obtaining a valid, unbiased measurement of the quality of services, since those clients unhappy with services tend to drop out. It is particularly important to note that survivors who refuse services may be significantly different in profile than those who stay for longer periods in shelters and receive more services or for those who receive services from non-residential locations over a longer period of time. The difference in profile is not predictable; those who disappear may be younger or older, from particular ethnic groups, more able to obtain employment and survive in the informal economy, or otherwise different from those

who remain behind. This means that data collected from survivors who remain in shelters or who are receiving services from non-residential locations are not representative of the entire target group; such data would tend to have a strong positive bias, rating services more highly since those dissatisfied with services are more likely to leave.

It may still be valuable to collect feedback directly from clients, such as through focus groups, since clients' perspectives are critical in refining and strengthening service delivery. However, such information would not be valid for use in monitoring and evaluation given inherent biases.

Sustainability: While survivor needs can be substantial, providing services is essential to both the *protection* and the *prosecution* aspects of combating trafficking in persons. Helping survivors obtain legal immigration status in the destination country can help keep them from facing further trauma in their country of origin. Practice has also shown that viable opportunities for TIP survivors in the business community exist, and the private sector can contribute significantly to providing assistance to survivors.

Special Considerations: Distrust of law enforcement, fear of reprisals from traffickers, and social stigma make some survivors unwilling to report exploitative actions to the police or other law enforcement. Even after trafficking rings have been broken up, ongoing fear and economic necessity may deter survivors from cooperating with prosecutors. Typically, undocumented workers are ineligible for legal employment during the course of legal proceedings. The availability of basic services in destination countries therefore not only helps protect trafficked persons but may also contribute significantly to the prosecution element of TIP programming.

Repatriation and Reintegration

IR 2.3: Voluntary repatriation and reintegration processes available to survivors of trafficking in line with international standards

Issue: Trafficking survivors may be most vulnerable immediately after removal from the trafficking situation or escape. Those who have been trafficked to a foreign country are often vulnerable to arrest and/or deportation back to their country of origin. Survivors of sex trafficking, in particular, may not be accepted back into their communities due to social stigmas. Many have neither the documentation nor the resources to return home and are in a *de facto* state of limbo. Absent repatriation and reintegration procedures complying with international standards, trafficking survivors are prone to further victimization and re-trafficking. Activities under this IR should aim to assist both survivors who are identified in the destination country, as well as survivors who were not properly identified before they returned to their country of origin.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level include:

- Percent of changes identified as needed to bring repatriation and reintegration procedures into compliance with international standards completed
- Qualitative assessment of degree to which repatriation and reintegration comply with international standards
- Percent of recently repatriated trafficking survivors surveyed indicating that adequate provisions had been made for their protection and privacy

Illustrative Activities

2.3.1: Work with appropriate government agencies to develop (or strengthen) and implement rights-based procedures in destination countries to ensure that survivors are not inappropriately deported to their country of origin by:

- Supporting legislative reform to criminal law statutes and other relevant legislation to incorporate the definition of TIP to ensure that trafficked persons are effectively identified and not deported as undocumented immigrants.
- Supporting adoption of legislative or regulatory provisions requiring officials and tribunals not to proceed with the deportation of a trafficked person while they are involved in criminal proceedings against alleged traffickers.
- Promoting adoption of repatriation measures to ensure that, when a survivor returns to their country of origin, provisions are made to ensure their protection, privacy, and safety.
- Supporting social marketing campaigns to disseminate information on the promulgation of or amendments to legislation and/or regulatory frameworks to all relevant parties, including law enforcement, court personnel (including judges and attorneys), and others.
- Partnering with immigration services in destination countries and organizations in countries of origin to support and utilize existing voluntary repatriation programs.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of laws altered to ensure appropriate definitions of “trafficked persons” in line with the Palermo Protocol are in place
- Number of cases where a survivor involved in legal proceedings against alleged trafficker is deported
- Number of survivors served by USG supported voluntary repatriation programs
- Number of social marketing campaigns informing relevant parties of legislative changes

2.3.2: Assist countries of origin and destination to mutually employ practices for safe and voluntary repatriation, reintegration, and reunification of trafficked persons through:

- Establishing domestic rules and regulations regarding responsibilities for repatriation, including training labor attachés in countries of destination on the needs of trafficked persons to ensure their safe repatriation. These rules and regulations should be reflected in the respective government’s NAP.
- Establish reunification procedures that enable survivors to be reunited with their families (such as the T visa model in the U.S).
- Engage survivors in the development of NRMs to provide a more effective process that meets the needs of trafficked persons

- Promoting partnerships with civil society, workers' and employers' organizations in both sending and receiving countries to assess the special repatriation and reintegration needs of trafficked persons and to target assistance effectively, including housing needs and opportunities to be financially independent.

Possible Activity Indicators include:

- Number of officials involved in repatriation who receive training on the needs of trafficked persons
- Number of civil society, workers' and employers' organizations in both sending and receiving countries involved in partnerships focused on repatriation and reintegration
- Number of survivors engaged in the development of services and referral mechanisms

2.3.3: Establish reintegration procedures in countries of origin to protect trafficked persons against further exploitation and re-trafficking by:

- Developing or strengthening the identification and referral procedures for trafficked persons in origin countries, particularly along border points. In some instances, destination countries may not have adequate procedures in place to identify trafficked persons before they are returned home. Survivors returning under these conditions are at high risk for further trauma or abuse in the origin country.
- Developing (or strengthening), in partnership with CSOs, survivors, and government agencies, long-term reintegration plans ensuring that trafficked persons returning to their country of origin receive assistance, security protection, and support necessary to ensure their well-being and to facilitate their social and economic reintegration.
- Developing (or strengthening) victim/witness protection protocols. Some trafficked persons may be returned by authorities to their community of origin, where the traffickers remain active, without a thorough security assessment to determine the viability of their return. In such instances, access to a comprehensive protection plan can reduce the likelihood of re-trafficking or further abuse.
- Developing (or strengthening) procedures for the safe reintegration of children to ensure safe living conditions, access to education, and the alleviation of risks for subsequent exploitation.
- Working with civil society to form support groups for trafficking survivors to foster mutual support in the return and reintegration process and to improve access to services.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Expert panel assessment of long-term reintegration plans
- Percent of targeted procedural improvements, related to the safe reintegration of child survivors of trafficking, that are adopted
- Number of repatriated survivors participating in support groups

2.3.4: Support local initiatives that reduce social and cultural stigmas associated with being a TIP survivor by:

- Developing partnerships with religious, tribal, and political leaders, and other influential personalities in the local community to raise awareness of the exploitative nature of human trafficking and the need to reintegrate trafficking survivors back into their communities where appropriate.
- Working with trade unions, business associations, civil society, and government agencies to develop (or strengthen) community education programs designed to decrease social stigmas associated with being a trafficking survivor.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Percent of respondents in public opinion survey who understand the crime and traumatic impact of trafficking
- Number of actions adopted by religious, tribal, and other community leaders to support the re-integration of survivors back into the community
- Number of survivors engaged in planning development of and/or supporting implementation of services

Measurement Approaches: Measuring the effectiveness of repatriation and reintegration procedures can include both quantitative and qualitative measures. Quantitative metrics (i.e., number of improved procedures implemented, percent of targeted procedural changes that are adopted) are helpful, particularly when complemented and contextualized by qualitative measures that assess how conducive the legal/procedural environment is to repatriation and reintegration.

When working on issues of repatriation, direct data collection methods can be effective. It may be possible to identify an appropriate sample of repatriated trafficking survivors from whom survey data can be collected. For instance, if survivors are repatriated in groups, questionnaires might be conducted while they are in transit or as they arrive back in their country of origin, allowing them to comment on their experiences with the repatriation process. The development of databases and case management systems used by CSOs may provide better opportunities to gather concrete evidence and reliable data.

Sustainability: Relying on employment abroad is an unstable course for national economies. Countries of origin need to have effective macro-level policies to address the root causes of migration that focus on poverty alleviation, employment generation and gender discrimination. Efforts to mitigate punitive deportation and to assist survivors of trafficking with successful reintegration in their home countries will become increasingly sustainable as sending and destination countries prioritize long-term rehabilitative care and the creation of viable employment opportunities.

Special Considerations: Cultural stigma complicates the potential for successful rehabilitation of trafficked persons. In destination countries, they may be viewed as undocumented immigrants taking jobs from the local population. However, returning home may not be a viable option for many trafficking survivors either. If they have been deported and/or convicted of a crime in the destination country, there may be consequences in their native countries as well. Socially, girls who have been subjected to sexual exploitation may be ostracized by their communities. Accordingly, activities facilitating repatriation processes must incorporate reasonable safeguards for the return of survivors or ensure that other alternatives exist.

Special Needs of Child Survivors of Trafficking

IR 2.4: The special needs of child survivors are addressed in a comprehensive victim assistance framework

Issue: Child-specific laws, policies, programs and interventions are necessary to address the particular physical, psychological, and psychosocial harm suffered by trafficked and exploited children. Law enforcement officers, social service providers, medical personnel, teachers, and other professionals likely to come into contact with trafficked children may lack sufficient training to recognize and assist child survivors of trafficking. Once identified, and in the absence of legal guardians, children may be held in immigration detention centers (often in the same facilities as adults) and lack specialized care. Courts often lack the resources or the awareness to provide child survivors of trafficking with an appointed guardian or to offer child friendly services for giving testimony.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level include:

- Percent of identified cases of child trafficking where a guardian/advocate is appointed
- Average number of services received by identified child survivors of trafficking in target area, disaggregated by type of service
- Percent of identified child survivors of trafficking housed in a designated safe accommodation
- School attendance rate of children designated at-risk of trafficking who are targeted by USG interventions
- Qualitative review of comprehensiveness of services available to child survivors of trafficking

Illustrative Activities

2.4.1: Laws and procedures to identify child victims of forced labor and trafficking are strengthened through:

- Working with civil society, government agencies, and legislators to bring national laws in compliance with international standards and definitions relating to forced child labor and trafficking, including the special needs of both girls and boys.
- Partnering with workers' organizations to identify exploited children in the workplace and/or vulnerable children in the community.
- Strengthening the capacity of border patrols and law enforcement officers to effectively screen unaccompanied minors, minors traveling with adults who are not their parents, and other characteristics of vulnerable children.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Percent of identified amendments that are required to bring national laws into compliance with international standards that are adopted/implemented
- Number of workplace mechanisms established that allow workers to report/advise on which members in their workplace or community are vulnerable to exploitation

- Number of individuals identified as vulnerable via workplace mechanisms who receive intervention services
- Number of immigration officers, border patrol agents, police officers, and labor inspectors trained to recognize potential child trafficking situations
- Percent of trained immigration officers, border patrol agents, police officers, and labor inspectors who receive a passing score on a follow-up test on victim identification 12 months after training

2.4.2: Facilities and services to effectively address the special needs of child survivors are established and/or enhanced by:

- Supporting the coordination of government ministries with responsibilities for children and families, labor, youth, employment, finance, social welfare, law enforcement, and education to identify at-risk children and implement policies and programs to prevent children from being trafficked, as well as protect child survivors from further harm.
- Strengthening the overall child protection system.
- Working with civil society and government agencies to support the appointment of guardians or advocates to assist children removed from a trafficking situation in accessing services. A guardian could be a trained CSO staff member, a social worker or some other specifically dedicated person. Best practice includes ensuring that the range of appropriate care and legal assistance is provided and that all decisions are in the best interests of the child.¹⁶
- Strengthening partnerships between law enforcement officials, civil society, and government agencies to ensure referral systems are in place and rapid access to services is available, including safe accommodation, food, medical care, counseling, legal accompaniment, education, and life skills training.
- Partnering with government agencies and civil society to establish (or improve) safe accommodation for children to avoid detention center placements and to develop (or strengthen) a durable long-term solution to ensure a child's safety.
- Empowering local communities, schools, and parent-teacher associations to support the ongoing education of child survivors of trafficking and to protect at-risk children by enhancing schools and offering out-of-school activities in cases where children are vulnerable to trafficking. Government subsidies for keeping children in school will help counter the short-term economic obstacles faced by some families. Special focus should be placed on keeping boys and girls in school.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of actions taken to improve services to prevent child trafficking and serve child survivors as a result of improved coordination of government agencies
- Child advocate program established (Y/N)
- Number of referrals made through USG-facilitated referral systems

¹⁶ Guidance Note on the entitlement of victims of trafficking, and persons at risk of being trafficked, to international protection, 2020, <https://rm.coe.int/guidance-note-on-the-entitlement-of-victims-of-trafficking-and-persons/16809ebf44>

- Percent of identified child survivors of trafficking receiving services as a result of a referral
- Number of safe accommodation beds for minors established
- Number of schools with significant enrollment of at-risk children that receive technical assistance to keep those children in school

2.4.3: The legal needs of child survivors during trials against traffickers are met by:

- Building the capacity of the judiciary to develop (or strengthen) and implement policies and procedures to protect and assist children in giving testimony, including the involvement of a guardian, use of video testimony, and other means to protect the child and reduce trauma.
- Working with the legal profession to develop (or strengthen) and provide training and workshops for lawyers and legal advocates on the special considerations and legal needs of child survivors of trafficking and all the available remedies to pursue.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of policies/procedures modified to meet the special needs of child witnesses in trafficking prosecutions
- Number of lawyers/legal professionals trained on the special considerations and legal needs of child survivors of trafficking, and all the available remedies to pursue

Measurement Approaches: If a significant number of child survivors of trafficking have been identified and referred for services, it is relatively straightforward to measure whether services customized for those special needs have been put in place and are being used. Measurement is more challenging where there are relatively few child survivors since low numbers make it difficult to discern whether there is systematic improvement.

Another measurement challenge relates to the difficulty of interpreting data on changes in the number of child trafficking cases identified. Police and border control officers who have received training are likely to identify more trafficking cases, but since the total number of undetected cases is unknown, one cannot know whether this is because the total incidence of child trafficking is increasing or because enforcement has improved. Similarly, if the number of cases identified decreases, it is difficult to determine if this is because incidence has dropped, enforcement has become more lax, or traffickers have adapted their methods in response to stronger law enforcement interventions. Accordingly, the total number of identified cases is a contextual indicator rather than an actual performance indicator.

Sustainability: Child labor is one of the most heinous forms of TIP, and pressure from the international community on governments to renounce it can be an effective means of sustaining measures to curb child trafficking. Moreover, countries have long-term social and economic incentives to protect their children. Survivors of child trafficking typically lack formal education and are often physically and psychologically scarred. Governmental subsidies for keeping children in school would help sustain families until the children are able to obtain legitimate long-term employment.

Special Considerations: The use of children in the commercial sex trade is prohibited under both the TVPA and the Palermo Protocol. Children who drop out of school and/or run away from home are often treated as juvenile delinquents and placed in correctional facilities. Cultural tolerance of domestic trafficking of children or forced labor within a family further complicates C-TIP efforts. Cultural factors also can hamper the care a child receives once removed from an exploitative situation. For example, returning the child to their family is not always the preferred solution, as a family member may have been complicit with the trafficking agent. Yet finding homes for at-risk children can be difficult, particularly in countries where child protective services are minimally developed.

Law Enforcement/Police Interaction

IR 2.5: Law enforcement entities enhance protection of trafficked persons

Issue: Law enforcement can play a vital role in protecting actual and possible victims of trafficking. Informed law enforcement officers (including immigration officials, border control agents, and labor inspectors) are often able to properly identify victims of trafficking and make referrals to services where they exist, avoiding unnecessary detention and deportation. Civil society may be well placed to increase awareness of law enforcement officers on issues involving the protection of exploited and trafficked persons in order to ensure that their rights to protection, confidentiality, legal representation, and recourse are upheld throughout the legal process.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level include:

- Percent of surveyed trafficking survivors rating their initial interactions with police as supportive
- Number of referrals by law enforcement of trafficking survivors to appropriate social services
- Qualitative review of law enforcement procedures and trainings related to protecting trafficked persons
- Percent of surveyed community members in targeted vulnerable communities who view law enforcement as trustworthy links to protection and assistance

Illustrative Activities

2.5.1: Engage law enforcement and local communities to facilitate victim/survivor identification and protection through:

- Increasing the perception of law enforcement entities as trustworthy links to protection and assistance within immigrant and other at-risk communities through outreach activities and the enforcement of anti-corruption measures among local police units.
- Introducing police assigned to work in communities of vulnerable populations.
- Promoting joint outreach programs (between law enforcement and local communities) targeting vulnerable populations, including events at orphanages, schools, and within migrant communities.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Percent of targeted at-risk communities with regular police patrols

- Number of joint outreach programs held that target populations who may be vulnerable

2.5.2: Develop and strengthen the capacity of law enforcement to assist trafficked persons in accessing social services by:

- Creating coordination and communication networks among law enforcement entities and CSOs that provide services to survivors of trafficking. Such networks will provide updated information to law enforcement on available services and points of contact.
- Institutionalizing the representation of law enforcement entities on national and local task forces and coordinating bodies that address issues relating to human trafficking.
- Increasing female representation in law enforcement.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Percent of targeted law enforcement personnel receiving briefings on available social services for trafficking survivors (This should be done for all law enforcement personnel as part of their basic training).
- Percent of targeted organizations participating in a majority of meetings involving the coordination networks.
- Frequency of updates on available services and points of contact provided by coordinating networks.
- Percent of targeted national and local task forces and coordinating bodies that have law enforcement organizations included as permanent members.

Measurement Approaches: Measurement of strengthened law enforcement capacity to enhance the protection of trafficked persons is relatively straightforward. Both quantitative and qualitative indicators can be used to assess whether the actions of law enforcement personnel are more supportive, as well as whether mechanisms have been institutionalized to continue to build that capacity such as training curricula, improved procedures, and specialized units and victim advocate personnel.

Sustainability: Law enforcement entities are often charged with the procedural task of identifying victims of trafficking, and the cost of training law enforcement to identify victims can be a key investment, as they may be the main or only point of intervention. Moreover, improved communications and processes among government agencies increase efficiency (although if there are very weak vital records systems in the country, establishing identification can be difficult).

Special Considerations: Lack of awareness or understanding of TIP have prevented law enforcement entities from identifying victims. In some cases, law enforcement has been complicit in the crime. Moreover, victims are often unwilling to turn to law enforcement, fearing they will either be reported to the trafficker or incarcerated for illegal migration or sex work. Accordingly, it is imperative that C-TIP activities both improve the image of law enforcement and increase the understanding of TIP among law enforcement officers and agencies.

Prosecution

Development Objective 3: Prosecution of traffickers strengthened, resulting in increased convictions and sentencing

Prosecution efforts include strengthening justice systems and enhancing witness protection programs before, during, and after court proceedings.¹⁷

Justice System

IR 3.1: Justice systems are capable of effectively, fairly and efficiently handling TIP cases

Issue: Trafficking offenses are difficult to prosecute, conviction rates are low in proportion to the scope of the problem, and criminal sentences are often not commensurate with the seriousness of the crime. Prosecution of these offenses presents difficult challenges: deficiencies in the definition of TIP; the frequent need to rely on evidence collected abroad; the potential for victims and witnesses to be traumatized, manipulated, and intimidated; the possibility of corruption among public officials; and the need for interpreters and translators. Advances in technology have created more opportunities to utilize remote testimony and technology to protect survivors from further trauma while improving the ability to effectively prosecute cases.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level include:

- Expert panel review of capacity of law enforcement agencies to investigate TIP cases and of the judicial system to handle them effectively, expeditiously, and fairly
- Number of law enforcement agencies trained in techniques to improve the investigation and prosecution of TIP cases
- Number of new laws or policies passed to improve efforts to investigate and prosecute TIP cases
- Percentage increase in legal aid mechanisms that promote access to justice for TIP survivors
- Adoption of victim/witness protection measures that increase trust in the judicial process

Illustrative Activities

3.1.1: Strengthen administrative procedures to promote efficient processing of TIP cases by:

- Establishing channels of communication between and among local, national, and international law enforcement agencies to ensure prompt and confidential exchange of information.
- Improving law enforcement access to public information, including business records and licensing data, as well as non-public information, as appropriate, in the course of

¹⁷ [The Rule of Law and Security Sector Governance Indicators Guide](#) supports USAID officers designing and managing ROL and SSR projects and activities by consolidating the vast number of indicators from various sources. The spreadsheet allows individuals to easily search for and see a summary of indicators by rule of law objectives and sub-categories.

an investigation.

- Facilitating information exchange between countries as well as among governmental entities within a country relating to TIP investigations and prosecutions.
- Providing for victim/witness advocates, and/or in the case of minors, a guardian ad litem, to ensure the child's rights are respected before and during the proceedings.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of administrative procedures improved/made more friendly to TIP survivors
- Number of victims/witnesses served by advocates or guardians ad litem as a result of USG assistance
- Percentage increase in the number of cases prosecuted compared to the number of cases

3.1.2: Develop (or strengthen) law enforcement's capacity to investigate TIP cases and support prosecution of traffickers through:

- Introducing updated investigation techniques, including the use of artificial intelligence-generated data sets, undercover agents, confidential informants, sting operations, wiretapping, forensic inspection of travel and identity documents, etc.
- Improving evidence-gathering skills, including how to interview and support witnesses (especially children and traumatized victims), how/where to access documentary evidence (including banking, registration, migration, criminal files, phone records, internet communication, etc.), and use of technology for both evidence gathering and witness protection
- Identifying victims of trafficking, and pursuing cases against traffickers rather than arresting victims for sex work or immigration violations.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of law enforcement personnel trained in improved investigative techniques with USG assistance
- Number of investigative techniques introduced as a result of assistance that are utilized in an investigation, disaggregated by whether the investigation results in arrest and prosecution

Measurement Approaches: Measuring improvements in the justice system's capacity to effectively, fairly, and efficiently handle TIP cases is relatively straightforward. Court records are typically available on arrests, prosecutions and convictions, and in many cases the interventions themselves are easily measurable.

There are two major challenges in measuring work in this area. The first is that relatively low numbers of arrests/prosecutions each year can delay the emergence of trends, particularly in smaller geographic areas. The second challenge is the absence of information about the extent and prevalence of trafficking. It is not clear if trafficking arrests are increasing or decreasing because enforcement is improving or because the amount and/or form of trafficking is changing; thus indicators need to be standardized in order to be properly understood (e.g., viewed as a percent of arrests leading to prosecution).

Despite these challenges, experimental or quasi-experimental designs that enable a true measure of impact may be possible in some circumstances. Different provinces or courts can be phased into programming and those in later waves can serve as control groups for those who receive earlier assistance. For instance, the percent of trafficking arrests that lead to prosecution/conviction can be measured at baseline across the full set of court jurisdictions included in the programming. Then, rates for those who receive assistance in years 1 and 2 of a program can be compared to those who are not scheduled to receive assistance until years 3 and 4. The challenge with such a design relates to concerns about overall small numbers not allowing enough statistical weight to ensure results are valid, particularly when looking at indicators relating to arrests and prosecutions.

Sustainability: International recognition of countries that prosecute TIP helps provide ongoing incentives. Since TIP cases are sometimes hard to identify or isolate in a court docket (as TIP can fall under different charges depending upon the legal framework) creating a specialized unit for prosecution of TIP crimes will help create a high profile means of tracking these efforts. A natural incentive structure for the specialized unit to deliver an acceptable rate of convictions will work to ensure that the investment in capacity building will yield ongoing efforts to prosecute TIP. As the demand for prosecution increases, the demand for better evidence gathering and investigation increases.

Special Considerations: In many regions, corruption, lack of training, and insufficient resources pervade law enforcement entities. Consequently, efforts to improve the public image and credibility of law enforcement will fail if such deficiencies are not addressed. Further, investigating and prosecuting TIP cases can be very dangerous for all involved, especially if traffickers are part of an organized crime syndicate. Training for more proactive investigation and prosecution should be accompanied by consideration for the safety of the individuals involved.

Support and Witness Protection Programs

IR 3.2: Safety and protection of trafficked persons institutionalized throughout legal proceedings

Issue: Testimony from the victim of a crime is often essential to a conviction but difficult to secure for many reasons. A victim may be traumatized; lack sufficient support systems, language skills, or knowledge of the legal process; or feel vulnerable physically, emotionally or financially. Based on their exposure to abuse, isolation, and criminal activities, victim testimony is often inconsistent and contradictory. They may have begun to identify with their abuser, a common coping mechanism under extreme circumstances. Victims may not trust the police or justice system to protect them or their families from reprisal attacks. Accordingly, to promote prosecution of TIP offenses, measures must be taken to build trust and ensure a safer and more secure environment for victims.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level include:

- Number of identified TIP survivors pursuing civil remedies/restitution
- Number of TIP survivors who participate in available victim/witness protection programs

Additional illustrative indicators include the following, but may require special caution when applied.

- Number of TIP survivors cooperating fully in providing police with information regarding TIP cases

- Number of TIP survivors testifying at trial
- Percent of TIP survivors who cooperated fully with police who subsequently testify at trial

Caution should be exercised when using the indicators listed above and evaluating the data obtained through these measurements. In many countries, TIP survivors are required to engage in legal proceedings against their traffickers in order to receive any form of support services that may be available to them. In these cases, the extent to which TIP survivors cooperate with police and testify at trial would not be indicative of whether TIP survivors felt their safety and protection were adequately institutionalized throughout the legal proceedings.

Illustrative Activities

3.2.1: Victim rights are protected in the course of legal proceedings by:

- Supporting public information campaigns to raise awareness of protection services available to TIP survivors engaged in legal proceedings.
- Making suitable housing alternatives available to survivors. Holding survivors in detention centers can cause additional trauma. Secure shelters that are equipped to meet the physical, psychological, medical and material needs of survivors during the investigation and trial make it feasible for them to more effectively support prosecution efforts. Some female trafficking victims may only want to interact with female staff, so it is important to have qualified and vetted female staff.
- Providing survivors and witnesses with advocates to protect against harassment or discrimination based on gender, ethnicity, religion, sexual orientation, or other factors.
- Promoting evidentiary procedures to safeguard trafficking survivors. Protecting witnesses against harassment and intimidation can include shield laws, limiting the extent to which a survivor's past sexual or employment history can be admitted. Under appropriate circumstances where essential rights of the criminal defendant are not prejudiced, evidentiary procedures can provide for video-link testimony, witness concealment, or testimony by written transcript. In rare circumstances, a witness's identity can be withheld and hearings closed where undue prejudice to the criminal defendant does not result.
- Incorporating special procedures for taking the testimony of minors balanced with a defendant's rights to confront witnesses.
- Ensuring security for protection of witnesses in the courtroom, if necessary.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of trafficking survivors participating in prosecutions who are housed in shelters
- Number of shelters/safe houses established for TIP survivors
- Number of modifications to laws, regulations, or procedures governing evidentiary procedures made to better support the ability of trafficking survivors to participate in prosecutions
- Qualitative assessment of degree to which evidentiary procedures support or

inhibit the ability of trafficking survivors to participate in prosecutions

- Level of awareness among TIP survivors of available legal and protection services
- Number of institutions located throughout the country providing services to victims

3.2.2: *Victims are provided for and protected after trial as feasible, through:*

- Developing witness protection programs. After testifying for the prosecution, witnesses and/or their families may be vulnerable to retaliation from affiliates of the traffickers, or the traffickers themselves if they are not convicted and incarcerated.
- Making legal assistance available to pursue civil remedies or collect entitlements resulting from criminal penalties. Civil cases for past wages, physical, and emotional damages are often available, though TIP survivors will likely need legal assistance to pursue these remedies. In addition, victims may require legal assistance to claim restitution from criminal penalties.
- Enforcing limitations on the disclosure of information concerning the new location of the survivor. In balancing the public interest in information against the risk and privacy rights of survivor witnesses, care should be taken following a criminal proceeding to avoid disclosing contact information or location of prosecution witnesses.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of trafficking survivors receiving witness protection
- Number of trafficking survivors receiving legal assistance to pursue civil remedies/ restitution

Measurement Approach: Measurement approaches for this IR will focus on monitoring changes in the way trafficking survivors are treated during legal proceedings. As with other elements of improving prosecution, it can be difficult to capture these changes because of the relatively low number of legal proceedings that occur in most jurisdictions, which makes it difficult to identify trends. Another challenge involves the difficulty of obtaining information from TIP survivors who stop participating in legal proceedings.

Care is needed in using measurement methods that require direct data collection from groups of survivors about their treatment during prosecution. Survivors who drop out (and are thus not reached in the survey) may be different in profile from those who persist through to the end of prosecution. Focus groups or data collection from survivors who complete the prosecution process can be tremendously helpful in identifying additional ways to strengthen the system, as can having shelter staff or victim advocates keep records of the reasons cited by survivors who drop out of prosecutions. Such methods are typically not quantifiable for use in measuring performance indicators, though they certainly can provide important contextual insight.

Sustainability: Witness protection activities are expensive and therefore not particularly sustainable. However, some of the most important protections can be incorporated as a matter of evidentiary procedure, including shield laws and alternatives to live testimony. Once adopted, these procedures require little investment to sustain. Moreover, many of the other protections are a matter of adopting a survivor-centered and trauma-informed approach. Finally, many countries have legal aid services, which could accommodate victim claims with only marginal incremental

costs, including the use of paralegals and providing specialized training for legal professionals.

Special Considerations: Providing care and security for trafficking survivors during the investigation and lead up to trial can drain limited resources. This could deter prosecutors from bringing all but the most serious TIP cases to trial. Moreover, protecting witnesses following the trial is prohibitively expensive for all but the wealthiest countries. Even where funding exists, relocation and creation of a new identity is often unsatisfying for the survivor.

Partnerships

Development Objective 4: A global movement dedicated to the eradication of TIP collectively and productively supported by governments, civil society, and the private sector

Partnerships can be useful in developing long-term C-TIP strategies and in monitoring and reporting on TIP. The four IRs under this development objective focus on coordinating national government, civil society, and private sector C-TIP efforts; improving the collection, analysis, and sharing of reliable data; and enhancing regional collaborative initiatives.

National Coordination

IR 4.1: NAP and/or NRM coherently coordinate C-TIP activities

Issue: Effectively countering TIP requires sustained commitment to prevent future occurrences, protect victims, and prosecute perpetrators. Growing the movement inside any specific country will necessarily involve coordinated action among ministries responsible for education, economic affairs, social services and health, as well as interior, foreign affairs, labor, immigration, and justice. Civil society, student groups, media, and the private sector also play critical roles in collaborating with national and local governments. A National Action Plan (NAP) should outline the role of all counter-trafficking actors who contribute to prevention, protection, and prosecution within a country. A National Referral Mechanism (NRM) will be more focused in scope, outlining responsible agencies for identifying and referring trafficked persons to services. Consequently, C-TIP activities are more sustainable and effective if conducted pursuant to a coherent NAP and NRM that is implemented and overseen by a competent and accountable coordinating mechanism. In some regions, the coordinating regional multilateral organization has regional-level guidance on the development of these mechanisms to ensure that cooperating countries within the regions develop compatible referral systems. When such guidance exists, it is useful to ensure that national coordination documents are aligned with this guidance.

Possible milestone indicators might include:

- National Action Plan, detailing all C-TIP efforts and the responsible stakeholders
- National Referral Mechanism completed, detailing which stakeholders are the responsible authorities for identifying and referring trafficked persons to services. In instances where it is impractical or infeasible to develop an NRM, the country has completed alternative memoranda of understanding or standard operating procedures to facilitate the identification and referral of trafficked persons.
- NAP and/or NRM officially adopted by the government.
- National coordinating body constituted
- Mechanism to exchange information among local and national bodies, as well as other diverse stakeholders established

Possible qualitative indicators might include

- Expert panel rating of quality of NAP and/or NRM
- Rating the effectiveness of national coordination against a checklist of observable best practices. (The checklist might include additional elements, such as whether civil society representatives are included; whether survivors are included; or whether services are trauma-informed.)

Illustrative Activities

4.1.1: Develop (or strengthen) a comprehensive NAP and/or NRM drawing on current data and reasonably conceived to combat TIP through sequenced and coordinated activities by relevant stakeholders premised on:

- An initial assessment of the nature and scope of the problem, as well as the enabling factors. The assessment will help define the vulnerable population, identify remedial actions, services and resources available, and justify budget allocations supporting recommended interventions.
- An implementation plan with firm timelines for specific activities and designating responsible entities. To measure impact, the implementation plan should include intermediate and long-term goals and designate the method for tracking progress towards those goals at regular intervals. It is important that the cost associated with implementation of the plan be estimated.
- Defined standard operating procedures that outline the roles and responsibilities across government and non-governmental entities to ensure comprehensive assistance and support to victims. Protocols may include identification, short-term assistance and protection, longer-term assistance and social inclusion, reintegration and return, and criminal and legal proceedings.
- A budget allocating reasonable funds for each activity and designating the source of those funds.
- Stakeholder input. Throughout the development (or strengthening) of the NAP and/or NRM, stakeholder consultations will promote good will and help ensure future collaboration from critical contributors within the government, civil society, media, and private sector.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Percentage of NAP progress milestones completed on schedule

4.1.2. Establish and/or build the capacity of a coordinating mechanism to review performance of an NRM or oversee implementation of the NAP by:

- Ensuring that the coordinating mechanism has adequate authority. Activities foreseen in the NAP and/or NRM will require cooperation and action of high-level officials. Consequently, the coordinating mechanism must be vested with sufficient authority to set priorities and compel action from the various governmental actors involved.
- Establishing accountable and open systems. Given that corruption is a key enabling factor in TIP, safeguards need to be incorporated to ensure that the coordinating mechanism is fully accountable. A dual reporting structure will help maintain objectivity and insulate against improper influences from senior officials.

An additional layer of scrutiny comes through systematically engaging stakeholders at open meetings where use of funds and status reports are presented for substantive input.

- Providing adequate resources and capacity. As the entity responsible for overseeing implementation of the NAP and/or NRM, the coordinating mechanism will need to be able to evaluate the impact of interventions and make policy recommendations in response to changing needs. Public relations and coalition building will be essential functions within the coordinating mechanism, including engaging survivors.
- Requiring that the coordinating mechanism solicit local input. The NAP should reflect the knowledge, experience, and promising practices of local actors and survivors involved in protection, prevention, and prosecution.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of national coordinating body meetings held per year
- Average attendance at meetings, disaggregated by type of group
- Number of national coordinating body members trained

4.1.3: Promote effective implementation of the NRM and/or NAP through:

- Diverse C-TIP stakeholders (e.g., CSOs, government entities, donors, survivors) meet regularly to coordinate efforts.
- A national C-TIP free hotline is established and staffed with trained social workers using a trauma-informed approach to prevent potential cases from occurring, refer victims to appropriate assistance, help investigate reports of TIP, and provide educational information.
- Empirical data collected and analyzed, providing sound guidance for C-TIP activities.
- SOPs followed, ensuring timely identification of survivors, and provision of appropriate trauma-informed services and protection.
- Reasonable budget allocations for C-TIP activities.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of stakeholder coordination meetings per year
- Number and quality of social workers trained to operate hotline
- Number of instances of successful follow up (e.g., survivor identification, services provided, TIP cases filed) to hotline tips
- Number of institutions using empirical data on TIP

Measurement Approach: In assessing progress on national coordination, there are two key questions at the IR level: 1) are the necessary actions occurring; and 2) is the quality of the process and product conducive to long-term collaboration and success? Simple milestone

indicators will typically suffice to measure much of the first, third and fourth indicators while qualitative indicators will typically be required to offer significant insight on the second.

Sustainability: International pressure provides incentives for countries to demonstrate political will to address TIP. The DOS Annual TIP Report assesses country compliance with the TVPA and carries the threat of restrictions on foreign assistance for countries not deemed to be making good faith efforts to meet the TVPA standards. Furthermore, the correlation between TIP and other forms of organized crime provides further incentive for countries to adhere to their NAP.

Special Considerations: C-TIP programming is inevitably politically sensitive for affected countries, some of which do not acknowledge the existence of the problem. Moreover, conclusions in the various international TIP reports are highly contentious and subject to criticisms of bias and inconsistent methodologies. Governments in denial and antagonized by the conclusions and threats in the international TIP reports are less likely to exert the political will necessary to establish NAPs or make coordinating mechanisms effective. The lack of funding provided to implement NAPs and/or NRMs often poses the greatest challenge to addressing TIP. Effective monitoring of the extent to which the NAP and the NRM is being implemented can also be hindered by the failure to designate a responsible government entity as the lead, lack of capacity to effectively monitor, and lack of political will. CSOs may be able, in some cases, to fill this gap to help improve the C-TIP response within a given country. While these efforts can play a critical role in expanding support to survivors, it is important to note that country tier rankings in the DOS TIP report are driven primarily by government ownership and support for actions outlined in each country's NAP.

Data Collection

IR 4.2: Reliable data on TIP activity is effectively collected and shared among interested governmental and non-governmental parties

Issue: C-TIP activities should be premised upon reliable and consistent data concerning the nature and scope of the problem in a specific locale and over time. Political sensitivities, however, often cause countries to deny or underestimate the extent of TIP within their borders. This problem is compounded by the absence of vital records and other source documents, especially for those most vulnerable to TIP (e.g., IDPs, impoverished children, refugees). The lack of common definitions of TIP used in data collection and coding, combined with the inherent difficulty of measuring illicit conduct, has resulted in substantial discrepancies within and across data systems. Maintaining the confidentiality of victims poses serious challenges, which can also restrict or block access to the data. Although challenging to create and maintain, cross-border databases can improve the tracking of survivors by following them across borders. Advancements in technology have allowed for the development of databases and case management systems that are being more widely used by CSOs. However, they are often reluctant to release that information or to work in concert with governments to provide data due to fear of repercussions.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level:

- Government produces TIP estimate annually
- Percent of international best practices in data collection implemented in government's annual approach to collecting TIP data¹⁸
- Percent of governmental and non-governmental organizations, including academic institutions, successfully utilizing databases

¹⁸ This indicator would be measured by annual review of the government's data collection process against a checklist of best practices developed at the beginning of the project.

- Effective case management systems institutionalized, tracking cases across the entire sequence of case measures

Illustrative Activities:

4.2.1: Build host country capacity to measure the incidence of TIP through:

- Birth registration programs. Unregistered children are at a higher risk of being trafficked, as it is harder to trace their disappearance. Moreover, in many countries, unregistered children cannot attend school. Information campaigns should inform parents of the importance of registering their children and the procedures for doing so. Those campaigns should also reinforce the message that registration leads to education, which can lead to economic advancement. Technical assistance can help governmental agencies streamline processes and reduce the cost of issuing vital documents. In some countries a complete restructuring and/or development of vital records may be required. Outreach programs to rural areas and assistance to streamline the process in hospitals and orphanages will make birth registration more accessible to vulnerable populations. Improved mechanisms for ensuring that vulnerable populations can easily and routinely obtain vital documents should be institutionalized. This process can be expensive in certain contexts. Special efforts may be needed to reach minority groups that may be unlikely to register the birth of their children.
- Improved vital document systems. Documentation of migrant workers, IDPs, refugees, and children is necessary to quantify the vulnerable population and provide a baseline that will help estimate “disappearances” that may be a result of TIP. It is critical to build trust between the public and government entities to ensure these systems are used and that data is trusted.
- Standardized data collection protocols. Instituting uniform standards governing the collection of qualitative and quantitative data on arrests, convictions, escapes, repatriation, and social and medical services related to TIP will promote the reliability, accuracy, and comparability of data among different agencies and over time. Disaggregation by gender, ethnicity, and age will increase the comparability of data across jurisdictions.
- Trained personnel. Government officials responsible for data collection — including law enforcement, medical and social service providers, court personnel, and immigration officials — must be trained on the protocol, standardizing when and how specific data is collected and to whom it is reported. Moreover, responsibility for data collection within the government will ideally be assumed by a central C-TIP coordinating mechanism.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of officials trained on the collection of TIP data
- Percent of targeted first responder agencies submitting data on schedule
- Percent of population for whom baseline data exists regarding education, residency, and employment
- Number of individuals obtaining vital documents, such as birth certificates, as a result of USG assistance
- Number of adults in IDP or refugee camps registered as a result of USG assistance

- Percent of target population covered by improved, institutionalized mechanisms for obtaining vital documents

4.2.2: Improving the integrity and the utility of TIP data through:

- Creation of an integrated database. The coordinating mechanism should include a data collection function that assimilates data from multiple sources, including law enforcement agencies and social service providers, local CSOs, and international experts. In many countries, multiple, non-interfaced databases are created and maintained by different entities. These diverse systems are often partial and competing. The challenge in such cases is establishing a single, integrated system. Models comparing data from different sources and tracking correlations will help analyze impact and refine future programming.
- Improved access to data. Agencies responsible for implementing the NAP and the NRM must have timely access to pertinent data to adapt their activities strategically. For example, service providers will be better equipped to carry out their roles if they have access to reliable data on the size of vulnerable populations and models estimating the likely percentage of trafficked persons. Similarly, border patrol agents with access to data on the vulnerable population will be better informed to recognize potential victims. Moreover, academic and research institutions should play an active role in the collection, verification, and analysis of TIP data.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- National TIP database established (Y/N)
- Percent of targeted information system improvements
- Number of analytic and/or statistical reports produced by national reporting agency
- Universities and/or research institutes publish timely reports on TIP dynamics and trends based on data analysis
- Universities and/or research institutes provide innovative approaches and methods to C-TIP community

4.2.3: Develop (or strengthen) formal mechanism to share TIP data with relevant entities within and across national borders through:

- Institutionalizing protocols that enable information to be shared with all concerned entities within and across national borders. The system to exchange information should enable process management of individual trafficking cases and cover the entire process, from victim identification, assistance and protection, participation and support during legal proceedings and legal redress, to return or resettlement of the trafficking victims in their destination, origin, or third country. The protocols should ensure the protection of personal data and privacy of the survivors.

Possible Activity Indicators

- Transnational data sharing protocols institutionalized (Y/N)
- Referral and case management data available to authorities on a transnational basis (Y/N)
- Percentage of survivors identified in other countries, for whom case files exist

Measurement Approach: Measuring the effectiveness of the government's measurement efforts at the IR level requires focusing on the existence and use of measurement mechanisms and on the quality of those mechanisms.

Sustainability: Incorporating standard protocols into the daily routines of government agencies helps ensure their sustainability. Preventing information sharing with the public and among agencies would result in dissatisfaction amongst civil society and policymakers. Finally, international C-TIP organizations such as the UNODC have emphasized the importance of reliable and consistent data collection. This effort may encourage countries to develop comprehensive data collection processes. Collaboration with researchers at a top university will reduce costs and build local capacity. A well-trained social scientist should be able to design an appropriate data system.

Special Considerations: Data collection systems confirming the extent of TIP within a country can lead to difficult results for national governments. Similarly, reporting agencies have incentives to report statistics that portray their institutions in a positive light, which may lead to inconsistent data (i.e., prosecutors want to report high convictions, border patrol agents want to report low incidence rates, police want a high correlation between arrests and conviction). Support from high-level governmental officials may help guard against reporting agencies inflating numbers.

There are a number of special considerations in building databases of this type. The need for multiple entities to have input must be balanced with the privacy and confidentiality needs of the victims. Data may need to be encoded or case numbers assigned to protect identities. Using a system of this sort requires sufficient training and vetting of people with access to the database to make sure that they will use the data correctly.

Regional Cooperation

IR 4.3: Legal and voluntary mechanisms supporting international, intergovernmental and regional collaboration and partnerships to combat TIP are adopted and utilized

Issue: The weak capacity of the State to enact and enforce laws often results in a culture of impunity and an unregulated labor market where TIP flourishes. Partnerships involving governments, international organizations, civil society, and the private sector can work to strengthen C-TIP efforts by amplifying messages and leveraging resources for an effective and sustainable response. The primary conventions, protocols, memoranda, joint actions, recommendations, and declarations serve as important frameworks for governments to define the types of interventions necessary given the country context.

Possible Performance Indicators at the IR level include:

- Number of relevant international and regional instruments ratified by target country
- Number of relevant international and regional instruments with strengthened utilization
- Number of TIP survivors repatriated through cross-border collaboration mechanisms
- Number of programs initiated by PPPs to strengthen compliance with labor standards and number of firms reached by those programs
- Value of investment from corporations or other donors involved in PPPs to efforts

to prevent trafficking and protect survivors

Illustrative Activities

4.3.1: Generate support for ratification of relevant international instruments through:

- Support to civil society, trade union, and business efforts to encourage legislators to ratify applicable international and regional instruments without reservations, including the Palermo Protocol and ILO Conventions on the elimination of forced labor and child labor. Efforts might include advocacy campaigns, roundtables, workshops, and media outreach.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of advocacy campaigns supporting ratification of relevant international and regional instruments with USG support
- Percent of supported advocacy campaigns followed by formal action toward ratification within 12 months of campaign

4.3.2: Build government capacity to implement international instruments, setting minimum standards and responsibilities through:

- Building the capacity of government ministries to comply with the reporting requirements of international and regional instruments, to administer national and local programs, and to actively respond to observations and recommendations from various monitoring reports.¹⁹
- Supporting compliance with international and regional instruments. This requires the establishment of procedures for victim identification, protection, repatriation, and return, as well as criminal proceedings involving trafficked persons. It includes knowledge sharing and capacity-building workshops to develop/strengthen such procedures and involves government officials, researchers, and other interested stakeholders.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of legislative impact analyses conducted with USG assistance
- Number of host country government officials trained on compliance with international treaties and regional agreements
- Number of host country agencies demonstrating improved compliance with international treaties and regional agreements
- Percent of international and regional instruments that include reporting requirements for which the target country government reports accurately and on time
- Number of monitoring reports to which the host country government responds effectively in accordance with international norms

¹⁹ Relevant monitoring reports include the DOS TIP Report, the DOL List of Goods Produced by Child Labor and Forced Labor, and recommendations from the ILO.

4.3.3: Support the development (or strengthening) of internal, cross-border, and regional networks to facilitate awareness raising, identification, care, repatriation and reintegration, cross-border investigations and services by:

- Building the capacity of international C-TIP networks to facilitate identification of victims, cross-border investigations, prosecutions, repatriation, and resettlement.
- Supporting international and domestic monitoring systems to increase pressure on governments to adhere to obligatory reporting requirements under relevant conventions and protocols in instances of trafficking involving transit to other countries.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of cross-border and regional C-TIP networks established
- Number of individuals involved in C-TIP networks trained on trafficking issues
- Number of compliance monitoring reports issued

Measurement Approach: Measuring the establishment of C-TIP infrastructure such as mechanisms supporting collaboration is relatively straightforward. Measuring the quality, utilization and efficacy of these mechanisms is less so.

Sustainability: In addition to international conventions, Member States can apply pressure to noncompliant neighboring states to adhere to the standards and meet reporting responsibilities. Accordingly, technical assistance to build domestic capacity to comply with reporting requirements and implement minimum standards will be continually reinforced under the scrutiny of the international community.

Special Considerations: Ratification is typically a lengthy process and requirements that are more stringent than domestic standards may deter some countries, as the process of reconciling domestic laws with the convention's standards can be politically demanding and time consuming. Nonetheless, countries can adopt C-TIP measures even as the ratification process is underway.

Public-Private Partnerships and Intragovernmental Partnerships

IR 4.4: Establishment of partnerships between both public and private entities and within the USG

Issue: C-TIP efforts require a variety of partners coming together around a common purpose. Partnerships between public and private entities allow for a wider audience to be reached in efforts to raise awareness about TIP. Moreover, partnerships within the USG can help integrate TIP throughout the planning processes of all agencies. USAID is committed to growing a global movement to raise awareness of TIP and consolidate C-TIP efforts of all stakeholders — including governments, civil society, the private sector, and consumers.

Possible performance indicators at the IR level include:

- Number of new stakeholders (public and private) actively pursuing C-TIP activities
- Public attitudes towards TIP reflect increased demand for action by governments

Illustrative Activities

4.4.1: Support PPPs and promote CSR initiatives to combat TIP by:

- Facilitating PPPs that emerge from a shared interest to prevent the use of child and forced labor in the supply chain of production. Given the reputational damage to companies not monitoring their supply chain for trafficked labor, PPPs have an incentive to proactively exercise greater vigilance to ensure that supply chains are free from forced labor.
- Facilitating multi-stakeholder initiatives developed through the coordination of civil society, trade unions, businesses, and governmental bodies that work to promote good business practices and comply with labor standards throughout their supply chains.
- Encouraging business alliances that promote codes of conduct within an industrial sector (e.g., agriculture, construction, textiles).
- Initiating and institutionalizing donor dialogues and coordination. USAID's investments should be leveraged by partnerships with public and private donors.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of PPPs facilitated with USG assistance that raise awareness among consumers about trafficking or monitor the use of trafficked labor in the supply chain
- Number of business alliances formed to reduce TIP within an industrial sector
- Number of donor dialogues resulting in C-TIP investments

4.4.2: USG collaboration strengthened internally to combat TIP by:

- Building upon existing collaboration between multiple members of the USG in C-TIP efforts to ensure USG commitment to C-TIP is visible, coordinated, and effective.

Possible Activity Indicators:

- Number of USG coordination meetings held per year
- Average attendance at meetings, disaggregated by types of group

Measurement Approach: In assessing progress on partnerships (both public-private and internal USG) there are two key questions of interest at the IR level: 1) are the necessary actions occurring and 2) is the quality of the process and product conducive to long-term collaboration and success? Simple milestone indicators will typically suffice to measure much of the first, while qualitative indicators will typically be required to offer significant insight on the second.

Sustainability: Incorporating standard protocols into the daily routines of officials in various government agencies helps ensure that the practice will be ongoing.

Special Considerations: USG is promoting a cohesive and concerted global movement against

TIP. This requires making C-TIP a priority throughout the USG and joining forces with other stakeholders. Growing this movement will require collaboration on bilateral, regional, and global bases as well as across all stakeholders. This poses challenges for donor organizations that typically work on bilateral bases to incorporate regional outlooks and complementary programming.